



**LMDC ALL ADVISORY COUNCIL MEETING ON  
TRANSPORTATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE  
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 20, 2003  
6:30-8:30PM  
225 PARK AVENUE SOUTH**

---

Tara Snow, Vice President of Government Relations and Community Affairs, for the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) opened the meeting by welcoming the Advisory Council members in attendance. Ms. Snow explained the purpose of the meeting was to explain the current thinking regarding transportation and infrastructure plans at the World Trade Center site and to listen to the Council Members' comments on this important subject. With welcoming remarks completed, the program was turned over to Alex Garvin, Vice President for Planning, Design and Development for the LMDC to begin his presentation on transportation and infrastructure, including pre-September 11<sup>th</sup> infrastructure and the existing infrastructure challenges at the World Trade Center site.

Mr. Garvin provided an overview of what existed at the World Trade Center site prior to September 11, 2001 and also discussed future transportation and infrastructure needs that were included in the program for the Innovative Design Study to support the memorial and the commercial office towers. After Mr. Garvin's presentation, Tony Cracchiolo of the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (PANYNJ) provided the group with a more detailed presentation of transportation, including the temporary PATH station, the permanent PATH station, and other transportation issues including a bus facility for tourist buses visiting the memorial. After the presentations, Advisory Council members were invited to share their comments and questions with LMDC and PANYNJ representatives.

An Advisory Council member voiced concern that building underground retail would threaten the livelihood of aboveground businesses. In addition, the member expressed the opinion that the transportation and infrastructure designs were too modern and were not compatible with the historic image of Lower Manhattan.

A member of the Restaurants, Retailers, and Small Businesses Advisory Council stated that when he advertised for 50 openings, he received thousands of resumes, indicating to him that people need employment. The businesses downtown need the tourist traffic to help their businesses, and he does not believe that underground retail will hurt other neighborhood businesses.

A Council member also expressed a concern of many residents in the area of wanting to ensure their neighborhoods did not become active bus routes or places for loading and unloading tourists coming to visit the site. She requested designers build the memorial in the context of a living community.

In support, another Council member representing the residential community expressed the need to support and maintain vitality downtown. She went on to say that they have tried for decades to find a solution to the high number of tourist and commuter buses that come to Lower Manhattan, which has only increased since 9/11. She ended by stating there is no other option but to build a bus garage at the World Trade Center site.

Some Advisory Council Members expressed support for preserving the footprints of the North and South Towers and the Marriott. One Council member inquired about the large parking lot located west of the site and asked whether a parking garage could be built below this lot.

One Advisory Council member stated that there were some very positive elements in the presentation from the perspective of mass transit riders. He also mentioned that it would be helpful to have the MTA involved in these meetings at some point. As a final thought he suggested looking at off-site locations for bus parking that are near ferry and PATH services, perhaps in Brooklyn or New Jersey.

Another Council member asked if the buses could be located at the other end of the PATH lines, believing this would solve the problem of bus parking and would also be beneficial to the PATH system. The member also inquired about building a parallel system to move goods below ground in addition to people.

A representative from Speaker Silver's office stated that the parking lot mentioned earlier in the meeting is slated to be part of the Hudson River Trust. She emphasized that buses have been a problem in the community for years, and that it would be very difficult for members of the community to have buses idling on the narrow streets of Lower Manhattan.

Another Advisory Council member asked if the Fulton Fish Market area could be used for bus staging. She inquired as to whether or not this was part of the plans, either there or somewhere else on the East side. Mr. Garvin pointed out that there has been demand from the East side community to move the existing buses away from the area underneath the FDR Drive. Mr. Garvin addressed this point by acknowledging the difficult challenge it has been to find space for the large number of buses projected off-site.

A Council member asked for clarification on the planned transportation hub and stressed the importance of east-west connections to and from the 4,5,6 and 3 lines. Mr. Cracchiolo explained the MTA's plans for creating a hub on Fulton and Broadway that would connect these lines to the proposed transportation concourse. The connection from the proposed concourse would continue to the east under Dey Street.



Another Advisory Council member recommended family members clarify what they consider sacred ground, and also made the point that the memorial does not have to be tall to be powerful. He used the Vietnam memorial as an example of this.

In response, an Advisory Council member mentioned that the concept of sacred ground could be reflected symbolically. He also pointed out that there are actually three, not two, very important groups to consider: the families, the residents, and the businesses. The businesses are also very important because they provide for and sustain the residential community.

A representative from Councilmember Gerson's office read a statement, which emphasized that creating adequate bus parking facilities at the World Trade Center site - while respecting the footprints of the former towers - is essential.

A member of the Families Advisory Council questioned whether all options have been explored for the bus facility. The agencies need to look at other places such as Battery Park City, creating something on the Hudson River, etc. He emphasized the significance of the bathtub area in terms of the remains that were found there.

An Advisory Council member asked the PANYNJ to clarify when the PATH system would begin taking Metrocard, and whether or not the PANYNJ undertook additional work, such as modernizing signals and other improvements, while they repaired the damage to the tracks and tunnel post-September 11<sup>th</sup>. Mr. Cracchiolo explained some of the improvement projects that were undertaken as part of the reconstruction and indicated that research was underway on the creation of a universal card that would be accepted by both the MTA and PATH trains.

Another Council member, representing Community Board 1, stated that many of those who live downtown also work downtown and lost loved ones and friends in the attacks. He emphasized that the proposed transportation hub and restoration of the PATH is critical to the livelihood of the neighborhood.

Another Advisory Council member stressed the importance of opening Park Row when discussing overall traffic and transportation issues.

A member of the Families Advisory Council expressed appreciation for the openness of the participants, as debate is part of the process. He stated that the families do not want the loss of their loved ones to stop the revitalization of Lower Manhattan and emphasized to the need to find a balance between the need for the bus parking facility and the need to remember those who were lost.

The final comment was made by a member of the Families Advisory Council who stressed the importance of this sacred ground.

Tara Snow, Vice President for Government Relations and Community Affairs at the LMDC then thanked the participants for attending and the meeting was adjourned.