World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan— Historic Resources Report

January 2008

INTRODUCTION

This report on Historic Resources for the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan (Approved Plan) is prepared pursuant to the Programmatic Agreement among the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP), the New York State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO), and the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC), as a recipient of community development block grant assistance from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), which was signed on April 22, 2004, and stipulated that LMDC would provide semi-annual reports to SHPO and ACHP to summarize measures it has taken to comply with the terms of the Programmatic Agreement. This report covers both reporting periods in 2007.

The organization of this report generally follows the stipulations of the Programmatic Agreement. In addition meetings with the Consulting Parties and the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (Port Authority) are described in the final section.

1. PROJECT SITE DOCUMENTATION UNDER STIPULATIONS 1 AND 5

As previously reported the Port Authority completed the program of HABS/HAER documentation of the WTC Site in accordance with Stipulation 5 and submitted the documentation to the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) in August 2005. The Port Authority completed the Phase IB Archaeological Investigation for the East Bathtub and the report was accepted by SHPO on August 24, 2006.

2. ADHERENCE TO TREATMENT PLANS

LMDC continued working to create a Memorial to remember the victims of September 11, 2001, and February 26, 1993 and to record the events of September 11. Planning for the Memorial is discussed in more detail in the section which follows.

As previously reported, SHPO approved the Construction Protection Plan in connection with the demolition of 130 Liberty Street on August 18, 2006, and on October 30, 2006, SHPO found the WTC Memorial Construction Protection Plan to be appropriate provided that (1) the surviving slabs designated for preservation be retained and incorporated as appropriate; (2) if changes are necessary, SHPO shall be given the opportunity to comment; and (3) if excavation encounters unclassified obstructions, SHPO shall be notified and provided the opportunity to comment.

Other activities provided for in the Programmatic Agreement are to come. In coordination with the Port Authority, LMDC will provide for Phase IB investigations on the Southern Site and within the beds of Liberty, Washington, and Cedar Streets. Phase IB investigations will consist

of archaeological monitoring during excavation following a plan developed in consultation with SHPO and LPC. If necessary, any mitigation and retrieval activities will be accomplished before or during excavation for construction. As required by Stipulation 6 of the Programmatic Agreement, SHPO and the consulting parties will have the opportunity to comment on proposed plans for such further archaeological investigation.

The Port Authority developed Resource Protection Plans (RPP) to protect historic resources at the WTC Site and Construction Protection Plans (CPP) for historic resources within 90 feet of its Project Sites. The CPP and the RPP for WTC Transportation Hub Project (not part of the Approved Plan, but located within the World Trade Center Site) were completed in 2005 and the CPP and RPP for the WTC Vehicle Security Center (VSC, part of the Approved Plan and also funded by Federal Transit Administration) were posted for Consulting Party comment in July 2007. The RPPs specify requirements for inspecting and reporting procedures, construction monitoring and methods and materials to be used for any repairs. The CPPs cover the following historic resources: 90 West Street, 140 West Street, 90 Church Street, 30 Vesey Street, 26 Cortlandt Street, 125 Cedar Street, 114-118 Liberty Street, and St. Paul's Chapel and Graveyard. Vibration monitoring equipment has been installed by the WTC Transportation Hub project at key locations to provide data for compliance with vibration limits.

3. DESIGN OF THE MEMORIAL

As previously reported, LMDC is working with the Port Authority and the designers of the WTC Memorial and the Memorial Center Museum to preserve and provide for reasonable access to portions of the western slurry wall and to the truncated box beam column bases on the WTC Site. LMDC, the World Trade Center Memorial Foundation, and the Civic Alliance to Rebuild Downtown New York (Civic Alliance), held workshops on September 19 and October 11, 2005 on preliminary programming concepts for the Museum. LMDC also received comments on the design in the Consulting Parties meetings held on January 11, and April 5, 2006. Progress on the design was presented to the Consulting Parties in meetings on July 12 and September 29, 2006. There was a public comment period following each meeting and on October 13, 2006, a meeting was held to discuss comments received and to receive any additional comments.

