

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

LOWER MANHATTAN DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

-----X

WORLD TRADE CENTER -- SITE 5

VIRTUAL ZOOM PUBLIC HEARING

-----X

January 12, 2022

5:00 P.M.

B E F O R E

CELESTE FRYE,

The Hearing Officer

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

A P P E A R A N C E S :

Celeste Frye

Public Works Partners 6

Tobi Jaiyesimi

Empire State Development 11

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

INDEX OF SPEAKERS

| SPEAKER | PAGE |
|--|-------------|
| Amy Vera | |
| Behalf of Assembly Member Niou | 22 |
| Christopher Marte | |
| Council Member of District 1 | 25 |
| Victoria Fariello | |
| 100% Affordable 5 World Trade Center | |
| Leslie Koch | |
| Ronald O. Perelman Performing Arts Ctr . | 29 |
| Jessica Lappin | |
| Downtown Alliance | 33 |
| Grace Lee | 37 |
| Adam Meister | 38 |
| Taylor Banning | |
| 100% Affordable 5 WTC | 40, 120 |
| Jenny Chao | 43 |
| Emily Leng | |
| Community Liasion | 45 |
| Mike Marcucci | 50 |
| Luisa Colon | 52 |
| Carol Lamberg | 53 |
| Joe Woolhead | 56 |

| | <u>INDEX OF SPEAKERS</u> | |
|----|------------------------------------|-------------|
| | SPEAKER | PAGE |
| 2 | | |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | Robert Marcucci | 58 |
| 5 | Linda Roche | 60 |
| 6 | Jill Goodkind | 61 |
| 7 | Richard Leland | |
| 8 | Akerman LLP | 64 |
| 9 | Matt Kapp | 66 |
| 10 | Victoria Hillstrom | 68 |
| 11 | Charlie Samboy | |
| 12 | New York Building Congress | 73 |
| 13 | Reggie Thomas | |
| 14 | Real Estate Board of New York | 76 |
| 15 | Mark Murphy | 79 |
| 16 | David Stanke | 81 |
| 17 | Todd Fine | |
| 18 | 100% Affordable 5 WTC | |
| 19 | Emily Hellstrom | 84, 112 |
| 20 | Adrienne Andi Sosin | 90 |
| 21 | Sarah Cassell | 91 |
| 22 | Justine Cuccia | |
| 23 | 100% Affordable 5 WTC | 93, 117 |
| 24 | Michael Robinson Cohen | |
| 25 | Architectural Collective Group ... | 96 |

| | <u>INDEX OF SPEAKERS</u> | |
|----|------------------------------------|-------------|
| | SPEAKER | PAGE |
| 2 | | |
| 3 | | |
| 4 | Alex Cuccia | 98 |
| 5 | Mariama James | |
| 6 | Community Board 1 | 100, 121 |
| 7 | Nicholas Kemper | |
| 8 | New York Review of Architecture .. | 104 |
| 9 | Finley Hunt | 106 |
| 10 | Esther Regelson | 109 |
| 11 | Maggie Dallal | 110 |
| 12 | Gerald Forsburg | |
| 13 | Community Board 1 | 115 |
| 14 | | |
| 15 | | |
| 16 | | |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | | |
| 19 | | |
| 20 | | |
| 21 | | |
| 22 | | |
| 23 | | |
| 24 | | |
| 25 | | |

2 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. Good
3 afternoon and welcome to the public hearing for the
4 proposed modifications to the World Trade Center
5 Memorial and Cultural Program General Project Plan.

6 My name is Celeste Frye with Public Works
7 Partners and I've been asked by the New York State
8 Urban Development Corporation, doing business as
9 Empire State Development or ESD and the Lower
10 Manhattan Development Corporation or LMDC, a
11 subsidiary of ESD to conduct this virtual public
12 hearing pursuant to Section 16 of the Urban
13 Development Corporation Act, Chapter 174, Section 1,
14 laws of 1968 as amended or the UDC Act. I will be
15 your Hearing Officer this evening.

16 Today's hearing is being held pursuant to a
17 legal notice published in accordance with the UDC
18 Act in the December 10th, 2021 edition of the New
19 York Daily News. The purpose of this hearing is to
20 inform the public about the proposed modifications
21 and to afford all interested persons an opportunity
22 to provide oral or written statements and to submit
23 other documents concerning the proposed
24 modifications.

25 My purpose is to run the hearing in a fair

2 and impartial manner to make sure that everyone who
3 wishes to speak has an adequate opportunity to be
4 heard.

5 This evening's event is a hearing, not a
6 question and answer session. It is an opportunity
7 for you to present your views so that LMDC and ESD
8 may consider them in making their final
9 determinations.

10 Please note that this hearing is being
11 recorded for internal purposes. A stenographic
12 transcript is being made and will be available on
13 LMDC's and ESD's website.

14 I'd like to give some guidance first to help
15 you fully participate in this hearing. Before we
16 formally begin, we are requiring that only
17 presenters share their video during this hearing.
18 For the best viewing experience, we recommend that
19 all participants enable the feature in Zoom and that
20 allows you to show only participants who have their
21 video enabled. These first two screens provide
22 instructions on how to do that. First for a PC or
23 Android device and then a second screen for a Mac or
24 Apple device.

25 This screen is for those participants who

2 wish to view the hearing with American Sign Language
3 interpretation.

4 This screen explains the options that you
5 have for providing comments on the proposed
6 modifications to the approved plan.

7 If you signed up to speak before the hearing
8 during the registration process, we have your name
9 and you will be called during the testimony portion
10 of this hearing. If you did not sign up to speak
11 before the start of the hearing, but you would like
12 to speak please identify yourself using the "raise
13 hand" function on Zoom instructions for this are
14 being shown on your screen now and will be shown
15 again periodically during the hearing.

16 If you are joining us this evening by phone
17 only, you may dial *9 on your keypad to indicate
18 your desire to provide verbal testimony. If you --
19 when you dial *9 we will (technical difficulties)
20 message with your phone number. Participants using
21 the raise hand function or *9 will be added to the
22 end of this speaker list. The option to sign up to
23 speak will end 30 minutes before the close of the
24 hearing at 7:30 p.m.

25 I'll give you a moment to read the

2 instructions before I move on. Again, those
3 instructions will appear periodically during the
4 meeting. Comments presented at this hearing will be
5 taken into consideration by LMDC and ESD as part of
6 the final review of the proposed modifications.

7 You'll also have the opportunity to send in
8 your comments via the email and mailing address that
9 is provided on the screen now. For those joining us
10 by phone, the email address is wtcsite5, that's
11 W-T-C-S-I-T-E-5, @esd.ny.gov.

12 Comments may also be mailed to 633 Third
13 Avenue, 37th Floor New York, New York 10017 to ESD,
14 attention: WTC Site 5 Proposed Amendment.

15 Comments will be accepted until 5:00 p.m. on
16 February 15th, 2022. This information is also
17 available on the LMDC and ESD websites. The
18 websites listed on your screen now,
19 esd.ny.gov/wtcsite5.

20 Before we begin the testimony portion of
21 this meeting to hear your comments, we will hear
22 from Tobi Jaiyesimi, Assistant Vice President at
23 ESD. In addition to Tobi, a number of other
24 representatives from the ESD and LMDC project team
25 are with us this evening and will be listening to

2 all of the comments delivered tonight.

3 Attendees with us include:

4 Holly Leicht, Chair of the LMDC Board of
5 Directors;

6 Dan Ciniello, LMDC President;

7 Goldie Wexel, Acting General Counsel at ESD;

8 Matthew Acocella, Associate General Counsel
9 at ESD and LMDC;

10 Marian Philips, Senior Vice President of
11 Community Relations, ESD;

12 Francisco Polanco, Director of Community
13 Relations, ESD;

14 Terrence Cho, Real Estate Development and
15 Planning, ESD;

16 Eram Qadri, Senior Director Planning And
17 Environmental Review, ESD;

18 Rachel Shatz, Vice President for Planning
19 and Environmental Review, ESD;

20 Philip Maguire, Vice President for Design
21 and Construction, ESD;

22 Derek Utter, Chief Development Officer at
23 the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey;

24 Matt Peterson, Assistant Director of Real
25 Estate, Port Authority;

2 And Justin Bernbach, director of community
3 and community relations at the Port Authority.

4 These representatives will be in attendance
5 throughout this hearing.

6 Before we begin the comment portion of
7 today's session, I'd like to introduce Tobi
8 Jaiyesimi of ESD who will present a summary of the
9 proposed modifications to the GPP.

10 MS. JAIYESIMI: Thank you so much. Thank
11 you for joining tonight's public hearing on the
12 World Trade Center Site 5 Project.

13 My name is Tobi Jaiyesimi and I'm Assistant
14 Vice President of Real Estate and Community
15 Relations at ESD. I'm joined tonight by the ESD and
16 LMDC World Trade Center Site 5 project team, members
17 of the LMDC board of directors and representatives
18 of the Port Authority.

19 As stated earlier, the purpose of tonight's
20 hearing is to give the public the opportunity to
21 deliver oral comments on the proposed modifications
22 to the World Trade Center General Project Plan.

23 Site 5 which is located at 130 Liberty Street is
24 the location of the former Deutsche Bank Building,
25 which was severely damaged on 9/11. The Lower

2 Manhattan Development Corps used U.S. Department of
3 Housing and Urban Development or HUD community
4 development block grant funds to acquire, remediate
5 and clear Site 5.

6 The World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural
7 Program General Project Plan was originally adopted
8 by LMDC, a subsidiary of ESD in 2004 to provide for
9 memorial and cultural uses, as well as commercial
10 redevelopment of the World Trade Center after the
11 September 11th attacks. The approved plan provides
12 for five commercial towers, public open space and a
13 Performing Arts Center surrounding the 9/11 Memorial
14 and Memorial Museum. The plan contemplated
15 commercial and/or hotel use on Site 5.

16 In February 2006, the Port Authority and LMDC
17 entered into a memorandum of understanding by which
18 LMDC would swap 130 and 140 Liberty Street,
19 including Site 5 with the Port Authority for
20 property it owned at the center of the campus to
21 enable the 9/11 Memorial and Museum, as well as the
22 Performing Arts Center to be built within and
23 proximate to the footprints of the Twin Towers.

24 The 9/11 Memorial and the 9/11 Memorial
25 Museum were opened in 2011 and in 2014 respectfully.

2 In response to Community Board 1 input, LMDC began
3 discussions with the Port Authority in 2017 about
4 allowing for either commercial or mixed-use
5 development at Site 5. In 2019, LMDC and the Port
6 Authority entered into another memorandum of
7 understanding to jointly issue a request for
8 proposals for Site 5 that would allow for
9 as-of-right commercial development or mixed-use
10 development, including a requirement for an
11 affordable housing component which would require
12 modifications to the General Project Plan.

13 In February 2021, after a competitive process a
14 mixed-use development proposed by a team comprising
15 Silverstein Properties, Debard Development, Omni New
16 York and Brookfield Properties was conditionally
17 designated by the LMDC Board of Directors.

18 The proposed project includes residential
19 rental housing with 25 percent of the units
20 permanently affordable, office space, ground floor
21 retail, a 12,000-square foot community facility and
22 fitness and amenity spaces as well as a direct
23 connection to the adjacent Liberty Park.

24 If the proposed project, which will be the
25 subject of a separate public process is approved,

2 ownership of Site 5 would transfer from LMDC to ESD
3 which would serve as landlord for the Site 5
4 long-term lease, since LMDC will cease operations
5 once the HUD block grant is closed out. Consistent
6 with the plan swap and the memorandum of
7 understanding mentioned earlier, all rent payments
8 would go to the Port Authority as compensation for
9 the 9/11 Memorial and Museum and Performing Arts
10 Center sites.

11 Since conditional designation of the development
12 team, LMDC, ESD and the Port Authority have made
13 multiple presentations to Community Board 1 and
14 local elected officials and held regular meetings
15 with the World Trade Center Site 5 Community
16 Advisory Committee or CAC. Feedback from these
17 stakeholders has been instrumental in shaping
18 multiple aspects of the proposed project, including
19 programming, design and public access to the
20 building.

21 There's also been extensive discussion about the
22 affordability requirements for the proposed project.
23 The Site 5 RFP required that any mixed-use proposal
24 comply with the affordability levels of the City's
25 mandatory inclusionary housing programming.

2 The proposed project would include
3 approximately 1,200 residential units and 25 percent
4 of the units, approximately 300 units would be
5 permanently affordable to households making an
6 average of 50 percent of area median income which
7 currently equates to approximately 42,000 for an
8 individual and scaling up to 60,000 for a family of
9 four.

10 Some community representatives and elected
11 officials have called for more affordable housing,
12 including some that the project be up to 100 percent
13 affordable. With a reference of people who lived or
14 worked in the area on and right after 9/11.

15 The project team is engaged in ongoing
16 discussions about the project's affordability and
17 participated in a December public forum, sponsored
18 by local elected officials on the issue.

19 It should be noted that approval of the
20 developer's proposed project as well as the
21 disposition of the site and related transactions
22 with the conditionally designated development team
23 are not part of the actions subject to public
24 comment at tonight's public hearing or during the
25 current comment period. Those actions will be the

2 subject of future public hearing and comment period
3 after being presented to the LMDC and ESD boards of
4 the directors later this year.

5 The current action is strictly to modify the
6 General Project Plan to allow for mixed-use
7 development, in addition to the already approved
8 commercial use. The chart on the screen provides a
9 summary of the proposed modifications to the current
10 approved plan. As stated before, the World Trade
11 Center General Project Plan currently allows for
12 commercial use on Site 5.

13 A tower developed under the approved GPP
14 would be subject to the existing commercial design
15 guidelines. The proposed modifications would permit
16 greater flexibility in use, allowing for mixed-use
17 development including the requirements of
18 permanently affordable housing and community
19 facility use in addition to commercial use. It also
20 would provide for a direct connection to Liberty
21 Park via a pedestrian bridge.

22 To reflect the addition of residential use,
23 draft mixed-use design guidelines have been prepared
24 and are subject to public review and comment as
25 well.

2 The impact of the currently approved plan on
3 Site 5 were studied in the 2004 final generic
4 Environmental Impact Statement. To adequately
5 assess whether any new or substantially different
6 significant adverse environmental impacts could
7 result from the currently proposed modifications to
8 the GPP, an environmental assessment, or EA, was
9 prepared pursuant to the National Environmental
10 Policy Act and the State Environmental Quality
11 Review Act.

