

**LOWER MANHATTAN DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION**  
**Amended Partial Action Plan 4**  
**for**  
**Short-Term Capital Projects, Long-Term Planning, and**  
**Supplemental Funds for Business Recovery**

All Partial Action Plan 4 funds as allocated to the activities identified below have been spent.  
**Partial Action Plan 4 is closed.**

**Overview**

The Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) has prepared this Partial Action Plan with regards to the \$2 billion federal appropriation for the World Trade Center disaster recovery and rebuilding efforts administered by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). LMDC has received additional funding through a \$783 million federal appropriation to HUD for damaged properties and businesses (including the restoration of utility infrastructure) as well as economic revitalization related to the terrorist attacks at the World Trade Center (WTC) on September 11, 2001. Other action plans detail the expenditure of the other funds from the \$2.783 billion appropriation and are viewable on the LMDC website at <http://www.renewnyc.com/FundingInitiatives/PartialActionPlans>.

<b>Partial Action Plan Activities</b>	<b>(\$) Original Allocation 08/2003</b>	<b>(\$) As Amended 06/2004</b>	<b>(\$) As Amended 02/2006</b>	<b>(\$) As Amended 12/2006</b>	<b>(\$) As Amended 8/2010 and 12/2013</b>	<b>(\$) As Amended 03/2018</b>
<b>Short Term Capital Projects</b>						
Downtown Alliance Streetscape	4,000,000	4,000,000	4,000,000	4,000,000	4,000,000	4,000,000
NY Stock Exchange Area Improvements	10,000,000	10,160,000	10,160,000	10,160,000	10,255,000	10,255,000
Neighborhood Parks & Open Spaces	26,149,189	27,481,689	27,481,689	27,481,689	27,481,689	27,481,689
Hudson River Park Improvements	2,600,000	2,600,000	2,600,000	2,600,000	2,600,000	2,600,000
Millennium High School	3,000,000	3,007,500	3,007,500	0	0	0
West Street Pedestrian Connections	21,155,811	21,155,811	22,955,811	22,955,811	22,955,811	22,361,534
Damaged Building Beautification	1,500,000	0	0	0	0	0
Communications Outreach Campaign	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000	1,000,000
<b>Subtotal Short Term Capital Projects</b>	<b>69,405,000</b>	<b>69,405,000</b>	<b>71,205,000</b>	<b>68,197,500</b>	<b>68,292,500</b>	<b>67,698,223</b>
<b>Long Term Planning</b>	<b>13,894,848</b>	<b>13,894,848</b>	<b>12,094,848</b>	<b>9,356,848</b>	<b>9,841,848</b>	<b>9,530,727</b>
<b>WTC Business Recover Grant</b>	<b>74,500,000</b>	<b>74,500,000</b>	<b>74,500,000</b>	<b>68,946,000</b>	<b>68,946,000</b>	<b>68,728,643</b>
<b>Reallocation of Employment Training</b>	<b>(9,500,000)</b>	<b>(9,500,000)</b>	<b>(9,500,000)</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
<b>Planning and Administration</b>	<b>7,805,255</b>	<b>7,805,255</b>	<b>7,805,255</b>	<b>7,805,255</b>	<b>7,805,255</b>	<b>7,805,255</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>156,105,103</b>	<b>156,105,103</b>	<b>156,105,103</b>	<b>154,305,603</b>	<b>154,885,603</b>	<b>153,762,848</b>

The original Partial Action Plan 4 was approved during the summer of 2003 and detailed the expenditure of \$156,105,103 of the \$2.78 billion for the activities listed above. The plan was then amended six times. The first amendment, made in June 2004, eliminated the Damaged Building Beautification activity and reallocated these funds to Parks and Open Spaces to provide for the rehabilitation of Louise Nevelson Plaza and provided additional funds for NY Stock Exchange Area Improvements and Millennium High School. The second amendment, made in February 2006, reallocated funds from Long Term Planning to West Street Pedestrian Connections. The third amendment, made in December 2006, reduced the funding allocated to Long-Term Planning and the WTC Business Recovery Grant, and eliminated HUD funding for Millennium High School. The third amendment also removed references to the Reallocation of Employment Training Assistance Funds, this program and the amendment which reduced funding are described in Partial Action Plan 1. The fourth and fifth amendments, made in August 2010 and December 2013, increased funding for NY Stock Exchange Area Improvements and Long-Term Planning, and expanded the scope of activities funded as part of West Street Pedestrian Connections and Long Term Planning. The sixth amendment, made in March 2018, transferred the residual balance from the completed Business Recovery Grant and a portion of the inactive West Street Pedestrian Connections allocation to the Performing Arts Center activity in Partial Action Plan 11. This amendment also

transferred the remaining balance in the West Street Pedestrian Connections activity to the West Thames Street Pedestrian Bridge activity and the unexpended balance from the Long Term Planning activity to the Planning and Administration activity in the Final Action Plan, enabling the closing of this Action Plan 4.

Any change greater than 5% in the funding committed to a certain activity, the addition or deletion of any activity, or change in the designated beneficiaries of an activity constitutes a substantial amendment and such amendment will be available for public review and approval by HUD. Except that with respect to the individual short-term capital projects, any increase greater than 20% in the funding committed to a specific short-term capital project, the addition or deletion of any project, or change in the designated beneficiaries of a project constitutes a substantial amendment and such amendment will be available for public review and approval by HUD.

### **LMDC Funding Allocation Plan**

On June 16, 2005, the LMDC Board of Directors approved a Funding Allocation Plan for the remaining CDBG funds, consistent with Governor George E. Pataki and Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg's proposed Allocation Plan, announced on May 25, 2005. The Funding Allocation Plan outlines categories of funding and specific projects, and is available for viewing on the LMDC website at [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com). Subsequent Partial Action Plans detail the projected expenditure of the remaining CDBG funds that are available from the \$2.78 billion grant, consistent with the Funding Allocation Plan referenced above, and were subject to a public comment period with later submission to HUD. In 2006, LMDC issued a Final Action Plan regarding what was then the remaining unallocated portion of the \$2 billion federal appropriation, which has since been amended to reflect subsequent developments.

This amended Partial Action Plan 4 allocated \$153,762,848 for Short-Term Capital Projects, Long-Term Planning, and Supplemental Funds for Business Recovery. The Short-Term Capital Projects provided relief to Lower Manhattan residents, businesses, workers, and visitors by improving accessibility in and around Lower Manhattan and enhancing the quality-of-life in Lower Manhattan, making it a more attractive place to live, work, and visit. The Long-Term Planning program was the first step towards realizing the Governor's and the Mayor's visions for Lower Manhattan focusing on airport access, links to Long Island, major boulevards such as West Street and Water Street, and underutilized resources such as the East River Waterfront. It also provided for coordination of HUD funded Lower Manhattan projects planning efforts in Chinatown. The WTC Business Recovery Grant program provided much needed additional funding for the Business Recovery Grant program that was initiated by the Empire State Development Corporation.

### **National Objective**

LMDC is a subsidiary of the New York State Urban Development Corporation d/b/a Empire State Development (ESD) created in December 2001 to oversee the rebuilding and revitalization of Lower Manhattan. The activities contained in this Partial Action Plan were designed to meet community and development needs resulting from the September 11<sup>th</sup> WTC disaster. These activities had particular urgency because LMDC had determined that existing conditions posed a serious and immediate threat to the health or welfare of The City of New York and the individual residents of the City and other financial resources were not available to meet such needs. These activities provided assistance for properties and businesses damaged by, and for economic revitalization related to, the September 11, 2001 terrorist attacks on New York City. The geographic areas of focus of this and future partial action plans are located in Manhattan, on or south of Houston Street. Projects included in this Partial Action Plan also met the national objective of benefiting low and moderate income persons and communities.

### **Public Comment to the Partial Action Plan and Amendments**

The original Partial Action Plan 4 as well as the first, second, and third amendments were made available to the public for comment. LMDC placed notices of the public comment period in English, Spanish, and

Chinese daily newspapers and in weekly community newspapers serving Lower Manhattan. The text of the amendments were made available on LMDC's website ([www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com)) and copies of Partial Action Plan 4 with the proposed amendments in English, Spanish, and Chinese were mailed or delivered to more than 90 community, residential, civic and cultural organizations throughout Lower Manhattan, including Community Boards 1, 2, and 3, Manhattan, several tenants' associations and public libraries.