At the January 11, 2007 Consulting Parties Meeting Mark Wagner of Davis Brody Bond Architects made a presentation with regard to the western slurry wall, indicating that based on constructability and visitor experience the preferred structural/design solution would be to provide the new liner wall west of the existing wall and to expose as much of the slurry wall inside the Museum bounds as possible. Irene Chang of LMDC indicated that the National September 11 Memorial & Museum (formerly, the World Trade Center Memorial Foundation) would make the decision as to how much of the wall would be exposed based on cost information and other Museum design considerations.

The September 5, 2007 Consulting Parties Meeting began with brief remarks about the slurry wall and the tridents. Karl Krebs of Davis Brody Bond Architects said a 60-foot section of the slurry wall was expected to be exposed for public viewing inside the Museum.

4. ARTIFACT REVIEW PROCESS

LMDC has previously provided the Consulting Parties an opportunity to comment on the artifacts to be displayed at the Memorial Center as required under Stipulation 4(b). Artifacts were considered in workshops held in September and October 2005.

In the January 2007 meeting some Consulting Parties mentioned the importance of locating a trident on the plaza, and in the September 2007 meeting Alice Greenwald stated that tridents would be on the right as one descends to the Memorial Hall.

5. CONSIDERATION OF IMPACTS TO ADDITIONAL REMNANTS OF THE WTC

LMDC and the Port Authority have worked to minimize impacts to certain additional remnants on the WTC Site, as required under Stipulation 5. The Port Authority removed elements from the former parking garage structure under 6 WTC to Hangar 17 with the potential of their being returned to the Memorial Museum. Also as previously reported, the Port Authority submitted HABS/HAER documentation of the WTC Site to SHPO in accordance with Stipulation 5 (August 2005).

As previously reported, alternative treatments of the Vesey Street stair remnant stair were the subject of meetings with the Consulting Parties on July 12, September 29, and October 13, 2006. LMDC and the Port Authority continued to work together on plans the Vesey Street stair remnant throughout 2007 holding meetings with the Consulting Parties and working closely with representatives of the Lower Manhattan Emergency Preservation Fund (LMEPF).

In January 11, 2007 Consulting Parties Meeting Irene Chang, Ed Narbutas of Silverstein Properties, Michael Wurzel of Foster + Partners, and Alice Greenwald of the Memorial Foundation made presentations regarding the Vesey Street Stairway. The proposed mitigation plan included: 1) black and white photographic documentation; 2) additional photographic and video documentation; 3) disassembly and storage of portions of the staircase off site during construction; 4) return and integration of portions of the staircase treads in its original footprint at new Tower 2, with six to nine treads in an exterior stair accessible to the public, the footprint demarcated with metal floor inserts, floor finish distinguished within the footprint, and interpretive signage installed in the immediate vicinity; and 5) exploration of whether remaining components could be incorporated into the Memorial quadrant of the WTC Site. Comments received at the meeting reflected divergent viewpoints. Robert Sillman (consultant to the LMEPF) questioned the Port Authority's estimated cost for moving the stair, others wanted the stair preserved intact and possibly placed on the plaza, others did not want the stair remnant kept above ground, others praised the Museum location for the stair remnant, and others said it would be more important to have a trident on the plaza than to have the stair remnant there. The record remained open for additional comments to be sent in.

After reviewing the comments on the January 2007 proposed mitigation plan, LMDC working in conjunction with the National September 11 Memorial & Museum (formerly, the World Trade Center Memorial Foundation) developed an alternative proposal which provided for permanent display of the Vesey Street Stair Remnant in a prominent location within the Memorial Museum. As described in the notification for the September 5, 2007 Consulting Parties meeting, this proposal was designed to retain significantly more of the remnant, including the full run of stairs intact, and allow for more effective interpretation of its significance.

At the September 5 Consulting Parties meeting the Proposed Final Mitigation Plan for the Vesey Street Stair was presented as follows: 1) extract intact and move the entire run of stairs and the "connector plate" at the top of the stairs; 2) store these elements at Hangar 17; 3) return and install intact the full run of stairs and a portion of the "connector plate" in the

Museum in a central location between the grand staircase and escalator system leading down to bedrock, in a manner that ensures that visitors will be able to view the staircase as they descend down the grand staircase or escalator; 4) provide for meaningful incorporation of the story and significance of the staircase within the "primary narrative" of the Memorial; 5) return a portion of the "connector plate" to the at-grade Memorial Plaza near the "Surviving Tree" along with interpretive signage; and 6) maintain archival black and white photographic documentation of the staircase and additional photographic and video documentation of the staircase. Consulting Parties offered comments many of which were positive and supportive. The comment period remained open until September 21.