12 This EA concludes that the proposed GPP
13 modifications would not result in any new potential
14 significant adverse environmental impacts not
15 previously identified in the project's environmental
16 review, and that a supplemental environmental impact
17 statement is not required.

18 On November 17th and November 18th, 2021, LMDC
19 and ESD directors respectively the start of the
20 public review process for the modifications to the
21 World Trade Center General Project Plan, and based
22 on the environmental assessment, made a Finding of
23 No Significant Impact or FONSI and determination of
24 non-significance.

25 In the spring, the LMDC and ESD Boards of

2 Directors will consider the public comments made
3 here tonight, as well as any written comments
4 received up until February 15, 2022 and will take
5 action on the proposed modifications to the General
6 Project Plan.

7 Again, please note that approval of the proposed
8 project, the disposition of the site and related
9 transactions with the conditionally designated
10 development team will be the subject of a future
11 public hearing and comment period after being
12 presented to the LMDC and ESD directors.

13 The public comment period will remain open
14 until 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, February 15th, 2022.
15 Comments may be submitted via email or email using
16 the addresses provided on the screen.

17 Thank you for taking the time to participate
18 in tonight's hearing and I look forward to your
19 comments. Thank you.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you, Tobi.

21 Now I'd like to take care of some
22 administrative matters by asking the stenographer to
23 mark the following documents as exhibits to the
24 hearing transcript:

25 Exhibit 1, a copy of the hearing notice that

2 appeared in the New York Daily News along with the
3 affidavit of publication;

4 Exhibit 2, the General Project Plan and the
5 proposed modifications to the General Project Plan;

6 And Exhibit 3, the Finding of No Significant
7 Impact and the Environmental Assessment.

8 Thank you for marking those exhibits.

9 Now, as we prepare to begin the testimony
10 portion of this hearing, I will once again share
11 instructions for those who wish to view the meeting
12 with American Sign Language interpretation.

13 As I mentioned at the start of this hearing,
14 if you signed up to speak during the hearing
15 registration process we have your name and you will
16 be called in the order in which you registered. If
17 you did not sign up to speak before the start of the
18 hearing but would like to speak, please identify
19 yourself using the raise hand function on the Zoom.
20 Instructions for this are being shown on your screen
21 right now and will be shown periodically during the
22 hearing.

23 If you are joining us by phone only, you may
24 dial *9 on your key pad to indicate your desire to
25 provide testimony. Participants who use the raise

2 hand function or *9 will be added to the speaker
3 list. The option to sign up to speak will end 30
4 minutes before the close of this hearing, which will
5 be at 7:30 p.m.

6 Each speaker will be allowed three minutes
7 to speak to assure that everyone has a chance to
8 provide their thoughts here tonight.

9 I'll begin by calling the names of those who
10 have registered to speak, or the first and last
11 three digits of your phone number if you're using
12 the telephone dial-in option. Elected officials,
13 Community Board District Managers or Chairs and
14 representatives of a government agency will be
15 provided the courtesy of speaking first.

16 Periodically we will show a list of the next
17 ten speakers on your screen so that you can prepare
18 for your turn to speak. When your name or the
19 last -- first and last three digits of your phone
20 number are called, you will be prompted to unmute
21 yourself on Zoom and we will make sure you're ready
22 before you begin speaking and we start the time
23 clock.

24 You may scroll or swipe on your screen to
25 see the time clock to remind yourself of the length

2 of time left for your testimony. Once three minutes
3 have passed, your audio will be muted and you'll be
4 invited to send any remaining comments to ESD's
5 mailing or email address. When you begin to speak,
6 please state your name and affiliation, if you have
7 one for the record.

8 As a reminder, this is a public hearing for
9 the proposed modifications to the World Trade Center
10 Memorial and Cultural Program General Project Plan.
11 We encourage all speakers to focus your comments on
12 the proposed modifications. We also ask that
13 speakers exercise civil conduct during your
14 testimony. Speakers using inappropriate language
15 will be muted and cautioned before being allowed to
16 continue. Please also be reminded that this is a
17 hearing, not a question and answer session.

18 Just one moment before we begin with our
19 registered speaker list. We would like to first
20 welcome some of our elected officials who have
21 requested time to provide comment.

22 Our first speaker will be Emily Leng.

23 Emily Leng, you may unmute yourself and
24 prepare to speak.

25 MS. LENG: Hi, this is Emily. I'm -- very

2 sorry, actually working through a technical
3 difficulty with my computer right now. Would it be
4 possible to come back to me in a moment?

5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Sure. We'll go to the
6 other priority speakers and then come back to you,
7 Emily.

8 MS. LENG: All right. Thank you.

9 THE HEARING OFFICER: So our next speaker
10 will be Amy Vera.

11 Amy Vera, you may unmute yourself and get
12 ready to speak.

13 MS. VERA: Hi. Can everyone hear me?

14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes.

15 MS. VERA: Okay. Thank you. My name is Amy
16 Vera. I'm the community liaison to Assembly Member
17 Yuh-Line Niou and I'll be providing a statement
18 related to a letter that was sent out to the
19 agencies on behalf of the assembly member. The
20 member is online, but she is currently traveling
21 right now via train from legislative session.

22 I am requesting that you remove the
23 guidelines that are currently part of the proposed
24 mixed-use designed guidelines for the General
25 Project Plan for Site 5 of the World Trade Center.

2 I request that we schedule with meeting community
3 stakeholders to discuss and revise the guidelines
4 prior to approval. I recognize and commend the
5 expansion of uses for the site to include mixed use
6 such as residential use, community facilities and
7 fitness facilities.

8 However, community stakeholders have brought
9 concern of the guidelines as were in -- will bind
10 the project to a site for a luxury building, making
11 a fully-affordable building prohibitively expensive.

12 For months our community has been informed
13 that the GPP approval process was solely to
14 authorize a residential building. However, as
15 clarified in a Community Board 1 meeting on
16 December 13th, the GPP changed now includes
17 guidelines that would legally restrict the design
18 and material of the building. Attaching such
19 specific guidelines to the GPP at this time is also
20 problematic and confusing to our community,
21 especially at this early point of the project.

22 The term "guidelines" is misleading as it
23 suggests that they are not binding, while further
24 language and definitions of "shall" as mandatory and
25 "will" and permissive and the documents indicate

2 otherwise.

3 The community design guidelines developed by
4 Studio Libeskind appear to mandate a specific
5 design. The intent of these guidelines extend
6 beyond simply seeking approval for a residential
7 building or mixed-use buildings, extensive community
8 facilities and provides mandatory design elements
9 that seem to limit fully affordable housing at the
10 site.

11 Thank you all for participating in 5 World
12 Trade Center Forum, December 9th and committing to
13 working with elected officials and community
14 stakeholders like Community Board 1 and the
15 Coalition for 100 Percent Affordable World Trade
16 Center 5.

17 We must continue discussing this vital
18 opportunity and ensure that community is engaged in
19 every aspect of this project, such as full
20 affordability for residential use areas, promoting
21 environmental sustainability, utilizing commercial
22 space to match community needs and to expand
23 community space.

24 I look forward to continuing with you all
25 and your colleagues on this critical project. Thank

2 you.

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much.

4 Our next speaker will be Christopher Marta.

5 MR. MARTE: Hi. It's Marte.

6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Marte. Thank you.

7 You may begin.

8 MR. MARTE: Hi everyone. My name is
9 Christopher Marte, Council Member of District 1 in
10 Lower Manhattan.

11 Thank you, ESD and LMDC for hosting this
12 hearing. This is the kind of transparency and
13 opportunity for public participation that is greatly
14 encouraged and I hope that all the comments we hear
15 today are strongly considered.

16 This is an extremely rare opportunity to
17 build affordable housing in Lower Manhattan. There
18 may not be -- there are not a lot of public open
19 sites like this. And the opportunity to build 100
20 percent affordable housing should not be missed.

21 The families that would be able to benefit
22 from living in a transit-rich neighborhood is a
23 once-in-a-lifetime opportunity. The children that
24 will benefit from going to the best schools that our
25 city has to offer is a once-in-a-lifetime

2 opportunity. A hundred percent affordable housing
3 at 1 World Trade Center will show New Yorkers and
4 the rest of the world that affordable housing is a
5 major priority for New York and that New York City
6 will stand as a center of opportunity for all
7 people.

8 We should not be sacrificing true
9 affordability for design and aesthetics. If the
10 current design and construction cannot support 100
11 percent affordability, then we have to find a
12 different design and rewrite the guidelines.

13 This is not a natural limitation but a
14 choice. And I recommend the city, the state to
15 choose a 100 percent affordable. Thank you.

16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much.

17 Our next speaker will be Victoria Fariello.

18 Victoria Fariello, you may unmute yourself
19 and get ready to speak.

20 MS. FARIELLO: Hi. Thank you. So thank you
21 to the LMDC and the ESD for hosting this hearing and
22 I also wanted to thank -- I'm Victoria Fariello.
23 I'm a district leader in Lower Manhattan and I'm
24 also a member of the Coalition for 100 Percent
25 Affordable 5 World Trade Center.

2 I do want to thank LMDC and ESD for hosting
3 this hearing and also for agreeing to work with us
4 at the forum and at the December 9th forum to come
5 to a better -- to come to affordability, 100 percent
6 affordability 5 World Trade.

7 It is incredibly important as you've heard
8 our Assembly Member and our City Council Member say
9 that affordability downtown is crucial. We've lost
10 over 5,000 affordable apartments in the last 15
11 years and this would be an amazing opportunity to
12 make a statement and to help make our -- our
13 neighborhood whole again.

14 5 World Trade Center is a social justice
15 issue. And I do ask that the environmental impact
16 study consider this as well and to look into what is
17 the environmental impact of bringing in 80 percent
18 or 75 percent luxury apartments. We really do need
19 to make our neighbors and our -- and our community
20 whole again.

21 And we ask that you please do not include
22 these guidelines that do bind the building to a very
23 expensive design and reconsider and allow for
24 another opportunity to build something that would be
25 entirely average. Thank you.

2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

3 Our next speaker will be Emily Leng.

4 And Emily Leng, if you're ready to speak now
5 you may unmute yourself and let us know when you're
6 ready to start. Emily Leng, were you able to
7 rejoin?

8 (No response.)

9 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. We'll move on
10 and if Emily Leng is able to join us again, please
11 raise your hand or email the
12 help@publicworkspartners.com email address to let us
13 know.

14 We'll now move on to the first ten
15 registered speakers. Excuse me. I'll read all ten
16 names and if you hear your name on this list of ten,
17 you know that you'll speak likely within the next 30
18 minutes.

19 So the list of speakers:

20 Leslie Koch;

21 Carl Rodriguez;

22 Carol Lamberg;

23 Jessica Lappin;

24 Grace Lee;

25 Adam Mesiter;

2 Taylor Banning;
3 Jenny Chao;
4 Mike Marcucci;
5 And Luisa Colon.

6 It is our understanding that Carl Rodriguez
7 and Grace Lee, while registered are not on the call
8 at this time.

9 If -- if you are present or a representative
10 is present, please email
11 help@publicworkspartners.com. That's
12 help@publicworkspartners.com. It's also at the
13 bottom of your screen and let us know.

14 So with that, we'll invite Leslie Koch to
15 speak.

16 Leslie Koch, if you're ready -- let me know
17 when you're ready.

18 MS. KOCH: Hi, how are you?

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Good. Thanks.

20 MS. KOCH: My name is Leslie Koch, and I'm
21 President of the Ronald O. Perelman Performing Arts
22 Center, which is located on the World Trade Center
23 site.

24 As many in the community know that
25 Performing Arts Center is under construction and you

2 can see it rising. And it was very much conceived
3 as part of the master plan eluded to at the
4 beginning of this meeting.

5 I'm speaking in support of the plan. The
6 plan adds a degree of vitality with mixed use.
7 Mixed residential use as well as community
8 facilities that I think is very important for the
9 site and for Lower Manhattan.

10 Lower Manhattan has experienced a
11 revitalization with an increase in residents on the
12 World Trade Center campus site today. There are
13 many visitors who come to the memorial and museum
14 and there are, of course, many office workers who
15 work in Towers 3, 4 or Tower 1. The proposed plan
16 would add a residential component and full-time
17 residents and we at the Performing Arts Center
18 certainly welcome the opportunity to serve those
19 residents with a mix of programming that is planned
20 at the opening of the Performing Arts Center.

21 The importance of round-the-clock activity
22 on the World Trade Center site was recognized early
23 on in the inclusion of a Performing Arts Center and
24 the modifications to the plan strengthen that focus
25 by permitting modifications for residential use.

2 The building as currently designed has a mix of
3 facilities available to the public, including ground
4 floor retail, the connection to the park and very
5 importantly a community facility.

6 This means that in addition to those workers
7 and the visitors who come from around the world
8 there will be individuals and families who will live
9 on the former World Trade Center site and are a part
10 of the Lower Manhattan community; living, continuing
11 the tradition of many people who live in Lower
12 Manhattan, who also work in Lower Manhattan,
13 shopping, socializing, sending their children to
14 school.

15 The permanent affordability requirement
16 ensures that the residents of the new proposed
17 building will represent the economic diversity of
18 Lower Manhattan. And we know that community
19 facilities and community access are very important
20 to all of the development of the World Trade Center
21 site at the Performing Arts Center, we will have
22 free and open access and free programming for the
23 community.

24 And in the proposed Tower 5 as currently
25 conceived, a community facility will compliment that

2 with a potential to attract and serve a diverse
3 array of users from the community, diverse in age,
4 economic circumstance, ethnicity, et cetera. And
5 the programming that will be available to them in
6 that facility will help increase the vitality of the
7 community.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. Your three
9 minutes have actually been completed. Thank you
10 very much.

11 Our next speaker will be Carol Lamberg.

12 Carol Lamberg, you may unmute --

13 MS. LAMBERG: Unmute.

14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Unmute, yep.

15 Hello, Carol Lamberg. Yep, there you are.

16 (No response.)

17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Carol Lamberg, I think
18 you're having some technical difficulties. Yes, can
19 you, if you can unmute yourself, we're ready for you
20 to speak.

21 MS. LAMBERG: Unmute.

22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes, that was perfect.
23 Nope, now you're muted again. That's good.

24 MS. LAMBERG: Okay. My name is Carol
25 Lamberg.

2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Carol, I think you
3 muted yourself again. I think you may have left
4 your cursor on the mute button. If you can try
5 unmuting again, you may start over.