Partial Action Plan 4 and its amendments were made available for public comment as follows:

Original Plan	May 28, 2003 to June 12, 2003
First Amendment	July 12, 2004 to July 26, 2004
Second Amendment	September 27, 2005 to October 26, 2005
Third Amendment	September 29, 2006 to October 30, 2006

Public comments received and LMDC responses are included in Section IV below.

The fourth amendment made in August 2010, the fifth amendment made in December 2013, and the sixth amendment made in March 2018 were non-substantial amendments and were not released for public comment.

### **Public Participation to Date**

LMDC has solicited and received an unprecedented amount of public comment from all over the world regarding the rebuilding of the WTC Site, the creation of a permanent memorial, and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. Since its inception LMDC had developed its action plans based on all information available to it including specific input gathered by LMDC through the channels that it created, many of which have focused on the redevelopment of the WTC Site, the Memorial, and broader issues such as transportation, cultural and civic issues, and economic development in the aftermath of September 11th.

LMDC created Advisory Councils representing a broad spectrum of groups affected by the WTC attacks – including victims' families, business owners, arts and cultural institutions, and downtown residents – and has consulted extensively with them on issues of concern to their respective constituencies. LMDC also conducted public meetings that provided an avenue for the expression of thoughts and concerns about the rebuilding efforts and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan.

Other LMDC outreach initiatives, such as mailings to city, state, and federal elected officials and civic and community organizations, participation in Community Board meetings, and regular meetings with community groups, civic organizations, and public officials, ensure that the opinions of those impacted are taken into account. In the summer of 2003, LMDC conducted a series of outreach workshops in the communities of Lower Manhattan, at which participants described priorities for their communities and proposed projects to address those priorities.

LMDC has also sponsored several public exhibits that provided visitors with information and the opportunity to submit written comments on the revitalization efforts. LMDC received nearly 10,000 comments at the exhibits.

On April 13, 2005, the LMDC issued a Draft Funding Allocation Framework, which articulated draft priorities, objectives, and principles with respect to the allocation of the remaining CDBG funds. The LMDC held a public forum on the draft Framework on April 27, 2005 and accepted public comment through May 1, 2005. On May 25, 2005, LMDC released a revised Funding Allocation Framework, which then served as the basis for allocating remaining CDBG funds. The Funding Allocation Framework can be viewed on the LMDC website at [www.renewnyc.com](http://www.renewnyc.com) in the Funding Initiatives section. In 2006, LMDC issued a Final Action Plan regarding for the unallocated portion of the \$2 billion federal appropriation at that time, which has since been amended to reflect subsequent developments.

Historically, LMDC also gathered public input through its Funding Application Process. That process allowed members of the public, through their funding proposals and any subsequent meetings with LMDC staff, to articulate their perceptions of, and solutions to, the diverse needs of Lower Manhattan.

The LMDC website remains available for the public to provide feedback on a variety of topics related to the redevelopment of WTC Site, the revitalization of Lower Manhattan's neighborhoods, and LMDC Partial Action Plans. To date, LMDC has received thousands of comments through its website.

### **I. Short-Term Capital Projects**

The Short-Term Capital Projects were first announced by then Governor George Pataki on April 24, 2003. The projects were selected through a consultation process involving community groups, local businesses, major area firms, property owners, and city and state government representatives to revitalize the Lower Manhattan community and facilitate economic development after September 11th. Community Board 1, Manhattan, contributed insight into residents' needs for the area at meetings and in correspondence. Input was solicited from organizations such as the Alliance for Downtown New York, the Real Estate Board of New York, the Association for a Better New York, the Partnership for New York City, Wall Street Rising, and the American Institute of Architects. The City of New York Mayor's Office compiled input on the greatest need based on a number of sources and a range of constituencies.

As LMDC selected projects for funding, support from the public was considered. Public support for many of the proposed short-term capital projects is summarized here.

The Millennium High School project was designed to provide increased educational opportunities for the children of Lower Manhattan and the unique quality of the school a factor in retaining area residents. The school has received resounding support from many elected officials and civic organizations, including Community Board 1, then Council Member Alan Gerson, United States Senator Charles Schumer, and then United States Senator Hillary Clinton. Community Board 1 stated that, "Excellent public schools were a significant factor leading to the popularity of Lower Manhattan as a place for the families to live and raise their children...finding a suitable public high school for one's child is a more difficult challenge. The Millennium High School would fill that void here in our district and would give families yet another good reason to live in this community."

Many have asked for and voiced support for the construction of various parks in Lower Manhattan, including Senator Schumer, Community Boards 1 and 2, the Friends of Hudson River Park, Historic Districts Council, and others from the public and private sectors. The creation of open spaces and neighborhood parks provide public facilities that add to the quality of life for all communities in Lower Manhattan and draw residents and visitors to the area, which have also contributed to the rehabilitation of Lower Manhattan. One major open space project involved the improvement of Hudson River Park between Houston and Chambers Streets. The Friends of Hudson River Park stated that the section will be an extraordinary recreational resource for area residents. Improvements to the park enhanced the quality of this public facility by adding recreational opportunities and the park has served as a major attraction in Lower Manhattan. Other comments expressing support were received from Community Board 1, Senator Schumer, Brooklyn Bridge Park Coalition, Historic Districts Council, Audubon Society, State Senator Thomas K. Duane, Hudson Park Trust Council, the New York Building Congress, Congressman Jerrold Nadler, and others from the public and private sector.

Representing many businesses in New York City, the Partnership for New York City commented on the need to improve pedestrian and vehicular access, the need for transformation of areas with the "appearance of a 'war zone' into a secure but pleasant place," and the provision of amenities to improve street life and the neighborhood for workers, residents, and visitors.

The Short-term Capital Projects provided immediate relief to Lower Manhattan residents, businesses, workers, students, and visitors by improving accessibility in and around Lower Manhattan and enhancing the quality-of-life in Lower Manhattan, making this a more attractive place to live, work, and visit. These projects were completed in the short-term, many within six months to one year, providing tangible improvements to life in Lower Manhattan and helping to retain and attract businesses and residents while work to realize the long-term vision moves forward.

The short-term capital projects selected met some or all of the following criteria:

- Consistent with HUD eligibility criteria
- Enhanced the quality-of-life in Lower Manhattan in the near-term for residents, businesses, workers, students, and/ or visitors;
- Provided or enhanced open space in Lower Manhattan;
- Leveraged additional private or public funds to complete the full scope of the capital project; and
- Funds were used for capital costs or costs related to capital projects, not operational costs.

All projects were short-term in that they were intended to be completed within one year. Exceptions were made to allow for projects that showed substantial and significant progress and met some or all of the criteria above as well as for costs related to capital projects.

The original Partial Action Plan 4 allocated a total of \$69,405,000 to Short Term Capital Projects.

June 2004 Amendment to Short Term Capital Projects: This amendment eliminated funding for Damaged Building Beautification and reallocated it to Neighborhood Parks and Open Spaces to provide funding for an additional Open Space – the Louise Nevelson Plaza. Some of the funds were also reallocated to provide for costs associated with environmental review for two other projects: (1) Stock Exchange Area Security and Aesthetic Improvements - \$160,000, and (2) Millennium High School - \$7,500. The total allocation for all Short-Term Capital Projects remained up to \$69,405,000.00.

February 2006 Amendment to Short-Term Capital Projects: This amendment reallocated \$1,800,000 from funds allocated for West Street Planning (part of Long Term Planning) to West Street Pedestrian Connections. A description of the proposed reallocation is located in section F below. The total allocation for the Short-Term Capital Projects was increased as a result of the reallocation of \$1,800,000 from West Street Planning (part of Long-Term Planning and Administration) up to \$71,205,000.

December 2006 Amendment to Short Term Capital Projects: This amendment eliminated all funding for Millennium High School (\$3,007,500). The New York City School Construction Authority was able to secure alternative funding to cover these expenses. The total allocation for Short-Term Capital Projects was reduced to \$68,197,500 as a result of this amendment.