On October 31, 2007, after consideration of comments received in September, LMDC announced the Final Mitigation Plan for Adverse Effects on the Vesey Street Stair Remnant Pursuant to the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan Programmatic Agreement. It differed from the Proposed Final Mitigation Plan in that it 1) recognized that the Port Authority had identified potential storage locations for the stair on the World Trade Center Site that might be feasible, 2) indicated that portions of the "connector plate" would be installed in the plaza in an area dedicated to survivors if feasible, and 3) clarified the roles of the Port Authority and Museum in carrying out the mitigation plan.

The Final Plan as posted on LMDC's web site is as follows:

LMDC shall facilitate and ensure that the Port Authority and Museum will cooperate and engage appropriate consultants to: 1) extract intact and move the entire run of stairs and the "connector plate" at the top of the stairs; 2) store these elements on or in the immediate vicinity of the WTC Site until such time as they can be installed in their permanent locations, if such storage is feasible, and if such storage of any of these elements is not feasible, store those elements at Hangar 17; 3) return and install intact the full run of stairs and a portion of the "connector plate" in the Museum in a central location between the grand staircase and escalator system leading down to bedrock, in a manner that ensures that visitors will be able to view the staircase as they descend down the grand staircase or escalator; 4) provide for meaningful incorporation of the story and significance of the staircase, and, if feasible, including part of the "connector plate" to the at-grade Memorial Plaza along with interpretive signage in an area dedicated to survivors in proximity to the "Surviving Tree," if feasible; and 6) maintain archival black and white photographic documentation of the staircase.

The Port Authority and the Museum continued to work with SHPO and LMEPF to develop the methodology for the intact move of the Vesey Street stair remnant through the end of 2007.

6. TREATMENT OF UNANTICIPATED ADVERSE EFFECTS OR UNKNOWN HISTORIC RESOURCES OR PROPERTIES

If during project implementation, LMDC, the Port Authority, or any of their contractors discovers or identifies any historic resources with in the Project Site that may be adversely affected or should there be any unexpected adverse effects on any historic resources on or immediately adjacent to the Project Site, LMDC or the Port Authority shall promptly notify SHPO and ACHP and develop a treatment or mitigation plan in accordance with Stipulation 7.

No such resources were discovered or identified in 2007. However, an unanticipated adverse effect did occur. In the fall of 2007 a combined sanitary/storm sewer was being relocated from Liberty Street to Cedar Street adjacent to the north side of 90 West Street as part of the Port Authority's work on the VSC. On November 26, 2007 the basement was of 90 West Street was flooded and damage to the electrical and mechanical equipment was stated to have made the building uninhabitable. Port Authority WTC staff provided assistance to the building owner to restore these systems in order to expedite the return of tenants. The Port Authority rented a portable generator plant and coordinated with Con Edison to provide temporary cables and provided expertise in helping the owner direct its electrical and mechanical contractors. Tenants began returning to the building on December 4, 2007. All remedial work was completed before the end of 2007.

7. ON-GOING MEETINGS AND OTHER COMMUNICATIONS WITH CONSULTING PARTIES 2007

MEETINGS WITH CONSULTING PARTIES – JANUARY 11 AND SEPTEMBER 5, 2007

The content of these meetings is described above in Sections 3-5.

LMDC NOTIFICATIONS TO CONSULTING PARTIES

August 22, 2007 notification of September 5, 2007 meeting of Consulting Parties.

PORT AUTHORITY SECTION 106 POSTING

On February 7, 2007 the Port Authority notified all Section 106 Consulting Parties of the availability of its report on the Vesey Street Stair Remnant on its web site.

In July the Port Authority posted its CPP for the Vehicle Security Center (VSC) for comment. The CPP was prepared to protect specific historic properties from VSC project-generated vibrations.

In the third quarter of 2007 the Port Authority posted its semi-annual Section 106 report for the WTC Transportation Projects.

∗