6 All right, Carol, we are working on trying
7 to make sure you're able to unmute. Give us just a
8 moment. Can you -- can you when someone asks you to
9 unmute, if you get a message saying "unmute," can
10 you press that button. No. Okay.

11 Carol, if you want to try again later or if
12 you'd like to submit your testimony in written form,
13 it will be considered in exactly the same way.
14 Apologies for -- that you haven't been able to do
15 this. But we can -- if you want to raise your hand,
16 if you want to try again later.

17 Okay. All right. We're going to move to
18 the next speaker.

19 Carol, we will -- we'll try to work with you
20 again a little bit later to try to speak again.

21 Our next speaker is Jessica Lappin.

22 Jessica, I see your video is on. You may
23 unmute and begin when you're ready.

24 MS. LAPPIN: Hey, I'm Jessica Lappin. And I
25 appreciate this opportunity. Over the last 20

2 years, Lower Manhattan has really experienced a
3 tremendous Renaissance and transformation in what
4 was once an overwhelming commercial district, I say
5 this as the president of the Downtown Alliance, and
6 the BID in Lower Manhattan has really become a
7 vibrant mixed community with 63,000 residents and
8 thousands of restaurants and retail. And really,
9 the World Trade Center site has been at the heart of
10 that Renaissance.

11 And Brookfield and Silverstein's proposed
12 development would really go a long way towards
13 finishing, we're not done, we have two buildings to
14 build, we need to build this building and contribute
15 to our long-term success and prosperity. And we
16 have long advocated for continuing the direction of
17 mixed-use development in Lower Manhattan. The
18 retail and residential that's being proposed at Site
19 5 are very consistent with the broader plan and the
20 principles that have guided us over two decades
21 since the attacks. Bringing new residents in will
22 obviously help and be more important than ever
23 giving COVID in terms of supporting our local
24 economy.

25 Unfortunately, far too little affordable

2 housing has been built in Lower Manhattan, that was
3 a mistake and something this can rectify, well over
4 21,000 units have been built since 200,000, only 552
5 have been affordable.

6 This current proposal would deliver five
7 times the number of affordable units and do -- in a
8 typical year without public subsidy, create sort of
9 deep, permanent affordability. And so we do urge
10 the state to work with the development team to
11 increase and maximize the affordable units that will
12 be available in this project.

13 One of the earliest goals embraced was
14 reconnecting the campus to the surrounding community
15 and this retail on Greenwich Street will help do
16 that and really restore Greenwich Street as an
17 active and pedestrian friendly corridor.

18 And while I would say the proposed project
19 has many benefits for Lower Manhattan, it can also
20 pose some challenges logistically and this is a
21 densely-populated community. We do very much
22 encourage ESDC to work with the developers to plan
23 appropriately for managing access to the site, both
24 during and after construction without deliveries,
25 waste management and how it's all going to function

2 longterm.

3 I would lastly say, we most ardently
4 advocated for the left turn on West Street from
5 Albany Street. Something our founding departed
6 chairman was particularly passionate about. It's a
7 simple change DOT should approve it, we've been
8 talking about it forever. It would substantially
9 improve conditions in the Battery Park City and make
10 vehicle access to the site much easier.

11 And in closing, we believe the project at
12 Site 5 is a thoughtful response to the needs of our
13 community, we support it and we think it's
14 consistent with the longstanding and broadly
15 supported goals that have been articulated over the
16 last two decades.

17 The modifications that have been made would
18 provide the option for mixed-use development, a
19 residential tower with permanent affordable housing,
20 a community facility, new retail, a connection to
21 Liberty Park in addition to the already permitted
22 commercial use.

23 And so without the proposed modifications,
24 Site 5 which would just be developed as a commercial
25 tower. I think we strongly encourage ESDC to

2 approve the WTC General Project Plan to include
3 housing at the World Trade Center Site 5. And I'm
4 done.

5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much.
6 We'll move on to our next speaker who will be Grace
7 Lee.

8 Grace Lee, if you have now joined us and it
9 looks like you are ready to speak. Thank you.

10 MS. LEE: Hello. My name is Grace Lee. I'm
11 a long time Lower Manhattan resident. I'm here
12 today to amplify the voices of the community for
13 calling for 5 World Trade Center to be 100 percent
14 affordable housing and I ask you to reject any
15 design guidelines that would be a barrier to
16 securing 100 percent affordable housing at this
17 site.

18 New York is facing a housing crisis right
19 now, with some two-bedroom apartments in Lower
20 Manhattan renting for over \$6,000 per month and
21 luxury units standing empty because no one can
22 afford them. This is a once-in-a-lifetime
23 opportunity to create affordable housing
24 opportunities and specifically for September 11th
25 survivors and their families, first responders and

2 seniors.

3 The people who stayed in Lower Manhattan
4 after the towers fell rebuilt the city even after
5 they developed cancer and other serious diseases and
6 now they are being priced out of their homes. I've
7 heard some people argue it would be more efficient
8 to build affordable housing elsewhere. It doesn't
9 have to be "either or." It should be "both and".

10 There's no substitute for the symbolic value
11 of making 5 World Trade Center 100 percent
12 affordable. The community members who rebuilt this
13 neighborhood deserve more than where they can't
14 afford to live. They saved this neighborhood and
15 deserve to stay in it, and what could be a greater
16 living tribute to them than a place that they can
17 all call home.

18 This is once-in-a-lifetime opportunity and I
19 hope that you seriously consider this. Thank you.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

21 Our next speaker will be Adam Mesiter.

22 Adam, let us know when you're ready to
23 begin.

24 MR. MEISTER: Hi. Good evening. Hi. My
25 name is Adam Meister, it's actually M-E-I-S-T-E-R.

2 Thank you.

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Excuse me.

4 MR. MEISTER: Having worked in the local
5 community for a number of years for Howard Hughes
6 Corporation on a range of improvements, I'm pleased
7 to express my strong support of the proposed
8 modification to the World Trade Center General
9 Project Plan to include housing at 5 World Trade
10 Center.

11 The proposed building would be an ideal
12 addition to the Trade Center and reflects Lower
13 Manhattan's evolution as a mixed-used community.
14 The project will deliver a much-needed infusion of
15 housing, particularly permanent deeply affordable
16 units to address the substantial need for affordable
17 housing in Lower Manhattan.

18 Over the last 20 years, the community has
19 suffered from the loss of units due to privatization
20 of nearby co-ops, the removal of rental units from
21 the Mitchell Lama and the expiration of property tax
22 abatement programs that help to keep housing
23 developments affordable.

24 5 World Trade's mixed income approach would
25 alone deliver five times the number of new

2 affordable homes produced across all of downtown in
3 a typical year and will do it without public subsidy
4 that is better spent elsewhere to create units in
5 other communities where those dollars can be more
6 effectively deployed.

7 Not only will 5 World Trade bring
8 much-needed housing and round out the World Trade
9 Center campus, the development will also help spur
10 the City's recovery from the pandemic. The project
11 will create 10,000 new construction jobs, nearly
12 2,000 new permanent jobs and generate \$1.9 billion
13 in economic output, bringing much needed spending to
14 small businesses downtown.

15 I'm eager to see the highly capable
16 partnership of Brookfield, Silverstein and others
17 bring this dynamic mixed-use residential project to
18 fruition and I encourage the state to move it
19 forward as expeditiously as possible.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

21 Our next speaker will be Taylor Banning.

22 Taylor Banning. If you are ready to
23 speak -- yep. You may begin when you're ready.

24 MS. BANNING: Thank you. Thank you to ESD
25 and the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation for

2 hosting this hearing and giving the community a
3 chance to speak.

4 My name is Taylor Banning, she/her pronouns
5 and I'm a lifelong resident of Lower Manhattan. I'm
6 also a 9/11 child survivor and the -- and a
7 co-founder of the Coalition for 100 Percent
8 Affordable Housing at 5 World Trade Center.

9 Our coalition is advocating for 100 percent
10 affordable housing at this site to bring equity,
11 inclusion, access and genuinely affordable housing.
12 Hopefully over 1,200 units to this site with
13 emphasis on 9/11 survivors and first responders.

14 While our coalition supports the call for --
15 for this becoming a residential -- a residential
16 building at this site, we do oppose the addition of
17 the new design guidelines that would lock in this
18 current proposal for a luxury tower with inadequate
19 amount of affordable housing. So we are seeking
20 full affordability, residential use of this site but
21 do reject these restrictive guidelines that prevent
22 a chance for a more affordable tower to be built
23 here.

24 And I would just like to note that, you
25 know, as a resident who has watched my community

2 build back and LMDC, which was formed with funds to
3 help us build back our community, one of the focuses
4 was meant to be bringing on more affordable housing.
5 And sadly, we have not delivered that. And we are
6 calling on our elected officials, on the LMDC. This
7 is a chance to bring our missing and lacking much
8 needed affordable housing.

9 Sadly over time, the emphasis on more luxury
10 and big business and big developers has left us,
11 especially here in Community Board 1 where the site
12 falls, to be a residentially segregated community.
13 We need to change that and part of the funds that
14 you know HUD was founded to do and bring was to
15 desegregate and we're calling for that here.

16 We need to integrate our community. 9/11
17 survivors are not all white and wealthy. It is a
18 multiracial community, suffering from 9/11 related
19 illnesses and the need for housing. And we have
20 wonderful access to resources here in Lower
21 Manhattan and we need to make sure equal access is
22 given by race, by health and this is a chance to do
23 that. So please, we call for 100 percent
24 affordable, please do not box in these guidelines.
25 This is a chance to do something historic and much

2 needed and it's a choice we can all make to do it
3 together. So I hope we all have the will to do it.
4 Thank you.

5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
6 testimony.

7 Our next speaker will be Jenny Chao.

8 Jenny Chao, if you're ready to speak. You
9 may begin. Thank you.

10 MS. CHAO: Hey there. I am a longtime
11 resident of Manhattan and very recently in the last
12 over five years, a resident of Lower Manhattan. And
13 I worked and lived in the city when 9/11 happened so
14 I have ties also to the city.

15 I think that what is being proposed for
16 mixed use is a wonderful opportunity. I highly,
17 highly support it. I think our downtown is missing
18 a lot of new residential opportunities and now while
19 the goal for 100 percent affordability is wonderful
20 and I advocate for it as a person of minority and
21 color, I don't think it's realistic and that any
22 kind of affordable housing is a win.

23 For what I've seen, the proposed plan would
24 allow for at least like 300 permanently affordable
25 units and that's amazing. That's totally something

2 to fight for, to have only 100 percent affordable --
3 I don't think from a residential -- from a resident
4 point of view, I don't think that's viable because
5 everything will get locked up in the government.

6 Now, I may be wrong. However, any amount I
7 think is a win. On top of that, the proposal is
8 given by a group of developers and -- and excuse
9 me -- a group of developers and property owners that
10 have really been a part of this rebuilding of the
11 World Trade Center and I do feel like they are well
12 qualified for this job.

13 I also think that it's important to just
14 note that it will bring a lot of jobs if this
15 project goes ahead. If it doesn't, if it's locked
16 up in this fight between all 100 percent affordable,
17 versus some affordable, I don't think it will ever
18 get finished. And as someone who has lived here for
19 all of her life, I would really love to see it done
20 in my lifetime.

21 On top of that, I think it will really play
22 a critical role in our recovery from the pandemic.
23 As someone who lived here through all of that, I
24 would like to see more jobs come back. Jobs for
25 blue collar workers like construction workers,

2 generating the kind of revenue that it needs for
3 this city.

4 I also would like to just say that this
5 housing crisis is -- I have no words for it. Again,
6 any amount of affordable housing in the proposal I
7 think is necessary. Thank you for your time.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
9 testimony.

10 Our next speaker we'd like to invite Emily
11 Leng back to speak who was an earlier speaker who
12 had some technical difficulties.

13 So Emily Leng, if you're ready to speak you
14 may begin when you're ready.

15 MS. LENG: Hi, yes. Thank you. And really
16 sorry about the earlier difficulties.

17 My name is Emily Leng. I'm the Community
18 Liaison for State Senator Brian Kavanaugh and I'll be
19 reading comments on behalf of Senator Kavanaugh and
20 Congressman Jerrold Nadler, State Assembly Member
21 Yuh-Line Niou and Manhattan Borough President Mark
22 Levine. And apologies, I will be reading pretty
23 quickly to try to keep these under three minutes.

24 We submit for your consideration the
25 following comments regarding the LMDC and ESD's

2 proposed adoption of the proposed notifications to
3 the World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural Program
4 General Project Plan.

5 We appreciate LMDC and ESD's willingness and
6 agreement to keep the public comment period open
7 until February 15th, 2022 in response to our joint
8 letter on November 16th.

9 To begin, we want to express our support for
10 the goals of the proposed modification to expand the
11 uses permitted at Site 5 to allow for the
12 development of mixed-use tower with residential
13 fitness and community facility uses. We believe
14 that a mixed-use residential tower at this site
15 would be an appropriate addition to the Lower
16 Manhattan community, most especially to the extent
17 it provides affordable housing.

18 We are aware, of course, that the current
19 proposed development provides for 25 percent of the
20 residential units to be permanently affordable.
21 Over the past several months, we and many community
22 advocates have strongly expressed the view that
23 25 percent is simply not enough. Especially for a
24 community that has been losing affordability at an
25 alarming rate for many years.

2 We appreciate your participation and that of
3 the Port Authority and New York State Homes and
4 Community Renewal at our virtual public forum to
5 discuss affordability on December 9th and your
6 commitments to working with us and the community on
7 this issue.

8 We continue to maintain that maximizing
9 affordability at this site must be a key priority
10 and that every effort should be made to consider
11 various financing sources and other measures in
12 order to ensure a maximum number of permanently
13 affordable uses.

14 We recognize that the proposed amendment to
15 the GPP calls for a minimum of 25 percent of
16 affordable units and we ask that a sentence be
17 included in the amendment that confirms that the
18 agencies will make every effort to reach maximum
19 affordability at the site.

20 The proposed amendment also includes a draft
21 setting mixed-use design guidelines that would be
22 administered for any mixed-use development on the
23 site. We believe that the mixed-use design
24 guidelines as currently drafted are too restrictive
25 and not sufficiently conducive to increasing

2 affordability.

3 The guidelines currently include language
4 that mandates aspects of the building to a specific
5 design and may not provide enough flexibility to
6 maximize the number of affordable units. When
7 making adjustments to lower construction or
8 operating costs.