August 2010 Amendment to Short Term Capital Projects: This amendment increased funding for the New York Stock Exchange Area Improvements project by \$95,000 to provide for additional costs needed to complete the project. In addition, this amendment expanded the scope of the West Street Pedestrian Connections project to include pedestrian management to mitigate the impact of construction on and around West Street including WTC construction, discussed in more detail below. The total allocation for Short Term Capital Projects was increased to \$68,292,500 as a result of this amendment.

March 2018 Amendment to Short Term Capital Projects: This amendment reduced the West Street Pedestrian Connections allocation by \$594,277 to close this activity and ultimately this Action Plan. Of the remaining balance in this activity \$452,680 was re-allocated to the Performing Arts Center activity in Partial Action Plan 11 and \$141,598 was moved to the West Thames Street Pedestrian Bridge activity in the Final Action Plan.

The Short-term Capital Projects include the following:

**A. Downtown Alliance Streetscape Program**

Following the recovery efforts, round-the-clock clean-up, and start of reconstruction at the WTC after September 11th, there was a need to enhance the streetscape neighboring the WTC Site. The Alliance for Downtown New York developed a short term action plan, based on its previously completed Streetscape Study to improve safety, add signage, and increase navigability along lower Broadway.

The project area consisted of both sides of Broadway, from Battery Park to City Hall Park. The project area was divided into three segments: Battery Place to Exchange Place, Exchange Place to Liberty Street, and Liberty Street to Barclay Street.

This project anticipated the completion of the Downtown Alliance Streetscape Plan. Elements of the Streetscape Plan included sidewalk inserts, sidewalks with specially tinted concrete, and 12” granite curbs with street names and markers of historic Broadway events; new custom lighting designed to improve overall illumination; new benches, bollards, and waste receptacles; and specially-designed signage to facilitate way-finding and identification of significant sites. The enhancement of the safety and user-friendliness of Broadway was necessary to make Lower Manhattan a more attractive and welcoming place for businesses and visitors alike, and assisted the revitalization efforts of the area.

This project has benefited businesses, workers, residents, and visitors in Lower Manhattan.

The estimated cost included in this partial action plan for this project was up to \$4,000,000. The total project cost was approximately \$19,500,000. Other resources were expected to be available for this project to address the needs outlined in this plan. These other expected resources from private and non-Federal public sources included, but were not limited to, \$15,500,000 in funds from the Alliance for Downtown New York and other sources.

**B. New York Stock Exchange Area Security and Aesthetic Improvements**

Heightened safety concerns after September 11th intensified efforts to secure the area surrounding the New York Stock Exchange (NYSE) located in the heart of the financial district. Unsanitary and temporary barricades, checkpoints, and security vehicles had decreased the quality-of-life and ease of access for local residents, businesses, workers, and visitors. A security and aesthetic plan, based in part on a pre-September 11 plan for the NYSE area, addressed these issues in the area roughly bounded by Broadway to the west, Pine Street to the north, William Street to the east, and Beaver Street to the south.

Post-September 11th plans included installing security barriers and guard facilities on critical streets, developing a more effective street treatment, and providing more attractive street furniture, such as bollards, barriers, and fences, to facilitate secure pedestrian and vehicular circulation within the historic core of Lower Manhattan.

This project has been a benefit to businesses, workers, residents, and visitors in Lower Manhattan.

The original estimated cost for this project in Partial Action Plan 4 was up to \$10,000,000. An amendment in June 2004 provided \$160,000 in additional funding for environmental review for the project, bringing the total estimated project amount to \$10,160,000. The August 2010 amendment provided \$95,000 for final completion costs, bringing the total project amount funded in Partial Action Plan 4 to \$10,255,000. Partial Action Plan 10 provided an additional \$15,000,000 for this project.

### C. Neighborhood Parks & Open Spaces

Many Lower Manhattan parks and open spaces were closed or damaged after September 11, 2001. Enhancing and rehabilitating these open spaces, as well as creating new parks, was critical to meet the needs for public space that serves workers in Lower Manhattan, tourists, and the existing and growing residential populations of Lower Manhattan. To address these needs, the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation prepared a Lower Manhattan Open Space Vision Plan.

Community Boards 1 and 3 comprise the proposed Lower Manhattan project area. Community Board 1 had the highest population growth rate of the city's 59 community boards, with increases of 100%, 59%, and 35%, over the last three decades respectively. According to the 2000 Census, the population was 34,420 residents, with over 6,791 families. A dire need for additional parks had repeatedly been identified by Community Board 1 in its annual Statements of Needs, particularly on the district's east side where virtually no park space was available. In addition to its growing residential population, the area hosts hundreds of thousands of tourists annually, making improved public spaces essential to the sustainability of the area.

In contrast, further east, Community Board 3 consisted of predominantly low- and moderate-income households and had the third lowest median income in Manhattan. Community Board 3 has had a long tradition of ethnic, economic, and cultural diversity and with a population of 164,407 according to the 2000 Census was one of the City's most densely populated areas. The need for additional parkland and the rehabilitation of existing parks had been identified as a high priority of the Community Board.

Enhanced parks and new green spaces across the residential communities throughout Lower Manhattan served as catalysts for the redevelopment of Lower Manhattan by providing public facilities for local workers, a draw for businesses, and an improvement in the quality of life for downtown's growing residential population. They also provided destinations for visitors by capitalizing on downtown's magnificent waterfront setting, unique architectural character, and important historical context.

The initiative involved at least 13 sites. Projects included, but were not limited to:

East River Waterfront Spaces – Coenties Slip; Old Slip; Wall Street Triangle;

Neighborhood Parks – Al Smith Playground; Brooklyn Bridge/Drumgoole Plaza; TriBeca Park; Washington Market Park; and

Gateway Parks – Battery Bosque; Bowling Green; Columbus Park; East River Park Ball fields; and Sara D. Roosevelt Park.

The scopes of work planned for these projects included, but were not limited to:

- New Parks and Significant Enhancements - The Battery Bosque was a newly designed portion of an existing park with plans to include an ornamental garden, evening lighting, and a fountain. The Bosque complements other improvements in Battery Park such as the renovation of historic Castle Clinton, a project coordinated and partially funded by the Battery Conservancy, a not-for-profit organization which raises money and implements improvements in the park. The Coenties Slip project was planned to create a permanent public space from a temporary space in an unused roadbed. Wall Street Triangle was planned to be significantly greened with planting beds, flowering trees, and an expanded sidewalk. The Brooklyn Bridge Plaza and Drumgoole Plaza projects were planned to remove parking spaces and replace traffic barriers to expand and improve the public space.
- Major Rehabilitations - The Central Lawn of Washington Market Park, a major destination in a heavily residential neighborhood, was planned to be reconstructed with new turf and an irrigation system. Bowling Green, America's first park was planned to be completely refurbished. Portions of Columbus Park were planned to be reconstructed; new amenities in this heavily used Chinatown Park were planned to include benches, game and picnic tables, drinking fountains, and lighting.

- Athletic Facilities - A number of the projects enhanced athletic facilities: the East River Park project was planned to reconstruct natural ball fields to address the needs of downtown's schools and sports leagues; the Al Smith Playground project was planned to improve upon existing athletic facilities; and the Sarah D. Roosevelt project was planned to include reconstructed fields.

LMDC and the Parks Department selected parks based on the following criteria:

- Consistent with HUD Eligibility Criteria;
- Consistent with New York City Department of Parks and Recreation Lower Manhattan Open Space Vision Plan;
- Consistent with then Mayor Michael Bloomberg's *New York City's Vision for Lower Manhattan*;
- Consistent with LMDC Public Realm Study, where applicable;
- Time frame for completion within one year or show substantial and significant progress within one year;
- Location and community served ensures coverage of complete area of Lower Manhattan on or below Houston Street; and
- All projects combined would provide a mix of active and passive uses throughout Lower Manhattan.

The projects were planned to benefit workers, residents, and visitors in Lower Manhattan.

Partial Action Plan 4, as approved by HUD, outlined the first 13 Neighborhood Parks and Open Space projects that were identified as part of this initiative. One additional project, the Louise Nevelson Plaza Redesign project ("the Plaza") was identified after the Partial Action Plan was approved.

The Plaza project was an outgrowth of the Public Realm Enhancements Study that the LMDC conducted in 2003 to explore opportunities for improving the public open spaces located in the Financial District. The Plaza was one of the largest publicly-owned open spaces in the Financial District, which now also included a growing residential population interested in seeing more amenities and additional enhancements to Lower Manhattan's open spaces. The results of the 2003 study and the Plaza's then state of disrepair presented an opportunity to improve upon the existing design in response to specific needs and changes that arose since the plaza's creation in 1978. In addition to proposed planning for enhanced lighting, increased seating, general aesthetic improvements, and other amenities, these funds were intended to help seek solutions to separating the existing Federal Reserve security function in the Plaza from the public realm, from both a safety and aesthetic standpoint.

Costs associated with this project included planning and design for the reconstruction of the Plaza in the financial district of Lower Manhattan. The estimated cost of planning for this additional project through the start of construction was up to \$300,000.

The remainder of the amended allocation was to be used for activities including, but not limited to, planning, design, renovation, and environmental review associated with additional Neighborhood and Open Space projects, including the construction of Louise Nevelson Park, as identified by LMDC.

The estimated cost included in this Partial Action Plan for this project was up to \$27,481,689.

#### **D. Hudson River Park Improvements**

The Hudson River Park Trust was created in 1998 to design, build, and operate a five-mile stretch of self-sufficient public waterfront park along the Hudson River. Hudson River Park has over 5 million users annually. The Park consists of seven segments. Segments 1, 2, and 3 include the Lower Manhattan communities of Battery Park City and TriBeCa, both of which were severely impacted by the September

11th attacks on the WTC. To advance the revitalization of these areas and support the stabilization and expansion of the collective residential community, the Hudson River Park Trust proposed the creation of a set of new tennis courts and the conversion of the courtyard – formerly a parking lot – of the Pier 40 complex at Houston Street into recreational field space for use primarily as baseball and soccer fields. The tennis courts effectively replaced a set of courts that previously existed in Battery Park City. The new Pier 40 fields provided a much-desired community amenity and allowed two games of either soccer or baseball simultaneously. These recreational spaces have served thousands of residents and attracted thousands more to the downtown area. The waterfront location offers a majestic setting for both the tennis courts and playing fields. The original Partial Action Plan 4, as approved by HUD, proposed the creation of an ice skating rink between West Houston and Spring Streets. However, members of the Lower Manhattan community, in particular Community Board 2, did not support the creation of the proposed rink, but expressed a desire for more recreational open space. Community Board 1, Community Board 2, and the Hudson River Park Advisory Council all issued unanimous resolutions in support of the Pier 40 recreational improvements.

The Park is also easily accessible to the other substantial residential communities along the west side of Lower Manhattan. Those communities are served extensively by facilities at the Hudson River Park. The LMDC's assistance to the Hudson River Park Trust helped make possible the construction of public recreational facilities that have improved the quality of life in Lower Manhattan, making it a more desirable place to live, which has not only helped retain existing residents, but attracted more residents and visitors to the area.

This project was intended to benefit workers, residents, and visitors in Lower Manhattan. The estimated cost included in this Partial Action Plan for this project was up to \$2,600,000.00.

#### **E. Millennium High School**

The Millennium High School, an academically rigorous school, will be the first open admission high school specifically serving Lower Manhattan students. The area served includes all of Lower Manhattan on or south of Houston Street. The high schools located on or below Houston Street served students from all over the city; many were selective and required a test for entry or have specialized fields of study. Ensuring the stability and encouraging the growth of the residential population was identified as key in Lower Manhattan's economic recovery from September 11th.

The Millennium High School is located at 75 Broad Street at the intersection of Broad and South William Street. LMDC funds were intended to be used to renovate the space at 75 Broad Street. The renovations entailed converting three floors of what was commercial office space into classrooms, administrative offices, and other school facilities. The top floor of the building was converted into a gymnasium. In December 2006, LMDC withdrew all funding (\$3,007,500) for Millennium High School because the New York City School Construction Authority was able to secure alternative funding for the project. Therefore, the total Short-Term Capital Project allocation was reduced to \$68,197,500.

While the LMDC played an integral role in ensuring the planning and implementation of this project, other resources that included, but were not limited to, capital and operating costs from the City of New York, the City Council, the State Assembly, and private funders were made available to address the needs outlined in this plan. The construction project was effectively completed without LMDC funding.

#### **F. West Street Pedestrian Connections**

This project proposed to construct a temporary pedestrian bridge near the intersection of Vesey and West Streets and provided enhancements to the bridge and walkway at Liberty Street. This improvement fostered safe pedestrian flows across West Street and appropriately handled the expected high volumes of pedestrians that used this crossing daily once PATH service was restored by December of 2003.

The former North Bridge, which connected the WTC site to the World Financial Center, was entirely destroyed by the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001. This bridge was a major connection between the WTC PATH Terminal (which served an estimated 67,000 in-bound PATH riders daily before it was destroyed on September 11, 2001) and the heavily utilized offices at the World Financial Center. During peak hours, 6,000 people per hour utilized the pedestrian bridge prior to September 11<sup>th</sup>. Since the attacks, the number of pedestrians crossing West Street at the Vesey Street intersection steadily recovered from levels immediately after the attacks, and as the area around the WTC recovered, these numbers continued to rise. Further, the temporary PATH service to the Terminal at the WTC site was scheduled to be complete by the end of 2003. As PATH riders arrived at the WTC and crossed West Street to reach the World Financial Center, a replacement for the destroyed bridge was needed to safely and efficiently serve the estimated 6,500 pedestrians who used the West Street-Vesey Street intersection hourly.

This Partial Action Plan provided funding for both construction of the Vesey Street Bridge and for improvements to the Liberty Street connection. This project has been a benefit to businesses, workers, residents, and visitors in Lower Manhattan.

The estimated cost included in this Partial Action Plan for this project was initially up to \$21,155,811. Other resources were expected to be made available for this project to address the needs outlined in this plan. These other expected resources from private and non-Federal public sources included, but were not limited to, on-going maintenance costs for the Liberty Street and Vesey Street connections.

February 2006 Amendment to West Street Pedestrian Connections: Construction of the Vesey Bridge was completed in stages, with the opening in time for the temporary PATH station in November 2003. This was followed by the completion of the Bridge Extension in June 2004, and final delivery of the elevators in November 2004. The original estimated cost for this work in the approved Partial Action Plan 4 for the West Street Pedestrian Connections program was up to \$21,155,811. However, it was estimated that an additional \$1,800,000 was needed for costs related to design changes, scheduling expenses to meet the opening of PATH, as well as unforeseen conditions, including the escalation in steel prices and unexpected sub-surface conditions. LMDC reallocated \$1,800,000 from funds allocated for West Street Planning, part of Long-Term Planning (Section IIIB), to the West Street Pedestrian Connections program, increasing the total allocation to \$22,955,811.

August 2010 Amendment to West Street Pedestrian Connections: Due to significant construction activities on West Street during the WTC reconstruction, representatives of the community raised concerns about pedestrian safety at crossings along West Street. A study suggested that pedestrian management services would address those concerns and should have been introduced during peak traffic hours. A project was therefore created to fund pedestrian management-related services necessary to improve traffic and pedestrian safety at selected West Street pedestrian crossings. The total allocation to West Street Pedestrian Connections remained unchanged at \$22,955,811.

March 2018 Amendment to West Street Pedestrian Connections: Not all of the \$1,800,000 funds allocated from West Street Planning to this activity in February 2006 was needed for the Pedestrian Managers project so in March 2018, LMDC transferred approximately \$452,680 to the Performing Arts Center activity in Partial Action Plan 11. This 2018 amendment also transferred the residual balance from West Street Pedestrian Connections activity, approximately \$141,598 to the West Thames Street Pedestrian Bridge activity, and the unexpended balance from the Long Term Planning activity back to the Planning and Administration activity in the Final Action Plan, enabling the closing of this Action Plan 4. As a result, the West Street Pedestrian Connections allocation was reduced to \$22,361,534, and closed.