9 We request that the mixed-use design
10 guidelines be revised to be more permissive and a
11 variety of design options that may be considered and
12 allow for the greatest flexibility possible when
13 it's in the service of maximizing affordability.

14 The design guidelines also lay out the
15 square foot distribution for potential scenarios
16 envisioned for the mixed-use tower. In the maximum
17 residential option, there's currently 36,000 square
18 feet for a fitness instruction center and 13,000 for
19 a community facility.

20 This neighborhood currently lacks sufficient
21 public community spaces, especially dedicated senior
22 spaces and recreational areas for students and
23 children. Given that this will be a large
24 residential building that is located in the
25 increasing mixed-use neighborhood, we hope to see

2 increased community space to the extent feasible.

3 Similarly, there is currently 12,000 square
4 feet for retail in the maximum residential option.
5 As the neighborhood continues to become more
6 residential, we ask that you prioritize
7 community-gearred retail spaces, including potential
8 options such as a grocery store or pharmacy.

9 Finally, with regards to the sustainability
10 standards, we recognize that the current guidelines
11 state that the building must meet LEED gold
12 standards and comply with the sustainable design
13 guidelines applicable to a mixed-use building. We
14 believe that these standards are baseline
15 requirements and ask that you look into and consider
16 implementing additional sustainability guidelines
17 that go beyond what is currently proposed.

18 In particular, recognizing that both the
19 Governor in her recent State of the State address,
20 the legislature in the form of proposed legislation
21 and the state bodies working on implementation of
22 the climate leadership and Community Protection Act
23 have all proposed requiring all new buildings to be
24 all electric. We ask that the sustainability
25 standards include the requirement of the tower be

2 all electric to the maximum extent possible.

3 As for the final piece of the World Trade
4 Center to be rebuilt, we believe that Site 5 is a
5 significant opportunity to bring large scale
6 affordable housing to Lower Manhattan and design a
7 community center building that would enrich the
8 lives of all who live and work in the area.

9 We appreciate your consideration of these
10 comments and we will be submitting them as written
11 comments. Thank you.

12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. Thanks for
13 your testimony and for coming back.

14 Our next speaker will be Mike Marcucci.

15 Mike Marcucci, you may enable your video and
16 unmute yourself and let us know when you're ready to
17 begin.

18 MR. MARCUCCI: Okay. I think I'm ready.

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Great.

20 MR. MARCUCCI: Hi. Good evening. My name
21 is Mike Marcucci.

22 I'm a filmmaker. I've been working downtown
23 since 2004, filming the reconstruction of the World
24 Trade Center and it's been an absolute pleasure to
25 watch neighborhood transform into the lovely site

2 that it is. And personally, a thrill to document to
3 the great undertaking.

4 In 2012, I produced a documentary called
5 16 Acres. This chronicled the first ten years of
6 the rebuilding of the World Trade Center, so I've
7 had a front row seat to the rebuilding process and
8 it's been quite a -- quite a job. So I've been a
9 passionate viewer and really have a terrific
10 interest in what gets built, where it gets built and
11 when all these new buildings will be completed.

12 And so far I think through all of the
13 difficult battles and compromises, what has been
14 accomplished is truly a beautiful World Trade Center
15 site. And from what I see from the renderings, I
16 think 5 World Trade Center will make a beautiful
17 addition. I'm thrilled that its proposed mixed-use
18 residential building with a significant portion
19 dedicated to low and middle income housing. And I
20 really hope the affordable housing issue should get
21 settled soon, but I think this building needs to get
22 going so the site can be completed.

23 I'm also glad it will generate many
24 thousands of construction jobs. I think this is
25 really important and these troubled times with the

2 pandemic still upon us, workers deserve great
3 projects like this.

4 So just in summation, as a lifelong New
5 Yorker, I really look forward to seeing 5 World
6 Trade Center and the rest of the site completed.
7 Thank you.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

9 Our next speaker will be Luisa Colon.

10 Luisa Colon, if you were ready to speak you
11 may turn on your video and unmute your audio.

12 MS. COLON: Hi, thanks so much for having
13 me. I'm also a lifelong New Yorker, born and raised
14 in New York. And the World Trade Center site has
15 obviously undergone tremendous transformation over
16 my lifetime.

17 I also believe that affordable housing, any
18 amount is a huge win for the city. But I also think
19 that it makes far more sense to have a greater mix
20 of uses at the site in order to create a very
21 vibrant 24/7 community and also address the evolving
22 needs of Lower Manhattan. A building focused on
23 mixed-income housing will complement the office
24 towers, the Performing Arts Center, retail, memorial
25 and but it also reflects the transformation of Lower

2 Manhattan over the past 20 years.

3 I also think it's really important to note
4 that Lower Manhattan has a severe shortage of
5 affordable housing. The limited number of sites to
6 address this crisis. 5 World Trade Center by itself
7 would deliver five times the number of affordable
8 homes produced across all of Lower Manhattan in a
9 typical year. Do it without public subsidy and with
10 deep permanent affordability. Thank you.

11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
12 testimony.

13 Our next speaker will be Carol Lamberg.

14 Carol, if you are back with us I think we
15 may be able to get your testimony at this time.

16 MS. LAMBERG: Hey.

17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hi Carol Lamberg, if
18 that's you, you --

19 MS. LAMBERG: Am I doing okay?

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can hear you.

21 MS. LAMBERG: No, you didn't.

22 THE HEARING OFFICER: All right. There we
23 are. All right, Carol, if you could unmute
24 yourself. You're speaking but we can't hear you.

25 MS. LAMBERG: Okay. I'm on my iPad instead

2 of computer.

3 I'm Carol Lamberg. I've worked in the
4 affordable housing trade all my life starting in
5 college years. In 2002 I testified, advocating for
6 affordable housing as part of the World Trade Center
7 redevelopment. I'm pleased with the resolution to
8 allow residential use on Site 5. However, because
9 the design guidelines could add unnecessary cost, I
10 recommend eliminating the draft guidelines to allow
11 potential cost savings, creating a large, diverse
12 affordable building for low and moderate income
13 tenants in this high income neighborhood sends a
14 beautiful message to the world.

15 Special outreach to 911 survivors and first
16 responders would make this development a rare
17 opportunity for New Yorkers to say "yes, in my
18 backyard". We should seek funding that would not
19 deplete -- deplete the affordable housing
20 development pipeline and I hope we can really all
21 work together to achieve this goal and create such a
22 beautiful residential and appropriate development on
23 this site.

24 Thank you so much for the opportunities to
25 speak for putting up with my technical difficulties.

2 It's a -- the hearing is a pleasure so far too.

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
4 testimony.

5 So we'll now move to our second set of ten
6 speakers. I'll read all ten names. If you are
7 on -- if you hear your name or you see your name on
8 this list, you can assume you'll speak in about the
9 next half an hour.

10 The next ten speakers will be:

11 Mariama James;

12 Joe Woolhead;

13 Robert Marcucci;

14 Li Xiao;

15 Linda Roche;

16 Jill Goodkind;

17 Richard Leland;

18 Matt Kapp;

19 Victoria Hillstrom;

20 And Frank Hussey.

21 I believe out of that list, several people
22 are not -- are not present at this time. So if you
23 are a representative for one of the following folks
24 or if you are just joining us by phone, please email
25 help@publicworkspartners.com. That's also showing

2 at the bottom of the slide.

3 If you want to speak, if you are -- or want
4 for speak for: Mariama James, Li Xiao, Matt Kapp,
5 Frank Hussey.

6 If you are on the call you may also just
7 raise your hand.

8 So we'll go to the first person we know is
9 present, Joe Woolhead. Joe Woolhead, you may enable
10 your video and audio and get ready to speak.

11 MR. WOOLHEAD: Hello. Can you -- can you
12 hear me?

13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes.

14 MR. WOOLHEAD: Okay. Ladies and gentlemen,
15 can you see me as well?

16 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can't see you but
17 we can hear you.

18 MR. WOOLHEAD: Okay. The development of 5
19 World Trade Center as an affordable residential
20 building would be a massive win-win for the downtown
21 community.

22 5 World Trade Center will help to bring in
23 more people of diverse backgrounds to add to the
24 rich heritage of Lower Manhattan. And also to
25 continue the revitalization of the area, not only

2 after the 9/11 attacks but also the ongoing pandemic
3 which has heavily impacted everyone here.

4 I've worked as a photographer principally on
5 the World Trade Center for over 17 years and in that
6 time, I've seen many changes, mostly for the good.
7 Each new building downtown has only added to the
8 regeneration of Lower Manhattan. During these
9 pandemic times, I think it's important that 5 World
10 Trade Center is constructed so thousands of
11 tradespeople can be gainfully employed.

12 Each new building under construction
13 benefits the wider community too. Once the building
14 is complete, many more people will be able to enjoy
15 living downtown. I have seen Lower Manhattan go
16 from a terribly depressed area just after 9/11 to a
17 place of immense growth and opportunities for
18 everyone, either working, visiting or playing here.
19 It's critical that we stay focused and continue to
20 develop this area.

21 5 WTC is a significant mixed-use development
22 for this community. I would like to see the
23 downtown area thrive and be a beacon of hope for the
24 rest of America and the world.

25 Thank you for giving me the opportunity to

2 speak on this matter.

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
4 testimony.

5 Our next speaker will be Robert Marcucci.

6 MR. MARCUCCI: Can you hear me?

7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes. We can hear you.

8 MR. MARCUCCI: Hi. Thank you. Sorry the
9 video at the moment.

10 But I just wanted to say that I am a
11 consultant and I have been a fixture in the Downtown
12 Manhattan WTC neighborhood for the last 14 years as
13 a creative producer. I have had a hands-on
14 experience in the growth of this area as a
15 videographer and marketing associate, meeting
16 thousands of folks who have helped rebuild Lower
17 Manhattan, as well as guests ranging from family
18 community, film, TV and other entertainment
19 personalities over the years, helping to create a
20 new vibrant world in this neighborhood.

21 This is a tremendous accomplishment so far I
22 think, this continually growing part of the city.
23 There's a beautiful growth of spirit and energy that
24 has given me optimism and joy, seeing how everyone
25 is becoming part of an exciting new period in

2 history.

3 The idea of a new WTC 5 building being
4 residential with affordable housing could not be a
5 better suited addition to this city and in
6 particular this neighborhood. The cultural benefits
7 and response to this would be immense, I believe.
8 The notion of having a more diverse community
9 strength can only strengthen the optimism and newly
10 seen beauty of the neighborhood and would be a role
11 model for other communities I feel.

12 I have been in the -- I've been in the new
13 WTC building for many years, and have so enjoyed
14 felt blessed to work in such gold LEED standard
15 conditions and feel other diverse groups should also
16 have this wonderful experience as well. I have
17 worked closely with the creative forces who have
18 helped build these brilliant structures.

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: I'm sorry, I believe
20 you may have accidentally gone on mute. You're
21 back.

22 MR. MARCUCCI: I said I believe I left off I
23 have worked closely with the creative forces who
24 have helped build these brilliant structures and I
25 feel quite confident that WTC 5 will be just as

2 wonderful. And that's it.

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
4 testimony.

5 Our next speaker will be Linda Roche.

6 Linda Roche, if you are here and ready to
7 begin, you may turn on your video and audio.

8 MR. ROCHE: Yes. Hi. Thank you for the
9 opportunity to speak. My name is Linda Roche. I'm
10 a 43-year resident of the Financial District and a
11 survivor of 9/11, having worked and been at said 7
12 World Trade Center on the morning of September 11th.

13 I wanted to add my voice to the community at
14 large asking for 100 percent affordable housing. I
15 mean, how often do you hear a community advocating
16 for 100 percent affordable housing in a building
17 this size, it's unusual but the -- but the community
18 feels that this is a very necessary addition to the
19 community. We do not have a lot of affordable
20 housing.

21 On my side of the town by the Seaport,
22 Howard Hughes wants to build a mega tower and offer
23 a few affordable housing to actually get his
24 proposal through. This is a different story. This
25 is an opportunity for the people of Lower Manhattan

2 and the survivors of 9/11, their children, the first
3 responders to be given a seat that they might be
4 able to live and enjoy Lower Manhattan as I have for
5 43 years.

6 So I would urge the people at large who are
7 determining this to actually think very carefully
8 about giving the building more affordable housing.
9 And if on the occasion that it doesn't work out that
10 way that they don't get full affordable housing,
11 that the people who are in the affordable housing
12 units get full use of any amenities that are put
13 into the building and they are not shut out like the
14 paupers.

15 I honestly think that this is an opportunity
16 that should not be missed. LMDC I think should be
17 really working with the community and making this
18 happen. So I appreciate you letting me speak and
19 thank you very much.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much
21 for your testimony.

22 Our next speaker will be Jill Goodkind.

23 Jill Goodkind, if you are present and ready
24 to speak, you may turn on your video and audio.

25 MS. GOODKIND: Okay. I'm going to be just

2 audio because my video is --

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: No problem.

4 MS. GOODKIND: So my name is Jill Goodkind
5 and many of you know my late husband, Tom, who died
6 from 9/11 cancer.

7 Tom advocated for over a decade to make 5
8 World Trade Center 100 percent affordable. I'm
9 requesting the currently proposed design guidelines
10 be removed from the plan modification proposal. And
11 the Board's determination be solely on the
12 modification to make the proposed building
13 residential. The mandatory design guidelines LMDC
14 is proposing lock-in high cost design requirements
15 like rounded glassy corners and they'll be locked in
16 for any building built at the site.

17 There is no reason to include those
18 restricted mandatory guidelines in the plan to make
19 the building residential, and especially not at this
20 time. Lower Manhattan's losing its limited stock of
21 affordable apartments, it's at an astonishing rate.
22 And yet, LMDC and Port Authority seem determined to
23 make this a majority luxury building.

24 However, 5 World Trade Center can bring
25 1,300 units of desperately needed affordable housing

2 to the area. We need a building that houses New
3 Yorkers from the very lowest incomes to moderate
4 housing that's inclusive, that represents the
5 diversity of our entire city, that includes deeply
6 affordability, housing for essential workers, for
7 single-parent families, and importantly housing for
8 9/11 survivors and first responders.

9 Since 9/11, billions of our tax dollars and
10 benefits meant to rebuild this community were used
11 by the developers to create a glut of high price new
12 buildings. The LMDC itself received over
13 2.8 billion in housing and urban development funds.