## **G. Damaged Buildings Beautification**

The original Partial Action Plan 4, as approved by HUD, proposed spending up to \$1,500,000.00 toward Damaged Building Beautification for the building at 130 Liberty Street. Due to the timing of this project, and the mediation of the insurance dispute regarding the fate of the building, that led to a settlement through which the LMDC will proceed to purchase the property and clean and deconstruct the building, the amount allocated for this project was reallocated to Neighborhood Parks and Open Spaces projects, as indicated in the amendments to the Partial Action Plan dated June 9, 2004.

## H. Lower Manhattan Communications Outreach Campaign

The timely and regular dissemination of information regarding the revitalization of Lower Manhattan is critical to LMDC's mission. Lower Manhattan residents, business owners, visitors, and others interested in and affected by the attacks must be kept apprised of developments on the WTC site and the broader off-site revitalization effort. Such information has enabled Lower Manhattan stakeholders to track key milestones and hold government accountable, make long-term decisions based on projected target dates for achievement of those milestones, and anticipate any disruptions to their routine and plan accordingly. This campaign complemented LMDC's website content and capabilities. The primary target area for dissemination of information is Lower Manhattan on or south of Houston Street.

LMDC launched the Lower Manhattan Communications Outreach Campaign (the Campaign) in June 2003. The Campaign was created and directed by in-house staff of LMDC, minimizing the use of outside contractors in order to maximize resources. LMDC consulted with businesses, community groups, and trade organizations to formulate the elements of the Campaign and to leverage their collective ability to reach thousands of Lower Manhattan residents, workers and visitors. Elements of the Campaign included:

- Development and widespread distribution of monthly updates on the rebuilding effort;
- Weekly electronic updates on the rebuilding effort;
- Maintenance and promotion of centralized source for information on the Internet;
- Identification of fixed locations to disseminate information on a recurring basis (e.g., WTC site, World Financial Center, kiosks); and
- Outreach to corporate HR departments, building owners, and property managers to communicate directly with Lower Manhattan residents and employees.

This project provided a benefit to businesses, workers, residents, and visitors in Lower Manhattan. The estimated cost included in this partial action plan for this project was up to \$1,000,000.00. Other resources were expected to be available for this project to address the needs outlined in this plan. These other expected resources from private and non-federal public sources included, but were not limited to, free distribution of materials by local community groups, businesses, and elected officials.

## II. Long-Term Planning

Long-Term Planning has provided funding to plan for public investments including a transportation plan that positions Lower Manhattan as the gateway to the region and the world, a plan that transforms public boulevards into grand promenades and one that capitalizes on underutilized resources of Lower Manhattan. By providing funding for these important long-term projects, LMDC has and will continue to move forward on the critical components of the revitalization of Lower Manhattan as quickly as possible.

The projects funded in this activity must meet some or all of the following criteria:

- Consistent with HUD eligibility criteria;
- Consistent with the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation's *Principles and Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan*;
- Consistent with the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation's *A Vision for Lower Manhattan: Context and Program for the Innovative Design Study*;
- Consistent with then Mayor Michael Bloomberg's *New York City's Vision for Lower Manhattan*; and
- Enhancement of transportation services connecting Lower Manhattan to the world.

The Long-Term Planning Projects include, but are not limited to, the following:

**A. Lower Manhattan Transportation Planning: Commuter and Airport Access Alternatives Analyses**

LMDC coordinated a transportation study to identify and evaluate long-range opportunities to provide enhanced rail access to the Lower Manhattan Central Business District from John F. Kennedy International Airport (JFK) Airport in Queens and from the Long Island Railroad (LIRR) Station in Jamaica, Queens. The study was jointly conducted by LMDC, the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey (PANYNJ), the Metropolitan Transit Authority (MTA) and the City of New York (the City). Holding a dialogue with a broad range of constituents, LMDC, the MTA, the PANYNJ, and the City had identified improvements in access from Lower Manhattan to JFK and Jamaica Station as a key element in the area's economic recovery, and, in the case of JFK access, in Lower Manhattan's ability to compete with other global economic centers such as London, Berlin, and Tokyo that have direct access to their international airports. LMDC hired a Director of Transportation Policy to act as a coordinator of this study, as well as to act as an adviser on Lower Manhattan-related transportation policy.

This study evaluated a range of options with particular focus on constructability and operational feasibility. The study documented existing baseline conditions and services, examined the cost of the alternatives, and explored environmental, organizational, and community impacts. Rigorous demand analyses based on ridership forecasts and population growth data were to be conducted. Alternatives identified were to provide a significant improvement compared to existing service in categories such as travel time, frequency, number of transfers, and passenger utilization. Ultimately, a single recommended alternative was intended to be chosen for implementation. Short-term solutions were also to be identified for implementation while the development and construction of a long-term approach progressed.

**B. West Street Planning**

New York State Department of Transportation (NYS DOT) is responsible for post-September 11th repair of Route 9A, also known as West Street in Manhattan, as well as planning for future enhancements. West Street is a multi-lane, 260-foot wide highway serving both regional and local traffic in Lower Manhattan. The street acts as the western boundary for the WTC site. West Street's traffic conditions and width -- more than twice as wide as a typical Manhattan avenue -- make it a barrier for pedestrians by separating Battery Park City, the World Financial Center, and the Hudson River waterfront from the rest of Lower Manhattan. Significantly, West Street acts as a divide between the WTC site, the residential community south of Liberty Street, and the existing Battery Park City community. Residents have complained about the potential safety hazards of crossing West Street and retailers in the World Financial Center have suffered from difficult access.

Since September 11th, there had been extensive discussion of the best ways in which to accommodate the large traffic volumes that flow along West Street, while also improving the pedestrian experience and making the areas adjacent to West Street more amenable to residential and commercial development. The portion that runs along the length of the WTC site was of special concern since it had to provide an appropriately dignified and aesthetically graceful setting next to the WTC Memorial.

NYS DOT considered numerous design concepts that took into account all significant factors. Goals for the design of West Street included creating better east-west pedestrian connections, improving the pedestrian environment, easing surface congestion, and accommodating the need to create a quiet, respectful site for the memorial.

NYS DOT's work on West Street funded in this Partial Action Plan has included necessary technical services related to the repair and restoration of essential transportation facilities as well as planning for future enhancements to West Street.

### C. Lower Manhattan Planning Studies and Improvements

LMDC in coordination with various agencies of The City of New York pursued planning studies and targeted improvement projects to address ongoing complications resulting from the damage on September 11th and assist in Lower Manhattan's recovery by improving the physical environment.

Ongoing construction, enhanced security measures, and loss of public open space have been among the many factors that necessitated planning studies. The planning studies aimed to provide more public open space, improve the public realm through aesthetic enhancements and practical measures such as traffic management, and facilitate construction in Lower Manhattan. As contemplated in *New York City's Vision for Lower Manhattan*, public investments in these types of projects had triggered private market reactions that strengthened Lower Manhattan's role as a global financial center, major commercial office market, residential neighborhood, and host to visitors from around the world.

To make these investments successful, they had to be carefully planned, taking into account what existed in Lower Manhattan and what the potential was for the future. Lower Manhattan has significant physical assets, including waterfront on three sides, landmarks from throughout American history, and a street grid and urban experience unique to North America. However, in addition to the tragic loss of life on September 11, 2001, the physical destruction and disruption that occurred in Lower Manhattan made clear that the future growth and success of the district depended upon how well its buildings, infrastructure, and public spaces worked together to accommodate its existing uses and assets with future development opportunities. A comprehensive effort was required to coordinate work toward improving the quality of Lower Manhattan's infrastructure, public spaces, waterfront, and streets.

The planning studies were focused on the area on or south of Houston Street in Manhattan with emphasis on areas beyond the boundaries of the WTC site.

The East River waterfront design study explored improved alternative uses for the waterfront between the Battery Maritime Building and Pier 42 to the north, including the development of open spaces and development sites for a wide variety of uses. The street management plan enabled the most efficient use of street and sidewalks in Lower Manhattan through traffic data collection, traffic and parking management, and distribution of traffic information. A comprehensive urban design study of the spaces and services along Water Street provided options to improve the experience along the length of the boulevard. The infrastructure management plan surveyed and analyzed Lower Manhattan's infrastructure, in particular conditions underground, and developed a strategy for improved future provision of infrastructure. A Chinatown Rezoning Study considered new zoning to improve Chinatown. City of New York staff helped coordinate the implementation of numerous projects in Lower Manhattan.