14 Let's put something good there. Something
15 that celebrates life and will stand as a symbol of
16 our value as place where New Yorkers from all walks
17 of life, all races and identities who make this city
18 what it is can afford to live. Not another unneeded
19 tower for the wealthy. Public land for public good.
20 Thank you.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
22 testimony.

23 Our next speaker will be Richard Leland.

24 Richard Leland, if you're ready to speak you
25 may turn on your video and unmute your audio.

2 MR. LELAND: I'm ready. I don't see my
3 video.

4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yep. We can see you.

5 MR. LELAND: Okay. Good evening, I'm
6 Richard Leland of Akerman LLP and I represent the
7 owner of Club Quarters World Trade Center Hotel and
8 the World Center Hotel which are located at 143 Port
9 Washington Street across the street from Site 5.

10 On behalf of our client (indecipherable)
11 LMDC for providing this opportunity to speak this
12 evening. Our client also thanks the LMDC and ESD
13 for the hard work that they have done -- they have
14 done and continue to do to develop the World Trade
15 Center site in Lower Manhattan as a destination for
16 New Yorkers and (indecipherable) to visit.

17 Our client has had a long and deep
18 commitment to the economic and cultural development
19 of Lower Manhattan, particularly the areas within
20 the adjoining World Trade Center. Our clients
21 signed contract (indecipherable) for the hotels just
22 prior to the 9/11 terrorist attacks.

23 The building was substantially destroyed,
24 yet our client retained its space in Lower Manhattan
25 and elected to enter into the ground lease and

2 progress and development of the -- and proceeded
3 with the development of the site in 2003.

4 Due to the delays in rebuilding in part due
5 to environmental conditions at the World Trade
6 Center site, the hotels weren't open until 2010 at
7 considerable additional expense for our client.

8 The entrance to the hotel was -- had a total
9 of 421 rooms, it was initially planned to be on
10 Cedar Street but due to the placement of the
11 retaining wall for the Liberty Park and the siding
12 vehicular security center below the park, the
13 entrance was moved to Washington Street, directly
14 across from the proposed placement of the loading
15 dock (indecipherable) and the loading dock for Site
16 5.

17 Our client supports the site appropriate
18 redevelopment of Site 5 and recognizes the market
19 factor that drive the desire to develop Site 5 with
20 a mixed use rather than another large office
21 building. However, it is concerned about the
22 placement the loading dock in close proximity to the
23 entrance of the hotel that creates a serious
24 potential for safety issues and conflicts between
25 trucks moving in and out of the loading dock, cars,

2 taxis and pedestrians entering the hotel.

3 Washington Street is a narrow street and
4 trucks backing into the loading dock have a
5 potential to block traffic and interfere with guests
6 entering and leaving the hotels. Moreover, our
7 client concerned about the potential noise impacts
8 to guests caused by truck movement and about
9 potential odor and emission impacts from the
10 mechanical equipment (indecipherable) to be located
11 on the third floor of the building facing the hotel.

12 These concerns do not appear to have been
13 adequately addressed in the environment assessment
14 and require further analysis. As well as an
15 analysis to consider alternative locations for the
16 loading dock.

17 Thank you for your time and attention and we
18 will be submitting further written statements prior
19 to the close of the comment period on February 15th.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
21 testimony.

22 Our next speaker will be Matt Kapp.

23 Matt Kapp. If you are ready to speak, you
24 may turn on your video and audio.

25 MR. KAPP: Thank you. Thank you for having

2 me. Can you hear me?

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes.

4 MR. KAPP: Hi. This is Matt Kapp. I'm the
5 coproducer and writer of the documentary 16 Acres
6 which covered the struggle to rebuild Ground Zero in
7 the decade after 9/11. And I recently wrote a
8 historical book called the Century Downtown which
9 tells a 100-year history of about 1922 to 2022.

10 So I am going to be very brief and I've
11 studied Lower Manhattan for years now, been a part
12 of it and there's just a few things that I want to
13 point out, that the residential population has more
14 than tripled since 9/11. That's extraordinary
15 change down there.

16 And even before COVID, nearly 30 percent of
17 people lived downtown, also worked downtown. And
18 that's one of the highest work/live ratios in the
19 country. So it really is an extraordinary,
20 sustainable mixed-use neighborhood. And the key to
21 that is having a sizable residential population.
22 And whatever we can do to keep going in that
23 direction I think is important.

24 And that's really all I wanted to say. I
25 would hate to go back to the days when it was just

2 the Financial District when it cleared out after
3 5:00 p.m. and you could roll a bowling ball down
4 Broadway. That was -- that seemed like such a waste
5 of this crown jewel of this great city of ours. And
6 I will leave it at that. Thank you very much.

7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
8 testimony.

9 Our -- one moment please. Our next speaker
10 will be Victor Hillstrom.

11 Victoria Hillstrom, you may turn on your
12 video and audio and let us know when you're ready to
13 speak.

14 MS. HILLSTROM: Hello.

15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hello. We can hear
16 you.

17 MS. HILLSTROM: Thank you very much for
18 having me. My name is Victoria Hillstrom. We have
19 been residents of Lower Manhattan at 385 Greenwich
20 A/K/A 71 North Moore, both buildings combined floors
21 2, 3 and 4 since 1982. Our lofts were the cutoff on
22 9/11 and of course none of us will ever forget the
23 tanks rolling down the street.

24 Our wonderful neighbor Robert DeNiro was the
25 only one with generators, feeding our first

2 responders while our first responders lined West
3 Side Highway, waiting to recover people that never
4 came out of those buildings alive.

5 We made a promise to our first responders on
6 9/11 that we would never forget. And while although
7 I have much respect for Larry Silverstein, I'm
8 certain that Brookfield would like to be good
9 neighbors, we absolutely demand that these buildings
10 are 100 percent affordable.

11 First and foremost, the Deutsche Bank
12 Building was destroyed by fire and a number of
13 firemen died in those buildings over the DOB's
14 negligence, very similar to the fires in the Bronx
15 over the weekend. Moreover, this building was
16 brought by HUD and whatever little d/l memo that
17 Michael Bloomberg signed, Michael Bloomberg can take
18 out his checkbook and satisfy the Port Authority.

19 I am very dear friends with Ron Perelman and
20 Dr. Anna Chapman that they are working on one of the
21 buildings in 5 World Trade. This is public land,
22 those terrorists took aim at our homes on 9/11.
23 They sought to compromise everything we believe in
24 in this country and one of those things is our
25 ability to live and work in Lower Manhattan

2 affordable.

3 I'm also a designer and I have designed
4 prototypes for fairly many famous luxury stores.
5 There is absolutely no reason that this building
6 would even be mixed-use retail, our malls,
7 Brookfield, Columbus Circle, Hudson Yards our -- to
8 be -- there's no nice way to say it, they're an
9 absolute abortion. Our retail has been closed one
10 by one. We want this building to be 100 percent
11 affordable housing.

12 We are willing to go to the president. We
13 are certainly willing to look to HUD. We ask that
14 these carve-outs or whatever restrictions that
15 they're trying to cast to satisfy Larry Silverstein.
16 Mr. Silverstein got \$3 billion dollars, as I recall.
17 We had \$40 billion to rebuild Lower Manhattan after
18 9/11. The money went to the Bank One, it went to
19 rebuild the New York Times, it went to everything
20 but Lower Manhattan. Very little money stayed in
21 Lower Manhattan. We made a promise on 9/11 that we
22 would never forget.

23 And to the residents of Lower Manhattan --

24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
25 testimony. I'm sorry, you exceeded your time

2 allotment so please feel free to submit your
3 comments also in writing to the -- to the ESD and
4 the LMDC.

5 So at this time it is 6:30 which is halfway
6 through our planned public hearing. We are going to
7 take a brief ten-minute break to give our ASLs,
8 interpreters and stenographers a moment to rest.

9 At this time I will -- I'm going to read out
10 the list of the next ten speakers. If you are -- if
11 you see your name or you hear your name on this
12 list, you'll know that you will be in the group that
13 will speak immediately after our ten-minute break.

14 So those names are:

15 Charlie Samboy;

16 Reggie Thomas;

17 Lucy West;

18 Mark Murphy;

19 David Stanke;

20 Henry Gibson;

21 Todd Fine;

22 Emily Hellstrom;

23 Adrienne Sosin;

24 And Sarah Cassell.

25 So we are now going to take that brief

2 ten-minute recess and we will reconvene at 6:40 p.m.

3 We can start the ten-minute clock now and at that
4 time, the list -- that list of speakers that I just
5 read out will be the first speakers to provide their
6 testimony.

7 So thank you for your patience. We'll see
8 you at 6:40 p.m.

9 Whereupon, a short break was
10 taken.

11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Welcome back to the
12 World Trade Center Site 5 public hearing. Thank you
13 so much for your patience during a brief break and I
14 believe that our first speaker post-break -- I'm
15 going to briefly read through the list before we
16 begin.

17 The first speaker will be:

18 Charlie Samboy;

19 Reggie Thomas;

20 Lucy West;

21 Mark Murphy;

22 David Stanke;

23 Henry Gibson;

24 Todd Fine;

25 Emily Hellstrom;

2 Adrienne Sosin;

3 And Sarah Cassell.

4 I believe that about three of these
5 registered speakers are not -- are not visible so if
6 you are -- are speaking on behalf of Lucy West,
7 Henry Gibson or Adrian Sosin, please raise your hand
8 or send an email to help@publicworkspartners.com so
9 that we make sure to call on you.

10 All right, Charlie Samboy. Thank you so
11 much for your patience. We're ready for you when
12 you're ready.

13 MR. SAMBOY: Thank you, Celeste. Good
14 afternoon everyone. Thank you to ESD for providing
15 us this opportunity to testify. My name is Charlie
16 Samboy. I am Director of Government Affairs at the
17 New York Building Congress. The Building Congress
18 is comprised more than 550 organizations and 250,000
19 skilled professionals across the building industry.

20 We see to promote the economic and social
21 advancement of our city and its residents and as
22 such we support the redevelopment of World Trade
23 Center 5, and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan
24 to the proposed amendments to the GPP.

25 New York will never reach its fullest

2 potential until we have 24-hour neighborhoods across
3 the five boroughs that diversify communities,
4 integrate affordable housing and connect residents
5 with all the wonderful amenities that our city has
6 to offer.

7 It's in the best interest of all New Yorkers
8 that we explore all avenues to bring permanent
9 affordability on publicly-owned sites such as this
10 and we are proud to support this amended GPP.

11 Lower Manhattan has seen a tremendous
12 recovery following the tragic events of 9/11, the
13 economic growth and vitality of the neighborhood has
14 defied all odds and has shown that New York has a
15 capacity to overcome even the most challenging of
16 circumstances.

17 However, over the last two decades, the
18 community has also lost a considerable number of
19 affordable housing units due to the privatization of
20 co-op buildings and many buildings leaving the
21 affordability programs once they expire.

22 World Trade Center 5 is an opportunity to
23 deliver on Lower Manhattan's dire need for new
24 residential units that will implement the growth of
25 the neighborhood and its attractiveness for

2 families. The development of 1,200 of units of
3 housing including 300 that will be permanently
4 affordable. We can help make Lower Manhattan a
5 truly mixed-use district and one that supports small
6 businesses that depend on a steady flow of
7 pedestrians, something that has been a challenge
8 throughout the COVID-19 pandemic.

9 Additionally, the Building Congress supports
10 the need for investing in construction and projects
11 and policies that fuel the city and state's
12 economies. Building is one of the best ways to get
13 out of the economic crisis, accelerating our
14 recovery and employ thousands of workers.

15 This project will -- is estimated to create
16 10,000 construction jobs generating 1.9 billion in
17 economic output during the construction phase alone
18 and 1,900 permanent jobs upon completion. These are
19 jobs that have the capacity to elevate families and
20 gainfully employ those effected by the economic
21 crisis.

22 In closing, developing sorely-needed
23 affordable housing in a sustainable and
24 energy-efficient way while providing community
25 facilities will complement the World Trade Center

2 campus and the broader neighborhood tremendously.
3 All of this can be achieved through this revised GPP
4 presented here today by Silverstein, Brookfield,
5 Omni and their partners.

6 We applaud them for their vision to create a
7 world-class mixed-use residential project that is
8 critical to New York's future and we ask that the
9 ESD to invest in our state's economic success by
10 approving this GPP. Thank you.

11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
12 testimony.

13 Our next speaker will be Reggie Thomas.

14 And Reggie, I believe you can unmute
15 yourself and begin when you're ready.

16 MR. THOMAS: Great. Thank you. My name is
17 Reggie Thomas and I serve as the senior vice
18 president for government affairs at the Real Estate
19 Board of New York, the city's leading real estate
20 trade association which represents commercial,
21 residential and institutional property owners,
22 builders, managers, investors and other
23 organizations that are active in New York City real
24 estate.

25 Thank you again for the opportunity to

2 testify this evening. It's clear we have a housing
3 crisis in New York with increasing rates of
4 homelessness, overcrowded households and few
5 available affordable options.

6 According the most recent U.S. Census from
7 2010 to 2020 the number of New York City residents
8 grew by roughly 630,000 people but we only created
9 enough housing for 206,000. Lower Manhattan is a
10 vibrant neighborhood with great access to jobs,
11 transit, parks and schools but housing is so
12 critical for the community.

13 To put in context in terms of New York City,
14 New York City's housing production lags behind 17
15 other major metropolitan areas throughout the U.S.
16 including Seattle, Boston, San Francisco and
17 Los Angeles. By every tracked measure New York
18 needs more housing but especially housing for our
19 most vulnerable.

20 Over the last 20 years, Lower Manhattan has
21 lost affordable units cooperative buildings and
22 rental complexes (indecipherable). The max of
23 construction replacement affordable units in this
24 neighborhood is challenging with restrictions to
25 residential density, high land values, and labor

2 costs all contribute.

3 That's why the opportunity here at 5 World
4 Trade Center is so important. If the project plan
5 is amended to permit residential use, a mixed-use
6 building here will deliver approximately 1,200
7 residential rental apartments, of which 300 will be
8 permanently affordable. With finite public dollars
9 available and limits on and bonds and tax credits
10 for affordable housing from the federal government,
11 (indecipherable) development team will deliver these
12 necessarily units without public subsidies with
13 permanent affordability.

14 The development will also play a critical
15 role in the city's recovery from the pandemic as
16 noted by many other speakers before is thousands of
17 construction jobs as well as the permanent jobs that
18 can emanate from this project is so critical as we
19 rebound from the pandemic. Accordingly, it will
20 also maximize revenue from the public, including the
21 Port Authority which has invested hundreds of
22 millions dollars already in the Trade Center site.

23 Lower Manhattan is successful live, work,
24 play neighborhood. It is appropriate that the new
25 development that has significance square footage to

2 the neighborhood and the special campus continue
3 that spirit. The new housing, the development and
4 the completion of the World Trade Center campus and
5 new community services the project add are exciting,
6 important and appropriate changes to the project.
7 Thank you.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
9 testimony.

10 Our next speaker will be Mark Murphy.

11 Mark Murphy, you may enable your video and
12 audio get ready to speak.

13 MR. MURPHY: Hi. How are you, Celeste?

14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Good, thank you.

15 MR. MURPHY: I don't know if you can see me.
16 I have no idea.

17 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can see you and
18 hear you.

19 MR. MURPHY: I'm Mark Murphy and I'm a long
20 time New Yorker and community advocate.

21 I lost my brother-in-law on 9/11 and
22 actually today is his birthday so we all say a
23 prayer for him. My father was a member of Congress,
24 Jack Murphy from Lower Manhattan for a decade, a
25 proud progressive who funded the infrastructure so

2 that we could have what is today Battery Park and
3 World Trade Center.

4 I have worked downtown in the World
5 Financial Center and know firsthand how important
6 this hub is to the economy of New York City and to
7 the United States.

8 And yes, New York's housing crisis requires
9 more housing in all boroughs at all price points.
10 And 5 World Trade Center will also provide needed
11 market rate housing in communities and public
12 amenity spaces, helping complete the exciting and
13 needed revitalization of the World Trade Center and
14 Lower Manhattan. The development will also play a
15 critical role in the city's recovery from this
16 pandemic.

17 It's projected to create 10,000 construction
18 jobs, union construction jobs, good-paying jobs with
19 protections and with pensions and close to 2,000
20 permanent jobs, generating close to \$1.9 down
21 billion in economic output. Importantly, it will
22 also maximize revenue for the public, including the
23 Port Authority which has invested hundreds of
24 millions of dollars in rebuilding the Trade Center
25 site. Our dollars have been reinvested. We need

2 these mixed use -- these mixed-use buildings to be
3 built so that New York City can rover.

4 Again, thank you, Celeste, and thank you all
5 for taking the time to come tonight.

6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
7 testimony.

8 Our next speaker will be David Stanke or
9 Stanky. Apologies for pronunciation.

10 David, if you are ready to speak, you may
11 enable your audio and video.

12 Hi, we can hear you and you're not on mute.

13 MR. STANKE: Very good. Thank you for the
14 opportunity to speak today. I am David Stanke.

15 I have lived -- I lived since around 2000 on
16 Liberty Street, the block just between the proposed
17 new building and World Trade Center 4, so right in
18 that corner.

19 We rebuilt our building and our block got
20 put back together and I have watched very carefully
21 all of the development of the World Trade Center
22 ever since. And while it is doing quite well now,
23 and I think it's a beautiful development, it's --
24 you know, very -- it's a great place to live, it's a
25 great place to work and to be around. I have -- it

2 has taken a long time to get there and I think there
3 were a number of mistakes that have been made in the
4 path to getting there.

5 As a part of the community, I must also say
6 that we got down to a very small number of people
7 and it was a balanced community of people of various
8 economic backgrounds and I think it was a tight
9 community and I think we benefited from having a
10 diverse community through those tougher years.

11 And I look forward to the opportunity to
12 continue to develop housing that is appropriate for
13 all income levels and a range of people. So I would
14 have preferred that the commercial development
15 continued as planned but market realities were such
16 that it makes sense to convert World Trade Center 5
17 to a residential or multiuse building at this time,
18 and that makes complete sense given the current
19 economic conditions.

20 I think the other aspect of considering the
21 economic conditions that we had to look back at yet
22 though, there were many mistakes that were made.
23 Mistakes that were very costly, and the World Trade
24 Center development ended up being very expensive
25 development because many decisions were made not

2 based on financial reality but based upon sort of
3 emotional impulses. And managing costs at the site
4 has seriously damaged the Port Authority's economic
5 position. I know driving in and out of the toll
6 booth is hugely expensive, getting in and out of New
7 York now because money at the World Trade Center was
8 not managed as carefully as it should have been.

9 I think the World Trade Center site is an
10 ideal site to put market rate housing and I'm glad
11 that it's going to be mixed-use housing as in the
12 current plan, but it's very important that this
13 building as profitable -- maybe not as profitable as
14 we can make it, but it will be designed in a way
15 that meets the look and feel of the World Trade
16 Center site as it is. And that it is economically
17 available to the extent that it helps restore the
18 financial stability of the Port Authority.

19 So I think that the plan with the housing as
20 specified, seems to be a very good plan that will
21 both balance the design of the site, the location of
22 the residential is extraordinarily good. I think,
23 you know, between Liberty and Cedar Street there is
24 joining other residential buildings in the area and
25 I look forward to seeing it get built sooner rather

2 than later. Because --

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

4 MR. STANKE: We have been very, very
5 delayed.

6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you. You've
7 gone a little past your three minutes, so if you'd
8 like to submit additional testimony you may do so
9 via email or mail. Thank you very much.

10 Our next speaker will be Todd Fine.

11 Todd Fine, you may unmute yourself. Yep,
12 there you go. You may speak when you're ready.

13 MR. FINE: Hi. Yes.

14 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can hear you.

15 MR. FINE: I'm Todd Fine. I'm a member of
16 the Coalition for 100 Percent Affordable 5 World
17 Trade Center. Now, the premise of this meeting
18 tonight was supposed to be a discussion of the
19 environmental impact findings and the General
20 Project Plan modifications. And obviously it's
21 understandable that some members of the public would
22 like to talk about the specific plan especially in
23 terms of the guidelines.

24 But if I find it concerning that lobbyists
25 and your own developer, Larry Silverstein, sent

2 people to talk about the plan itself, directly
3 violating your instructions that they knew
4 beforehand and that were announced tonight,
5 sometimes even with overlapping language.

6 We even began with Howard Hughes
7 Corporation, a Texas company who has received
8 unimaginable public subsidies, who now wants to tell
9 New York City how it should spend its Howard --
10 housing subsidies. Which is interesting because the
11 lobbyist effort tonight, is directly the Howard
12 Hughes plan, 250 Water Street. Lots of lobbyist
13 groups, REBNY groups and but also most importantly,
14 Astroturf people. There were many people who spoke
15 tonight who were actually directly paid by Larry
16 Silverstein who did not announce this.

17 Mark Marcucci had a film that was funded by
18 Silverstein, was not disclosed.

19 Jenny Chao is thanked by Matt Kapp with a
20 group of other Silverstein employees in the
21 introduction to his book about Downtown Manhattan.

22 Joe Woolhead directly does photography for
23 Larry Silverstein and for the 9/11 Museum.

24 Luisa Colon was a consultant to Silverstein
25 Properties.

2 And Mark Marcucci was a consultant for Larry
3 Silverstein.

4 This use of distorting this public form is
5 questionably even legal, but it definitely is a
6 disrespect to all of the government agencies
7 involved; LMDC the ESD. They should not have their
8 meetings that are supports to engage the public and
9 get sincere input distorted by lobbyists and
10 Astroturf supported by Larry Silverstein.

11 It should -- this should cause people to
12 stop this deal and don't go down this path of having
13 a manipulated public process. Larry Silverstein has
14 infinite time to discuss with you his feelings about
15 it. We also don't need lobbyists generally to tell
16 us about the economic benefits of a plan that
17 they -- that isn't the subject.

18 We also had an entity like the 9/11
19 Performing Arts Center which did not disclose that
20 if this land is concluded, they would get fee
21 interest to their site without -- with -- as a
22 function of that, that wasn't even mentioned.

23 So I want to say, you know, what we need
24 from ESD is not to talk to these developers, not to
25 let the developers take over the conversation and

2 manipulate the public process but have the working
3 sessions that have been asked for by all the elected
4 officials and the real members of the community for
5 the last year.

6 But somehow, the developers were able to
7 manipulate this to get to the top of the list and
8 it's an insult to all the government agencies, and I
9 hope you will sanction them. Thank you.

10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much
11 for your testimony. Our next speaker will be Emily
12 Hellstrom. I believe Emily Hellstrom had turned on
13 her video a moment ago.

14 MS. HELLSTROM: Sorry. I'm outside and of
15 course I'm right by Pier 40 and there is a fire
16 truck going by. I don't know if you can hear me.

17 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can hear you. You
18 may go ahead and give your testimony. No problem.

19 MS. HELLSTROM: Thank you so much. Well, I
20 think it is fitting actually that I'm at my
21 daughter's softball practice, which is at Pier 40, a
22 piece of public land that is being used by the
23 public for the betterment of our communities. And I
24 believe that the same thing needs to happen at 5
25 World Trade Center.

2 There is something that is going on
3 throughout our city that is really -- something that
4 has been going on for many years which is the
5 private/public partnership and as very well
6 journaled in the Journal of Urban Affairs by Sandra
7 Guinand, the rearranging of public/private
8 partnerships has happened over the years such that
9 the public part of the deal has been completely
10 subverted. Over time this degrades and basically
11 what happens is once our public land is gone, it is
12 gone.

13 And we have seen that in Lower Manhattan,
14 obviously we needed to have a huge amount of
15 economic drivers come in and jump start our economy
16 after 9/11. However, unfortunately, we have found
17 that site after site went without real affordable
18 housing being given back to our community as was
19 promised, as Jill Goodkind so rightly said and her
20 husband championed that affordable housing was in
21 the original plan and we are now down to the last
22 site and it is unfortunate that the -- the Port
23 Authority is saying, well, we need the money.

24 However, there are ways. Budgets are all
25 about values and we should not be ceding public land

2 to private developers in order to reflect our
3 budgets. Private interests are not aligned with
4 public interests. So I urge you to not make any
5 decisions tonight that would preclude 100 percent
6 affordable housing or at the very least an enormous
7 amount far more than 25 percent of affordable
8 housing that was promised or sort of an entire area
9 that was promised to contain residential and
10 affordable housing.

11 So and I will concur with Todd Fine when he
12 says that it is deeply unfair to the public to have
13 people speaking in a sneaky way on behalf of the
14 developer.

15 And thank you so much and thank you for
16 holding public hearings. They're very, very
17 important. They're the bedrock of our democracy and
18 of founding our nation so I don't say that lightly.
19 Thank you so much.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much
21 for your testimony.

22 Our next speaker will be Adrienne Andi
23 Sosin.

24 I believe you joined us recently, Adrienne
25 Andi Sosin, if you are here.

2 MS. SOSIN: Am I on mute?

3 THE HEARING OFFICER: Nope, we can hear you.

4 MS. SOSIN: Good, okay. I am a long-term
5 downtown resident. I live in South Bridge Towers
6 and have lived there since 1976. I remember the
7 Trade Center being built and we were there during
8 9/11. My whole family lives in South Bridge, which
9 was affordable housing until it went private and
10 there -- it is still affordable housing. And the
11 people who live there may be sitting in, you know,
12 million dollar apartments but they are not rich.
13 And affordable housing is very needed in this city.

14 And 5 World Trade Center is a public
15 property, it should be dedicated to affordable
16 housing and that's the way I feel about it. And I
17 think that most people who live downtown want our --
18 want residents to be, you know, the regular middle
19 class people, not necessarily rich enough to afford
20 million dollar apartments and their upkeep.

21 So I am with Todd Fine on this -- on this
22 issue. Because I really feel like he has -- he
23 has -- has investigated and has learned what needs
24 to be -- done about -- about 5 World Trade Center
25 and I hope that this meeting gives -- gives impetus

2 to good government people who are not going to
3 knuckle under developers and do the kinds of
4 underhanded things that are being done around 250
5 Water Street.

6 Thank you very much for allowing me to
7 speak.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
9 testimony.

10 Our next speaker will be Sarah Cassell.

11 Sarah Cassell, you are -- if you would like
12 to -- I see you coming on. You can also unmute
13 yourself and speak when you're ready.

14 MS. CASSELL: Hey. Can you hear me?

15 THE HEARING OFFICER: We can hear you but
16 your camera is not showing your face.

17 MS. CASSELL: That's okay. You don't need
18 to see me really.

19 I'm a longtime resident of Gateway Plaza and
20 a survivor of 9/11. With the reneging of the
21 Gateway Plaza rent controls, my family will very
22 likely be priced out of the neighborhood. A World
23 Trade Center 5 with affordable housing targeted to
24 survivors and rescuers maybe, possibly we can stay
25 in the area. Also having raised our child in

2 Battery Park City, we recognize that the play space
3 available with the increase of population in FiDi in
4 the area is ever decreasing. Few opportunities for
5 competitive athletics, a prime college application
6 driver are available without full-sized gyms for
7 practice and games. Please include a full-size gym
8 for neighborhood school use in the community space.

9 And yes, go Todd Fine, go Jill Goodkind.
10 And thanks everyone. Good night.

11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
12 testimony. We'll now move to our next set of
13 speakers. I'll read the names. They are also
14 showing on your screen now. These I believe are
15 mostly folks who raised their hands since they've
16 been on the call and were not preregistered.

17 The list includes:

18 Justine Cuccia;

19 Michael Robinson Cohen;

20 Alex Cuccia;

21 Nicholas Kemper;

22 Mariann Riedel;

23 The phone number that begins with 1971 and
24 ends with 690;

25 Finley Hunt;

2 And Esther Regelson.

3 Once this group of people has the
4 opportunity to speak, if there is time we will then
5 open up for -- if anyone would like to -- anyone
6 more would like to speak or would like to speak
7 again.

8 On this list, I believe Mariann Riedel is
9 not present. If you are Mariann Riedel or are
10 speaking on Mariann Riedel's behalf, please raise
11 your hand or email help@publicworkspartners.com to
12 let us know that you're present.

13 And so with that, we'll move on to Justine
14 Cuccia.

15 You may enable your video and audio to
16 speak.

17 MS. CUCCIA: Okay. I think I was able to do
18 both but we'll see.

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yeah. We can see you
20 and hear you.