These planning activities evaluated existing conditions and analyzed, designed, and developed options to improve uses, public space, and access. The activities also included coordination of activities necessary to implement LMDC HUD funded projects by New York City staff. Activities included the following: architecture and landscape architecture; urban design and planning; marine, structural, civil, mechanical, environmental, and traffic engineering; intelligent traffic systems design; surveying; infrastructure analysis and design; construction management; financial and cost accounting; economic impact analysis; commercial real estate, residential property, and retail analysis; environmental consultation; legal advice and consultation; graphic design; and other related disciplines.

The original Partial Action Plan 4 allocated \$13,894,848 to Long Term Planning.

February 2006 Amendment to Long-Term Planning: As outlined above, Partial Action Plan 4 allocated \$13,894,848 to Long-Term Planning of which a portion was allocated to West Street Planning. It was determined that funds were no longer needed for work related to West Street planning so \$1,800,000 was reallocated to Short-Term Capital Projects for the construction related cost of the pedestrian bridge as described above (Section II.F.). This reduced the allocation for this activity to \$12,094,848.

December 2006 Amendment to Long-Term Planning: As outlined above, Long-Term Planning included funds to identify and evaluate long-range opportunities to provide enhanced rail access to the Lower Manhattan Central Business District from JFK Airport and from the LIRR Station in Jamaica, Queens. The actual cost of the transportation studies that led to the current environmental review of the Rail Link was \$2,738,000 less than originally estimated. Funds allocated to Long-Term Planning were reduced by this amount to a revised total of \$9,356,848.

August 2010 and December 2013 Amendments to Long-Term Planning: These amendments increased funding for Long-Term Planning by \$485,000 to \$9,841,848, to provide for a Chinatown Rezoning Study and New York City staffing costs for coordination of Lower Manhattan projects.

March 2018 Amendment to Long-Term Planning: This amendment reduced the West Street Planning allocation within the Long Term Planning activity in this Action Plan 4 to the amount spent to date, \$9,530,727, and transferred the residual balance back to Planning and Administration in the Final Action Plan. As a result, this Action Plan was closed.

### **III. WTC BUSINESS RECOVERY GRANT PROGRAM**

#### **Business Recovery Programs Established by ESD**

Congress appropriated an initial \$700 million to New York State for economic recovery and revitalization efforts through HUD's Community Development Block Grant Program. This fund is managed by Empire State Development (ESD) in cooperation with New York City's Economic Development Corporation (EDC) in accordance with a Final Action Plan and an Amended Action Plan accepted and approved by HUD. The Final Action Plan describes all of the business recovery and revitalization programs. After extensive public comment and the development of new estimates based on the programs' operating history, the benefits available for economic compensation were increased and businesses with fewer than 10 employees (already eligible for economic compensation) were included in the program providing incentives for new leasing activity. The largest increase was provided to businesses located closest to Ground Zero. The Amended Action Plan modified three programs: (1) the Small Firm Attraction & Retention Grant Program, (2) the WTC Business Recovery Loan Fund, and (3) the Infrastructure Rebuilding Program. Both ESD's Final Action Plan and Amended Action Plan are available on the ESD website: <https://esd.ny.gov/>.

#### **Additional Business Recovery Funding from LMDC in Partial Action Plan 2**

Both ESD's Final Action Plan and Amended Action Plan recognized that more than \$700 million would be needed to fully fund the business recovery and revitalization programs as described. When an initial \$2 billion was appropriated to LMDC, Congress intended that some portion would be directed to the business recovery and revitalization effort administered by ESD. LMDC's Partial Action Plan 2 provided an additional \$350,000,000 to ESD for their revitalization programs with \$150,000,000 in funding allocated specifically to the WTC Business Recovery Grant (BRG) Program. The BRG program provided economic loss compensation for small businesses and not-for-profits (less than 500 employees) located on or below 14th Street, based on a percentage of gross revenue and the business' location within the eligible area.

#### **Additional Business Recovery Funding Required**

The BRG Program accepted applications from January 25, 2002 through December 31, 2002. The last two days of the program brought in over 19% of all small business applications. By September 1, 2002, when the program allowed for increased grant amounts, only 52% of the BRG allocation had been approved. By December 1, 2002, 88% had been approved and the BRG program was on target with program estimates. The volume of applications received during the final days of the program resulted in a need for 110% of the BRG allocation.

By December 1, 2002, ESD had received applications from 11,859 businesses, equaling \$449 million, on track with the initial allocation of \$481 million. By the program deadline, December 31, 2002, ESD had received applications from 15,306 businesses. Eventually, 14,248 of these businesses were approved for a total of \$558 million. It should be noted that 3,447, or 22% of the entire applicant population applied in the last month of the program and over half of those (1,842) came in on the last two days. This large percentage was a result of an extensive door-to-door outreach campaign and an advertising campaign conducted by ESD. This resulted in demand in excess of the original allocation.

ESD reallocated unused funds (\$8.86 million from the Business Recovery Loan Program and \$8.24 million from the Bridge Loan Program) to the BRG Program to fulfill the demand for program funds and 2,166 eligible businesses are awaiting disbursement. Of these, 1,714 businesses had not received any previous grant awards from the BRG program, whereas the others were waiting for a supplemental or appeal award. The businesses awaiting funds had an average of 6 employees in NYC.

More than 144,000 jobs had been directly affected by the BRG Program. As contemplated in each of the Action Plans, ESD and EDC sought \$10 million in reimbursement of funds for the Retail Recovery Grant and Lower Manhattan Plan programs, respectively. These programs provided economic compensation to Lower Manhattan small businesses in the fall of 2001, while federal funding was being secured. The Retail Recovery Grant disbursed \$13.7M to 3,054 companies.

ESD estimated that a gap of \$74,500,000 existed for the BRG Program including \$54,500,000 for BRG Program grants to nearly 2,100 small businesses and \$20,000,000 for repayment to the City and the State for the Retail Recovery Grant and Lower Manhattan Non-Retail Recovery Program.

The total allocated amount for the WTC BRG Program in PAP 4 as approved by HUD on 8/06/2003 was up to \$74,500,000.

December 2006 Amendment to BRG Program: Partial Action Plan 4 originally allocated \$74,500,000 to the BRG Program established by ESD in cooperation with EDC. The program eligibility period had ended, and the estimated amount to be disbursed was \$68,945,914. Therefore, the allocation was reduced by \$5,554,000 to \$68,946,000 to reflect the amount anticipated to be expended.

March 2018 Amendment to BRG Program: As outlined above, Partial Action Plan 4 originally allocated \$74,500,000 to the BRG Program which was amended in December 2006 to the anticipated amount needed to fully fund the program. The allocation was again reduced by \$217,354 to \$68,728,643 to reflect the actual amount disbursed after post grant requirement monitoring was completed enabling the closing of this activity.

## **Planning and Administration**

LMDC engages in broad planning and administration activities relating to the recovery, remembrance, and rebuilding efforts in Lower Manhattan. LMDC's planning activities began in 2002 with the site planning for the WTC site and the areas immediately surrounding the site and those activities continue to the extent additional planning, guidelines, and environmental review are needed. LMDC planning activities also include the other neighborhoods in Lower Manhattan that have been affected by September 11th and its aftermath. LMDC's specific planning work included expansive analyses of Lower Manhattan's transportation, traffic, housing and related amenities, open space, retail development, and economic development capacity, needs, and potential. Based on these analyses, LMDC has developed and proposed concept plans for specific areas and projects in Lower Manhattan.

LMDC's administration activities include and will continue to include extensive public information and coordination activities relating to its LMDC planning work. As part of its coordination activities, LMDC has served and continues to serve as a facilitator of outreach and discussions between affected communities as well as the public at large and government agencies and officials. LMDC's public

information work has included: large scale public meetings and hearings; periodic printed newsletters and reports; an up-to-date, comprehensive, and interactive website ([www.RenewNYC.com](http://www.RenewNYC.com)); extensive electronic communications; and other public outreach and participation efforts. In addition, LMDC network of community contacts has included its advisory councils.