21 MS. CUCCIA: All right. Sounds good. Good
22 evening, and let me begin by thanking LMDC and ESD
23 for having this forum. My name is Justine Cuccia
24 and I'm a member of the Coalition for 100 Percent
25 Affordable at 5 World Trade Center. I'm also a

2 September 11th survivor who has beaten two cancers
3 caused by exposure to toxic debris on that day.

4 I want to emphasize a few points here:
5 First, 100 percent affordability is an achievable
6 goal based on ample precedent. Consider just one
7 example among many, Manhattan Plaza and Hell's
8 Kitchen. With 1,689 mixed affordable income units.
9 It has proved to be financially successful and
10 socially sustainable since the mid-1970s.

11 Second, while I urge you to adopt the
12 guidelines language that enables mixed-use
13 residential development at this site, I recommend in
14 the strongest possible terms that you change the use
15 of the word "shall" to "may." Language that is
16 permissible -- permissive rather than help create
17 100 percent affordability at this site.

18 Third, our coalition defines affordability
19 and its integration of mixed -- mixed income, low,
20 moderate, middle, upper-middle income tenants with a
21 preference given to 9/11 survivors, their children
22 and seniors. I want to say that this is a
23 diverse -- a diverse group of people from all Lower
24 Manhattan neighborhoods as well as first responders
25 and their families.

2 What Lower Manhattan needs is more
3 diversity, socioeconomic as well as racial. The
4 coalition's plan goes a long way to achieving that.
5 What Lower Manhattan doesn't need is more luxury
6 apartments. Especially, as so many newly built
7 units remain vacant.

8 As Chris Marte, a city counsel member said
9 earlier, Lower Manhattan is a transit-rich
10 neighborhood with schools and green space. We need
11 to bring in residents who will be part of the
12 community, and not those for whom 5 World Trade
13 Center will be a pied-à-terre or part-time home and
14 the fact that public money is being used to build
15 luxury homes, it's just not acceptable.

16 Going back to the mixed-use residential in
17 the guidelines. Our neighborhood needs a community
18 facility; part senior center, part gymnasium for the
19 schools. We need an affordable grocery store. We
20 need accessible medical facilities. These all could
21 contribute to the supporting -- financial supporting
22 the building but we need these things. The
23 dimensions set forth the guidelines give short
24 shrift to these elements in favor of what appears to
25 be a high-end expensive fitness facility.

2 I ask also that you revisit the
3 Environmental Impact Study to take into account
4 these needs in light of the current state of our
5 community. The last thing Lower Manhattan needs is
6 more luxury housing and more premium priced
7 amenities. We have enough.

8 Making 5 World Trade Center 100 percent
9 affordable will help ensure that the vibrancy,
10 stability and diversity of Lower Manhattan in
11 perpetuity. This is an opportunity to achieve
12 something that is not only essential but that is
13 exceptional. Our community and our city is owed
14 nothing less and the 9/11 survivors and their
15 families who came back to rebuild and renew Lower
16 Manhattan deserve nothing less. Thank you.

17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Excuse me. I had put
18 myself on mute. Thank you for your testimony.

19 Our next speaker will be Michael Robinson
20 Cohen.

21 And I believe you are ready to unmute and
22 begin when you're ready.

23 MR. COHEN: Great. Can you see me?

24 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes.

25 MR. COHEN: Hello. My name is Michael

2 Robinson Cohen and I'm an architect who lives and
3 works in Downtown Manhattan. And I'm a member of
4 the Architectural Collective City Group. I'm here
5 to stand with the Coalition for 100 Percent
6 Affordable 5 World Trade Center.

7 I support the designation of the building as
8 a mixed-use development, but the current 25 percent
9 affordable allotment is simply not enough. The last
10 thing the city needs is more market rate luxury
11 housing.

12 Currently, the city has a surplus of market
13 rate housing and many of those units remain in the
14 middle -- remain unoccupied in the middle of a
15 housing crisis. I also want to encourage the LMDC
16 to reject the proposed design guidelines. These
17 guidelines will make it very difficult to build an
18 affordable tower. And as an architect I believe we
19 need an inspiring design that is a symbol of the
20 city's commitment to housing all people.

21 We don't need another generic tower that
22 represents the power of real estate developers to
23 define the physical appearance of the city. Yes,
24 the cost of construction at this site will be
25 extremely expensive. But this should prevent the

2 construction of 100 percent affordable tower,
3 especially given the amount of public funds that
4 already been dedicated to this site and the
5 commitment to affordable housing in the original
6 plan.

7 Ultimately, the city is the city only when a
8 diverse of people live within it. Making this tower
9 100 percent affordable is a critical part of making
10 this city a place dignity for all people.

11 Thank you for giving me the time to make
12 this comment and holding this public hearing.

13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
14 testimony.

15 Our next speaker will be Alex Cuccia.

16 Alex Cuccia, if you are -- if you're ready
17 to begin, you may turn on your video and audio.

18 MR. CUCCIA: Cool. Can you all hear me?

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes, we can.

20 MR. CUCCIA: Cool. I'll leave my video off.

21 I'm not really anybody special or affiliated
22 with any organization. I'm just a concerned member
23 of the public that has heard about 100 percent
24 affordability -- or the 100 percent affordability
25 push for 5 World Trade Center.

2 I've lived pretty much the majority of my
3 life in Downtown Manhattan. I've seen firsthand how
4 these neighborhoods have become less affordable over
5 the past few decades. I'm lucky and grateful enough
6 to be able to personally afford living down here for
7 rising rent, the cost of living, all of that but not
8 everybody is.

9 So I want to go on record saying that I'm in
10 full support of 100 percent affordable 5 World Trade
11 Center. The proposed restrictive mix-used
12 guidelines for 5 World Trade should be withdrawn or
13 replaced with language that enshrines 100 percent
14 affordability.

15 It really makes no sense to me that we are
16 even discussing building more luxury apartments or
17 fancy retail spaces when so many luxury apartments
18 and so much retail space currently sits empty.
19 Yeah, it's kind of baffling.

20 Anyway, again going to be -- going on record
21 saying that 100 percent affordability for 5 World
22 Trade Center is really only the correct path forward
23 that I can see.

24 Yes, that's all I gotta say. Thank you.

25 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your

2 testimony.

3 And at this time we're going go back to
4 someone who had been absent earlier on the prior
5 list, Mariama James who I believe their name -- yes,
6 may not -- may not be quite right on the Zoom, but
7 if you could just state your name and affiliation
8 when you begin. You may begin when you're ready.

9 MS. JAMES: Hi, I'm Mariama James. I'm not
10 Carol Lamberg.

11 I would like to disclose that I am a member
12 of Community Board 1 here. I'm the co-chair of the
13 quality of life committee and I'm the treasurer of
14 Community Board 1, but I'm speaking behalf of
15 myself. I'm also a member of the 100 Percent
16 Affordable 5 World Trade Center Coalition, I'm one
17 of the cofounders.

18 And I'm a 9/11 survivor. My father passed
19 away from a 9/11-related disease in May of last
20 year. And my mother is stage 4 colon cancer, 9/11
21 related colon cancer survivor. So this is an issue
22 that is very personal to me. My mother worked at
23 Deutsche Bank ironically.

24 And I want to go on record with my friends,
25 neighbors and colleagues here asking you to please

2 wherever your guidelines refer to "shall" which we
3 were able to determine is basically a misnomer to
4 call them guidelines because "shall" means it's a
5 requirement in your guidelines.

6 To change everything from "shall" to "may",
7 if we're genuinely going to be fair and to allow
8 people the public comment through mid-February and
9 also to allow for any further affordability. Of
10 course, we want 100 percent but those guidelines are
11 really rigid and would make it impossible for
12 affordable housing to -- additional affordable
13 housing to exist in the space.

14 I also want to point out that the affordable
15 housing that would go in there currently, is like so
16 much more other affordable housing around, not just
17 the city, but the state, the nation not really
18 affordable to most. And census numbers show -- you
19 can look at the local numbers, you can look at the
20 city numbers, census numbers, show that the majority
21 of people of color cannot afford to move into these
22 neighborhoods, even with affordable housing as guys
23 refer to it or as AMI -- the HUD, you know,
24 determines based on AMI is affordable or the AMI
25 that you're using. And so what happens is that the

2 neighborhood becomes segregated, whether that's
3 intentional or accidental, that's the outcome. Like
4 public spaces, like public land is not supposed to
5 be segregated, you know, it's -- as of 1965, the
6 Civil Rights Act.

7 And so it's essentially discriminatory.
8 It's essentially red lining to create affordable
9 housing on public land that the majority of the
10 public can't afford, that they're automatically
11 locked out of. And that is what drives us, that is
12 what drives me wanting to have all those people that
13 were described earlier, the union guys, all the
14 jobs.

15 This would -- you make it affordable, it's
16 still going to create those same jobs. And so we
17 want them to not be able to have those jobs but to
18 be able to afford to live here. And not have to go
19 to an outer borough or across the water to another
20 state or something to go home where they can afford
21 to live.

22 We want people, teachers, you know, all
23 kinds of union people, office, restaurant workers,
24 delivery guys, all our essential workers that we
25 call them essential but then we just, you know, dump

2 them after they come and they serve us. We want
3 them to be able to afford to stay here.

4 We want 9/11 survivors who fought to rebuild
5 the neighborhood to make it even attractive enough
6 for somebody to want to build a luxury tower, we're
7 who did that. The people that remained here, the
8 people that were called back to this neighborhood
9 and worked to rebuild it are responsible for the
10 neighborhoods, how it is now, that it's so
11 attractive. And we want those people to be able to
12 afford to stay and to move in if they were never
13 able actually to, you know, get this close to the
14 district.

15 Because 911 survivors cover not only CB1 but
16 CB3 and they're completely locked out of this
17 conversation. Their incomes are completely locked
18 out of what the current standard is in the plan.

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much
20 for your testimony this evening.

21 And I just want to make sure that folks
22 know -- or just give a brief reminder that the
23 opportunity to sign up to speak will end at 7:30
24 which is in ten minutes. Before the end of the
25 public hearing which is scheduled for 8:00, although

2 we will go a bit past that if needed, if we still
3 have folks to sign up.

4 So if you would like to speak and you have
5 not yet spoken, please raise your hand or dial *9 on
6 your telephone key pad to let us know that you would
7 like to be added to the speaker list. And we
8 have -- we currently have about seven more people --
9 no, I'm sorry, about five more people on our list.
10 Next will be Nicholas Kemper.

11 Nicholas Kemper, if you are ready to speak
12 you may unmute and turn on your video.

13 MR. KEMPER: Hey. Hello. I'll be very
14 brief.

15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hello.

16 MR. KEMPER: Hi. You can hear me alright.
17 I'm the publisher of New York Review of Architecture
18 with the Architectural Club and Gallery Group and in
19 support of the Coalition for 100 Percent Affordable
20 WTC.

21 We actually made a public design call for
22 architects to propose possible designs for a 100
23 percent affordable tower. We have seen an
24 incredible amount enthusiasm for the call since we
25 posted it last Thursday, 112 teams from around the

2 world have registered. The deadline for submissions
3 is February 12th, at which point we'll be assembling
4 these designs and then submitting them as a public
5 comment before the period is over on February 15th.

6 We hope they can serve as a way to help open
7 up this important discussion and I hope the
8 community find a feasible and compelling path to
9 this important goal. That's all.

10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Great. Thank you for
11 your testimony.

12 Our next speaker was slated to be Mariann
13 Riedel, but I believe that Mariann Riedel is not
14 present. If you are Mariann Riedel or a
15 representative to speak for that person, please
16 email at us help@publicworkspartners.com to let us
17 know or raise your hand.

18 So our next speaker will be joining us by
19 phone at the phone number that begins with 917 and
20 ends with 690.

21 You may unmute yourself and let us know when
22 you're ready to begin.

23 If we have a participant on the -- in the
24 meeting who has the phone number 917 and then that
25 ends with 690, please let us know by un-muting

2 yourself and you may give your testimony.

3 (No response.)

4 Okay. With that, we will move on to our
5 next speaker. Our next registered speaker is Finley
6 Hunt.

7 Finley Hunt, if you'd like to unmute
8 yourself or turn on your video you may begin.

9 MR. HUNT: Yeah. Hi. Hi.

10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hi.

11 MR. HUNT: I was trying to start my video
12 but it looks like it's not working.

13 THE HEARING OFFICER: I'm sorry. We can
14 hear you fine.

15 MR. HUNT: My name is Finley Hunt. I'm a
16 retired -- I used to -- I'm a retired city worker.
17 I used to work for an agency called DCAS, and I was
18 a downtown resident back in the '80s, 474 Greenwich
19 Street. And then I was kind of priced out of the
20 neighborhood and I'm a friend of Jill Goodkind's and
21 a friend of the late Tom Goodkind's.

22 I just wanted to say I am a member of the
23 general public. I'm also a World Trade Center
24 survivor who worked in the Dinkins Municipal
25 Building during 9/11.

2 I wanted to say that I support the position
3 that site 5 of the World Trade Center should be 100
4 percent affordable housing. As public land, this
5 site should maximize public benefit. There's a
6 desperate need for affordable housing in this part
7 of Lower Manhattan. The immediate neighborhood has
8 become one of the most expensive and most segregated
9 parts of New York City.

10 The city and the state's focus on subsidized
11 luxury housing after September 11th, 2001 continue
12 to these unfortunate trends. Justice requires a
13 fully affordable building. The mixed-use design
14 guidelines proposed as part of this modification of
15 the General Project Plan make it more difficult for
16 an affordable tower to be built at the site. They
17 require expensive materials and a very particular
18 building envelope. They should be withdrawn or
19 remade.

20 While I agree that the General Project Plan
21 of the World Trade Center should be changed to allow
22 for residential building, there are also many
23 adverse socioeconomic and environmental impacts of
24 the current plan that should have been noted in the
25 environmental impact determinations. The

2 determination appears to go out of its way to not
3 engage seriously with the effects of luxury towers.

4 I think we need more affordable housing in
5 the city and I don't want to see more luxury housing
6 built. There's luxury housing going up all over
7 Manhattan and we have a severe lack of affordable
8 housing. And this neighborhood really needs
9 affordable housing. Thank you. Thank you.

10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Great. Thank you for
11 your testimony. We appreciate it.

12 And so then we have -- I believe one more
13 speaker whose name is on the list and an additional
14 list who has requested to speak. So the two
15 speakers we have on deck at this point are Esther
16 Regelson and then Maggie Dallal.

17 And so if you have not yet spoken but would
18 like the chance to provide testimony, please signal
19 your intent by 7:30 which is in less than five
20 minutes by raising your hand or -- or dialing *9 on
21 your telephone key pad.