HUD has authorized the use of up to 5% of the total grant to LMDC for costs associated with planning and administration activities, including costs for overhead, personnel, and consultants. This Partial Action Plan included an allocation of \$7,805,255.00 for LMDC's planning and administration activities.

#### **IV. RESPONSES TO PUBLIC COMMENT**

The following section details the comments and responses relating to the draft of the original Partial Action Plan, after it was released for public comment from May 26, 2003 through June 12, 2003. LMDC received five public comments relating to Partial Action Plan 4. These comments came from one elected official, two civic groups, and two owners of small businesses in Lower Manhattan.

No comments were received on any of the amendments.

##### **A. Lower Manhattan Community Outreach**

Congressman Jerrold Nadler supported the additional funding for Lower Manhattan Community Outreach and stated that his office had received complaints that the LMDC was not properly communicating with residents and small business owners in Lower Manhattan.

From the Ground Up stated that outreach could be performed faster, more efficiently, more thoroughly and at a lower cost by the non-profit Lower Manhattan service organizations that are actually in the trenches and on the streets downtown every day and recommended that LMDC form formal partnerships with organizations such as From the Ground Up, the TriBeca Organization, Asian Americans for Equality, etc., for purposes of community outreach, solicitation of public comments, etc.

From its inception, LMDC has communicated extensively with area residents, businesses, institutions, and representatives. LMDC's website has provided a standing source of up to date public information and a means to provide public input. LMDC considers input gathered through all means in the context of its mission and existing projects as well as those of other governmental entities when developing and implementing its plans.

LMDC regularly solicits and relies on the active involvement of numerous civic and neighborhood-based organizations and elected officials to assist in its outreach efforts. These organizations are vital to LMDC's efforts, and they actively participate so that their constituents can be kept informed of LMDC initiatives on an ongoing basis. During each major outreach campaign and release of Partial Action Plans, LMDC disseminates important information for the public to dozens of community organizations. LMDC maintains a list of community distribution centers throughout Lower Manhattan that receive all of our public outreach documents, Partial Action Plans, and newsletters, and in turn distribute these materials to the public. LMDC also disseminates this information electronically to numerous organizations, which then forward the information and relevant documents electronically to their members and constituents.

During major outreach campaigns, such as the recent Public Perspectives campaign to solicit input on the WTC Site Memorial, LMDC utilized these community organizations and elected officials' offices to solicit public comment by disseminating by hand thousands of flyers throughout Lower Manhattan, including additional neighborhood organizations, community centers, and major housing complexes. These flyers provided a description of the outreach campaign and encouraged people to participate by attending the public forum, or submitting comments via mail, fax, or through LMDC's website. On many occasions over the past year - including the Plans in Progress outreach campaign to solicit input on the nine design concepts for the WTC site, the most recent Public Perspectives campaign on the memorial,

and on It Pays to Live Downtown Day, which provided information about the Residential Grant Program - LMDC employees have gone out into the neighborhoods throughout Lower Manhattan to distribute flyers and important information by hand.

Recently, LMDC initiated a communications outreach campaign to inform Lower Manhattan residents, employees, and visitors of upcoming short-term, quality of life improvements that are being implemented over the next six to 12 months. On June 19, 2003, LMDC staff and volunteers fanned out across Lower Manhattan from 7-9 am to distribute 10,000 palm cards and place 100 posters in local businesses and restaurants.

As part of the campaign, LMDC is continuing to reach out to businesses and residents downtown in order to distribute newsletters and e-updates. Last week, 50,000 LMDC newsletters were distributed to strategic locations in the area and inserted in local publications. The campaign has four main components: the development of branded marketing materials including posters and palm cards; the creation of informational kiosks at strategic locations downtown that will double as visitor centers; increased distribution of LMDC newsletters, e-updates and messages from the President; and, continued support of LowerManhattan.info as a central online source of information about the rebuilding effort.

Through LMDC's Residential Grant Program, LMDC has established direct contact with the residents of Lower Manhattan. LMDC contracted with Asian Americans for Equality to conduct outreach for the Residential Grant Program, open a community office in Chinatown, and operate a hotline. LMDC opened a second community office in TriBeCa.

As part of the outreach campaign for the LMDC Residential Grant Program, LMDC staff and volunteers visited every residential building in Lower Manhattan. Asian Americans for Equality organized and participated in hundreds of events with residents including: neighborhood block parties and festivals; community board meetings; meetings organized by elected officials; informational sessions at various housing complexes; and outreach sessions at local social service organizations, senior centers, libraries, and other community facilities.

ESD and the EDC have established direct contact with the business community. The primary purpose of ESD and EDC is to create and foster a business friendly environment in New York State and City. In recent years, ESD and EDC have established productive working relationships with the business and related communities by assisting thousands of large and small businesses and fostering the conditions in which the private sector can retain and create jobs for New Yorkers.

With respect to Lower Manhattan, both agencies have provided extensive outreach to the Lower Manhattan business community keeping it apprised of the numerous business assistance programs.

On September 13, 2001, ESD transformed its Tourism Call Center into a Business Assistance Hotline and opened the first Walk-In-Center for impacted business owners. Both of these resources provided valuable information regarding financial and other assistance to the Lower Manhattan business community. To date more than 71,000 calls have been made to ESD's Business Assistance Hotline and over 15,000 businesses have visited our Walk-In-Centers. Both ESD and EDC established Business Assistance Walk-In Centers in Lower Manhattan, staffed with multi-lingual personnel.

The outreach by both organizations to the Lower Manhattan business community has continued since September 2001. The programs were promoted through extensive multi-lingual print, radio, and internet advertisement campaigns. ESD published periodic newsletters and funded several informational websites including LowerManhattan.info. ESD and EDC conducted numerous workshops and seminars with community groups, not-for-profit and grass roots organizations formed by members of the Lower Manhattan business community, and government partners including Congresswoman Velazquez and Manhattan Borough President Fields.

ESD contracted with 23 separate organizations, through a competitive selection process, to provide outreach services and technical assistance to small business owners south of 14 Street. Many of the service providers are community based organizations including the TriBeca Organization.

### **B. Business Recovery Grants**

Two comments were received from business owners located near Ground Zero. They each requested additional grants be provided to compensate them for losses suffered directly from nearby construction and street repair.

The Business Recovery Grant (BRG) program provided compensation to Lower Manhattan business and not-for-profit organizations that suffered economic losses as a result of the attacks on the WTC. BRG applicants were able to calculate their economic losses suffered during a time period of up to 11 months following the attacks. The loss calculation included decreased revenues and other economic injuries suffered from related construction and street repair. In August of 2002, BRG compensation was increased for all applicants, including a 150% increase in grant compensation for the entities located closest to Ground Zero.

Comments received from Congressman Jerrold Nadler and From the Ground Up (a member organization concerned with the renewal of Lower Manhattan) proposed LMDC dedicate additional funds to former WTC tenants.

Congress allocated \$33 million under a separate allocation specifically to provide compensation for firms that suffered a disproportionate loss of life. This allocation was separate and in addition to the original funds allocated to provide business recovery assistance. It is anticipated that most firms receiving funds from this program were former WTC tenants.

Economic loss compensation was provided to former WTC tenants and other Lower Manhattan businesses through separate congressional appropriations that mandated that at least \$500 million in economic compensation be allocated to impacted small businesses, not-for-profit organizations, and individuals. The BRG program was created to provide compensation to those firms. Through this program more than 14,000 separate small businesses and not-for-profit organizations will receive more than \$540 million in economic compensation grants. During the program, the level of compensation for entities in the Restricted Zone, (the area that includes the former WTC) was increased by 150% to compensate these businesses for the economic losses suffered. At the time nearly \$925 million (of the original \$2.7 billion provided) had been dedicated to provide direct assistance to businesses south of 14<sup>th</sup> Street.

Congressman Nadler's comment also called for the pending BRG applications to be paid as soon as possible.

More than 2,800 applications were received during the last two days of the time period in which BRG application were accepted in December 2002. These applications have been reviewed and awaited disbursement of funds in 2003. Eligible applications exceeded the \$481 million allocated to the BRG program. The federal grant program requires this public comment process to increase the funds allocated to the BRG program in order to fulfill all eligible applications. Following federal approval of the additional allocation, BRG grant payments will be wired to the eligible applicants' accounts within days.

### **C. Hudson River Park and Neighborhood Parks and Open Spaces**

Two commenters, Congressman Nadler and the Friends of Hudson River Park, wrote to support the allocation of recovery funds towards the completion of the Hudson River Park between Chambers and Houston Streets.

Congressman Nadler stated that many civic groups and community organizations have expressed the healing role an accessible public space can provide for the neighborhoods.

Partial Action Plan 4 includes short-term capital projects. The criteria for the short-term capital projects include projects that provide or enhance open space in Lower Manhattan.

One of the projects listed that meets the criteria for short-term capital projects is Hudson River Park Improvements. LMDC is currently working with the Hudson River Park Trust to determine what parts of their plan could be completed as a possible short-term capital project.

LMDC has also included Neighborhood Parks and Open Spaces as a project that meets the criteria for short-term capital projects. LMDC is working with the City on plans to allocate up to \$25 million in funding from this Partial Action Plan for the immediate implementation of over a dozen high-impact projects to rejuvenate parks and create new green spaces throughout Lower Manhattan, many of which will be completed by April 2004.

These projects are an integral part of LMDC's efforts to restore the quality of life downtown for residents, employees, and visitors. These projects build upon the work and vision of a number of different community and civic groups. These partnering organizations include Community Boards 1 and 3, the Downtown Alliance, and the Battery Conservancy.

#### **D. Support for the Damaged Buildings Beautification Project**

Congressman Nadler wrote in support of the Damaged Buildings Beautification Project stating that "the damaged buildings of Lower Manhattan do cast a pall on the area, discouraging pedestrian activity and commerce." Congressman Nadler provided an example of a building that should be considered eligible for funding.

Several buildings were severely damaged on September 11, 2001 and are still uninhabitable. The owners of these buildings and local officials are working together to determine the fate of these buildings. The visibility of these damaged buildings results in a blighting effect on the community, negatively affecting area businesses, residents, workers, and visitors. While the work proceeds to determine the fate of damaged buildings around the WTC site, LMDC will assist building owners by providing funding to improve and beautify these structures and their protective installations. LMDC is providing funds through this Partial Action Plan for 130 Liberty Street. Building owners of other buildings in the area may apply for funding to LMDC through LMDC's funding application process. Information on LMDC's funding application process is found at LMDC's website, [www.RenewNYC.com](http://www.RenewNYC.com), under Funding Initiatives.

#### **E. Opposition to Damaged Buildings Beautification Project and the Downtown Alliance Streetscape Program**

From the Ground Up expressed opposition to these projects. From the Ground Up stated there is no demonstrated connection between street beautification (tinted concrete for sidewalks, new street signs, etc.) and increased foot traffic, increased retail business, or a decrease in building vacancy rates. From the Ground Up expressed concern that LMDC should focus on the side streets and surrounding neighborhoods that desperately need to be restored and cleaned up.

The Downtown Alliance Streetscape Program was created to improve the condition of downtown's infrastructure, making it safer and easier for pedestrian and vehicle traffic to traverse. New and improved street lighting will add to the safety of Downtown while new trash receptacles, bollards and street furniture will not only help make Downtown a safer place but adds to its cleanliness and beauty. The project was also designed to celebrate Lower Manhattan's history and heritage. Broadway's historic "Canyon of Heroes" will be recreated to commemorate all the ticker-tape parades that have marched up Broadway from the 1886 dedication of the Statue of Liberty to the celebration of John Glenn and the crew

of the Shuttle Discovery. The project will also add a new signage system to Downtown, reorganizing and simplifying the existing traffic signs of Downtown, and reducing clutter. Maps will be mounted on poles at Downtown intersections, providing direction way finding assistance that will increase the navigability of the sometimes confusing streets of Downtown New York.

The goals detailed by the Downtown Alliance's Streetscape Program have received laudatory comments from the public and private sectors. The Downtown Alliance's Streetscape Program, has owner support from 95% of all property owners along Broadway. The program received an award from the Art Commission of the City of New York. Senator Schumer applauded the plan's devotion to upgrading the lighting condition of Downtown. He stated that, "This new lighting scheme will convey that downtown is a '24/7' community, and will provide a sense of safety." Another supporter of the Streetscape Program, Manhattan Borough President C. Virginia Fields added that, "Interim recovery also means taking measures to assure the public – visitors, residents, and workers – that there will be predictable and continuous improvement to the public environment...Interim streetscape improvements that could signal recovery and hope for Downtown."

Reconstruction of the streets in Lower Manhattan, including the side streets, is being funded through a separate allocation from the federal government to the City of New York. After the events of September 11<sup>th</sup>, the federal government agreed to provide the City of New York with over \$130 million in emergency aid to rebuild streets and sidewalks damaged directly and indirectly. Working with various federal, state and local partners, the City is developing a plan to implement a Lower Manhattan Streetscape Standard, based on the Downtown Alliance program, on all the streets which are being reconstructed. As part of the reconstruction program, nearly 2/3 of the streets south of Chambers Street will have the new Lower Manhattan Streetscape Standard installed as they are rebuilt. In addition, the City will pursue additional funding to implement that standard throughout the remaining third.

Information about the City's street reconstruction program can be found in an article on LowerManhattan.info at [http://www.lowermanhattan.info/news/reconstruction\\_paves\\_the\\_way\\_42972.asp](http://www.lowermanhattan.info/news/reconstruction_paves_the_way_42972.asp)

#### **F. Long-Term Planning and Planning and Administration**

From the Ground Up stated that to date there has been an overabundance of planning and studying regarding Lower Manhattan, but little concrete action. They state that while there is no doubt that Lower Manhattan would most benefit from well-designed, thoughtful, community-directed redevelopment activities, spending an additional \$13 million on more plans and studies at this juncture seems questionable. The Lower Manhattan community would benefit more from this funding going directly into the community itself.

From the Ground Up also questions the allocation of \$7.6 million in this Partial Action Plan for LMDC's activities for planning and administration. From the Ground Up questions LMDC's concern about moving the HUD CDBG funding out to its intended beneficiaries in a timely fashion.

Since its inception, LMDC has been committed to the long-term planning for Lower Manhattan and the creation of a permanent memorial honoring those lost. LMDC has worked in cooperation with its partners in the public and private sectors to coordinate long-term planning for the WTC site and surrounding communities, while addressing the immediate and short-term needs of the community through funding initiatives. The subject funds are also intended to conduct ongoing community information and participation activities and to administer and facilitate other public and private projects benefiting the communities.

In its initial funding commitment, LMDC provided immediate financial assistance to the communities that are in closest in proximity to the WTC site. Prior Partial Action Plans included the allocation of \$280.5 million for residents in Lower Manhattan and \$350 million for businesses.

In this Partial Action Plan, LMDC focuses on the additional short-term needs of the Lower Manhattan community and continues its commitment to immediate financial assistance.

In this Partial Action Plan, the short-term capital projects funded by a \$69,405,000.00 allocation will provide immediate relief to Lower Manhattan residents, businesses, workers, students, and visitors by improving accessibility in and around Lower Manhattan and enhancing the quality-of-life in Lower Manhattan, making this a more attractive place to live, work, and visit. These projects can be completed in the short-term, many within six months to one year, providing tangible improvements to life in Lower Manhattan and helping to retain and attract businesses and residents while work to realize the long-term vision moves forward.

In this Partial Action Plan, business and not-for-profit organizations impacted by the WTC disaster will receive up to \$74,500,000.00 in funds through the WTC Business Recovery Grant Program.

**G. Millennium High School Funding**

Congressman Nadler wrote in support of devoting funds to the Millennium High School.

This Partial Action Plan 4 includes short-term capital projects. The criteria for the short-term capital projects include projects that enhance the quality-of-life in Lower Manhattan in the near-term for residents and students.

One of the projects listed that meets the criteria for short-term capital projects is Millennium High School. The Millennium High School will be the first open admission high school specifically serving Lower Manhattan students. Currently, students need to commute to school in other parts of Manhattan and New York City. A new, academically rigorous neighborhood high school will help retain families in Lower Manhattan, as well as attract new families with school-age children.