22 So with that, we will move to our next
23 speaker, who is Esther Regelson.

24 Esther Regelson, if you're ready to speak,
25 you may unmute and turn on your video.

2 MS. REGELSON: Hello. I'll just do audio.
3 Can you hear me?

4 THE HEARING OFFICER: No problem. Yes, we
5 can.

6 MS. REGELSON: My name is Esther Regelson.
7 I live downtown, a block from the old Deutsche Bank
8 World Trade Center 5 site for almost 40 years and
9 I've seen a lot here.

10 I want to echo the sentiments of everyone
11 who spoke for 100 percent affordable housing and I
12 want to add that this neighborhood was destroyed
13 twice by two acts of eminent domain, one for the
14 Brooklyn Battery Tunnel and one for the World Trade
15 Center site. And it destroyed an immigrant blue
16 collar community and I believe that the powers that
17 be owe this community to give more affordable
18 housing to this neighborhood and bring back the
19 people who were forced to leave and priced out by
20 this sanitized version of Lower Manhattan that's
21 been created over the last 40 years.

22 I also want to point out that I watched a
23 fire occur at the Deutsche Bank Building on
24 August 18th in 2007. I went to many meetings with
25 the LMDC to tell them that they needed to demolish

2 the building properly and two firefighters, Robert
3 Beddia and Joseph Graffagino died on that day and I
4 would hope that if nothing else, that this building
5 be named for them.

6 And that it would honor their -- their lives
7 to have a 100 percent affordable housing here in
8 this neighborhood. Thank you.

9 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
10 testimony.

11 Our next speaker will be Maggie Dallal.

12 Maggie Dallal, if you'd like to unmute and
13 turn on your video you may provide your testimony.

14 MS. DALLAL: Thank you. I'm going to leave
15 my video off. I'm at basketball practice with my
16 daughter right now, actually at the Downtown
17 Community Center. I am a neighborhood resident, I
18 actually live on Washington Street and I can see the
19 lot from my bedroom window, so very close to home.

20 And there have been -- I'm not super well
21 informed on this issue. There have been a lot of
22 wonderful speakers that got up tonight, but I just
23 wanted to say as a community member that I am in
24 support of 100 percent affordable housing. And in
25 support of the work that Todd and Mariama and

2 Justine has done.

3 Justine made a good point about, you know
4 the -- you know, the luxury and the fitness centers.
5 You know, we're -- we're at a community center right
6 now, my daughter is able to play basketball here.
7 And there's so many other high-end fitness places
8 like Asphalt Green in the neighborhood that are
9 really expensive and don't cater to some of the
10 families that live down here.

11 Along with the affordable housing having
12 facilities that support the community would be
13 wonderful to see. And that's it. Thank you.

14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
15 testimony.

16 And so at this point we have reached the end
17 of our registered speakers and it is 7:30 p.m. We
18 will continue the public hearing until 8:00 and so
19 at this time we're going to take another short
20 ten-minute break.

21 But if anyone is on the call who would like
22 to speak again, even if you have already provided
23 testimony, you may raise your hand or email --
24 excuse me, email our email address at
25 help@publicworkspartners.com or dial *9 on your

2 phone and you may add your name to the list to speak
3 again.

4 So at this time it's 7:30. We can start the
5 ten-minute timer. We'll take another short recess
6 for ten minutes and then in our final 20 minutes
7 from 7:40 to 8:00 we will be able to take additional
8 speakers even if you have already spoken during this
9 hearing. Thank you and we will see you at 7:40.

10 Whereupon, a short break was
11 taken.

12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
13 patience during our brief break.

14 And I believe we have one -- we have a
15 speaker who has raised their hand and would like to
16 speak again, Todd Fine. You may unmute yourself and
17 turn on your video if you'd like and provide
18 testimony.

19 MR. FINE: Thank you.

20 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hi.

21 MR. FINE: Again, I'm Todd Fine with the
22 Coalition for 100 Percent Affordable 5 World Trade
23 Center and I had an original comment about these
24 guidelines but I was so shocked at the lobbyist
25 participation and this -- the people who did

2 disclose their affiliations with Silverstein that I
3 had to mention that, but I want to talk about the
4 design guidelines.

5 If you look back at the original design
6 guidelines for the Libeskind plan, you know, these
7 were pretty early on in the phase. They are quite
8 short, you know, sometimes they're just a few --
9 they're just a few paragraphs and they do have some
10 dimensions of a podium and what's on top of them.

11 But they're like for -- the actual building
12 envelope, they're just a couple of paragraphs. But
13 what you've done with this mixed-use design
14 guidelines is something entirely different. They go
15 into a new -- deviation from the Libeskind
16 guidelines, because if they do mention materials
17 talk about glass into masonry and glass.

18 So the fact you're deviating from them I
19 think indicates that you could deviate more. But
20 also they don't have the very specific dimensions of
21 a building. They're not written by the specific,
22 you know, architects or developers as is happening
23 here where you have the very specific envelope
24 mentioned.

25 And so it's a very different animal and it

2 raises me -- it raises questions about what is the
3 Libeskind plan at this point, you know, is the
4 Libeskind plan becoming something that is serving
5 Silverstein and Brookfield or is it actually
6 Libeskind's vision. And I wish we could involve
7 Libeskind into this process.

8 Because if you go back to the selection of
9 the Libeskind plan, it was really a moral statement.
10 I mean, even though we think of it as -- now we just
11 think of it as office buildings, but remember it was
12 a different building that Silverstein stopped him
13 from building, which was the Statue of Liberty. It
14 was a message about America, his love for America,
15 about freedom I guess.

16 You have this spiral downward and he was
17 trying to make things about light and a moral
18 statement in this plan. And I think if you look at
19 what has happened when Silverstein took over this
20 plan or even LMDC in general, it's become something
21 different.

22 And so this is really -- this opportunity is
23 a chance finally to redeem the Libeskind plan, to be
24 the symbol of immigration. Remember, that's what he
25 talked about, his story of being working class,

2 about how to bring America together, how to bring
3 New York together. How to find our highest values.

4 That was what architecture was asked to do
5 after 9/11 and we take this plan that has this
6 aesthetic art that they tried to do a message, even
7 in an imperfect way and we've turned it something
8 that was explicitly written by particular developers
9 to serve a kind of -- just a basic, you know, luxury
10 building.

11 And I think on 9/11 if you had told people
12 at those hearings, the Libeskind plan, we're going
13 to build a luxury residential, people would have
14 laughed at you.

15 So now's the chance to choose justice.
16 Reject these guidelines and do the right thing.
17 Thank you.

18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
19 testimony.

20 Our next speaker will be Gerald Forsburg.

21 Gerald Forsburg, you may enable your audio
22 and video and begin when you're ready.

23 MR. FORSBURG: Hi. Thanks. I'm going to
24 pass on the video this evening. Thank you. I just
25 wanted to state that, you know, this will be a great

2 addition to the community and I'm sure it will
3 provide many jobs and be a wonderful, wonderful
4 asset.

5 My concern, however, is indeed the
6 guidelines and I'd like to -- I should preface this
7 by saying that I'm on a community board but I'm here
8 speaking on behalf of myself, I'm a member of
9 Community Board 1.

10 But I just want to say in terms of the
11 guidelines, there's some very specific language
12 there, specifically that it talks about the
13 materials being glass, et cetera. I really think
14 that these guidelines need to be opened up and if
15 it's going to be a state-of-the-art facility, then
16 you know, state of the art in 2022 responds to
17 climate change, it responds to energy consumption.

18 You know, this structure needs to be -- if
19 it's going to be glass, it needs to be double
20 skinned, you know, superinsulated, energy producing,
21 net positive not only for the construction itself,
22 but also for the community. It needs to be net
23 positive in the community and 100 percent
24 affordable, you know, certainly seems like the way
25 to go on public land.

2 That's all I'm going to say for this
3 evening. I really appreciate you giving me the
4 opportunity to speak. Thank you.

5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
6 testimony.

7 Our next speaker will be Justine Cuccia.
8 Justine Cuccia, you may --

9 MS. CUCCIA: Yes, I'm here. Thank you. So
10 sorry.

11 Jumping back on again just because I want to
12 clarify. I should have said that I'm a member of
13 Community Board 1 and I am not speaking for
14 Community Board 1, I'm here as myself, as a member
15 of the community and also as a member of the
16 Coalition for 100 Percent Affordable at World Trade
17 Center.

18 And I misspoke spoke while I was talking.
19 Our definition of the people that we want preference
20 given to are 9/11 survivors, their families -- their
21 families, their children and that encompasses first
22 responders. We're looking for low and moderate and
23 middle income people to be coming into it, into 5
24 World Trade Center because we want it to be 100
25 affordable and seniors also.

2 But I wanted to be clear because I think I
3 misspoke so two things, identify myself and then
4 clarify the class of people we want to be given
5 preference. Thank you.

6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
7 testimony.

8 And our next speaker who has raised their
9 hand is Victoria Fariello.

10 Victoria Fariello. Yes, you may unmute and
11 begin when you're ready. We can see you.

12 MS. FARIELLO: Hi. So thank again for
13 holding this. I'm Victoria Fariello, I'm a district
14 leader downtown. I'm also a member of the Coalition
15 for 100 Percent Affordable 5 World Trade Center.
16 I'm also a 9/11 survivor and I have raised my family
17 here. I remember being pregnant with my third child
18 and waiting for the elevator at Liberty Street to
19 get across when they were doing construction.

20 So I know what it means to have construction
21 going on and I understand that people don't want a
22 delay. But I also understand that this is a one in
23 a lifetime and a century and it's a historical
24 moment.

25 And this is what we need, what we

2 desperately need downtown is affordability. And
3 while 300 -- any number of affordable housing units
4 are welcome, it's not enough. It is absolutely not
5 enough. We need to have at least the 1,200 that we
6 could get there and there are ways to do that and
7 that there are ways to do that and we just need
8 people to get on board with that.

9 So I think there's that and then I think I
10 have one more, one more -- so you know, public
11 subsidies are, you know, it is public money. So
12 this is -- it should be used for a public good. So
13 if we need to use funds, instead of giving tax
14 breaks to other developers to build what ended up
15 not being affordable, this is our opportunity to use
16 the tax money to actually provide the affordability
17 in our neighborhood, and in our district that
18 desperately needs it.

19 I just wanted to reiterate that and thank
20 you so much again for the hearing.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
22 testimony.

23 At this time we have no further speakers
24 signed up, but if anyone would like to raise their
25 hand to provide testimony, even if you've testified

2 already I know we still have -- let's see, it looks
3 like we have Taylor Banning has raised their hand.

4 Taylor Banning, if you would like to unmute
5 and enable your video you may go ahead and speak.

6 MS. BANNING: Thank you. Taylor Banning,
7 she/her.

8 Just wanted to add onto my testimony from
9 earlier that while 300 units of affordability is a
10 nice gesture, it is not enough and anymore
11 additional units of luxury will just add to the
12 already empty units of luxury right around Site 5.

13 And as someone has mentioned on this call, I
14 think it's been mentioned a few times we're in a
15 housing crisis from COVID, from issues of access to
16 jobs, inequity, we don't need any more empty luxury,
17 we don't need any more luxury built. And this is
18 really truly a chance to provide affordability which
19 is what we need.

20 So thank you. We want this to be
21 residential. We're calling for that. But the
22 guidelines cannot restrict the chance for more
23 affordable units built here. And have a good night.
24 Thank you all for staying on for so long. We hope
25 to continue engaging in this conversation.

2 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for your
3 testimony.

4 So our public hearing will end at 8:00 p.m.
5 which is in just under ten minutes. We welcome --
6 if anyone else would like to provide testimony
7 during that time, please raise your hand or dial *9
8 on your key pad on your phone.

9 (Silence for 4 minutes.)

10 THE HEARING OFFICER: Hi. It's 7:55 and I
11 first wanted to just point out that the hearing will
12 end at 8:00 p.m. but if you have any additional
13 testimony or would like to submit a written copy of
14 your testimony that you have already submitted you
15 may submit -- you may submit that via email at
16 WTCSite5@esd.ny.gov.

17 And we -- I believe we also have another
18 speaker who raised their hand under Carol Lamberg's
19 name and if you -- if you are the speaker who raised
20 your hand, you may unmute or turn on your video and
21 let us know if you're ready to speak.

22 MS. JAMES: Hi, yes. This is Mariama James
23 again. I figured that we had the time. I did want
24 to mention that there's a lot of support also for
25 us. We have received a number of letters from local

2 officials, from members of the Arab community,
3 Community Board 1 passed a resolution in support of
4 this. We have the support of all 72 district
5 leaders across Manhattan, so not just people from
6 Lower Manhattan but all of the representatives
7 across the county and people really want to see this
8 happen. Thank you.

9 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you for that
10 testimony and certainly you should submit those
11 letters and other testimony as comments to either
12 via email to WTCsite5@esd.ny.gov or to ESD
13 attention: WTC Site 5 proposed amendment at 633
14 Third Avenue, 37th Floor, New York, New York 10017.

15 (Three minutes of silence.)

16 THE HEARING OFFICER: At this time it is
17 8:00 p.m. which is the closing time for our public
18 hearing this evening.

19 Thank you to everyone who has been a part of
20 this hearing tonight. Thank you to the 60 people
21 who are still with us. We had over 100 attendees
22 this evening -- well over, over 110 I believe at one
23 point. So thank you all for being a part of this
24 hearing this evening.

25 As a reminder, this was a public hearing for

2 the proposed modifications to the World Trade Center
3 Memorial and Cultural General Project Plan. Written
4 comments will be accepted until February 15th, 2022
5 at 5:00 p.m. at which point the public comment
6 period will close.

7 And just reiterate again, written comments
8 may be submitted to: WTCSite5@esd.ny.gov. Or 633
9 Third Avenue, 37th Floor, New York 10017.

10 And a stenographic transcript of tonight's
11 public hearing will be made available on ESD's
12 website, as well as the LMDC website. You may find
13 that and additional project information within the
14 next few days ESD.NY.GOV/WTCSite5.

15 Again thank you for joining us this evening.
16 Have a good night.

17 (Whereupon, at 8:02 p.m., the
18 above matter concluded.)

19
20
21
22
23
24
25

° ° ° °

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF NEW YORK)
 : SS.:
COUNTY OF RICHMOND)

I, MADELINE TAVANI, a Notary Public for and within the State of New York, do hereby certify:

That the above is a correct transcription of my stenographic notes.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties to this action by blood or by marriage and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of this matter.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this 2nd day of February, 2022.



MADELINE TAVANI