



|| ■ The Public Dialogue and Lower Manhattan Initiatives

In the aftermath of the September 11th attacks, the LMDC has engaged in a continuing public dialogue. All activities have been undertaken with a single objective, achieving the principles identified through the public dialogue. These principles are reflected in the following thematic elements:

- A. The Public Process
- B. Planning (on-site and off-site)
- C. The World Trade Center Memorial
- D. Mixed-Use Community
- E. Transportation
- F. Connectivity, Streetscapes, and the Pedestrian Experience
- G. Parks, Public Spaces, and the Waterfront
- H. Infrastructure and Utilities
- I. Economic Development
- J. History, Culture, Tourism, and the Arts
- K. Environment and Sustainability

These elements directly relate to the LMDC's eleven *Principles for Action*, released on April 9, 2002. The *Principles for Action* were part of the comprehensive document titled *Principles and Blueprint for Renewal*, which was created in consultation with the LMDC Advisory Councils – representing diverse stakeholder groups such as victims' family members, residents, business owners, and others. This document was released to the public and then revised based on public comment that was solicited during the spring of 2002, including comments received at the LMDC's first large-scale public hearing, which drew nearly 1,000 people on May 23, 2002. A revised version, the *Principles and Revised Preliminary Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan*, was released in July of 2002 and continues to serve as the guiding document with respect to the rebuilding and revitalization efforts. The Principles for Action that were crafted as part of this process are:

-
- *Make decisions based on an inclusive and open public process.*
 - *Create a memorial honoring those who were lost while reaffirming the democratic ideals that came under attack on September 11th.*
 - *Assist the rapid revitalization of lower Manhattan, in a manner that does not preclude desirable future development plans.*
 - *Coordinate and encourage the infrastructure improvements that will trigger the private investment needed to sustain and enhance lower Manhattan.*
 - *Support the economic vitality of lower Manhattan as the financial capital of the world with new office space.*
 - *Develop lower Manhattan as a diverse, mixed-use magnet for the arts, culture, tourism, education, and recreation, complemented with residential, commercial, retail and neighborhood activities.*
 - *Develop a comprehensive, coherent plan for transit access to lower Manhattan that expands regional and local connections and improves transit facilities.*
 - *Connect the neighborhoods of lower Manhattan and improve the pedestrian experience of its streets.*
 - *Expand and enhance public and open spaces.*
 - *Preserve the historic character of lower Manhattan and the existing civic and cultural values of its cityscape.*
 - *Promote sustainability and excellence in design, for environmentally sensitive development.*
-

These thematic categories create a framework for demonstrating the direct relationship between the LMDC's stated goals, the public's expressed preferences for each of the goals, and the initiatives undertaken. Within each of the thematic categories, the analysis is organized into two sections:

What the Public Said summarizes major themes that emerged from the public dialogue collected through activities organized by the LMDC and by third party groups, comments submitted in letters and via the internet, position papers and letters prepared by civic organizations representing a range of interests, and comments and proposals presented by elected and appointed officials. In many cases, the summary of public dialogue is described in distinct subcategories to thoroughly illustrate the public's vision for recovery and rebuilding. LMDC enlisted the assistance of ACP-Visioning and Planning, Ltd. to review and synthesize the public dialogue for this report.

Progress to Date reviews the on-site and off-site projects, programs, and initiatives that are completed, ongoing, or planned by the LMDC and other major rebuilding parties, including the City of New York, the Port Authority of NY and NJ (PANYNJ), New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT), Empire State Development Corporation (ESDC), and the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA). Although this review is limited in scope to the LMDC and other major rebuilding parties, it by no means seeks to minimize the enormous contributions that numerous other agencies and organizations have made to the renewal of lower Manhattan.

For the purposes of this report, a list of projects, initiatives, and programs is provided in each section. **An Overview of Projects undertaken by the LMDC and major rebuilding parties with detailed descriptions as well as an at-a-glance matrix are included in Chapter 4 of this report.**

A. THE PUBLIC PROCESS

LMDC has been, and continues to be, committed to an inclusive and open public process as the driving element for the rebuilding and renewal of lower Manhattan. The events of September 11th affected thousands of lives, compelling unprecedented numbers of people to seek opportunities for involvement and sparking an extraordinary level of public dialogue.

What The Public Said

From the outset, the public expressed the desire for an ongoing, open, and inclusive process to gather ideas, establish priorities, and shape decisions for the recovery of lower Manhattan. As the plans for the World Trade Center site and the memorial were defined, the dialogue increasingly turned toward off-site community initiatives. In this area, comments have focused on transparency, accountability, and involvement in the allocation and utilization of Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) funds.

Progress to Date

Since its inception, the LMDC has involved the public in each step of the process by spearheading or participating in outreach initiatives focused on the rebuilding of the World Trade Center site and the revitalization of lower Manhattan. The LMDC has full-time dedicated staff members serving as liaisons to the lower Manhattan community. These staff members continue to regularly speak with elected officials, stakeholders, and members of the public and attend Community Board meetings and other outside meetings and events related to the revitalization efforts throughout lower Manhattan. Staff members have also continuously met with community groups over the past three years to discuss specific projects and priorities being considered for CDBG funding. An overview of LMDC's major public initiatives is provided below:

Advisory Councils and Committees

The LMDC established Advisory Councils made up of key stakeholder groups such as victims' families, residents, small business owners, corporate and civic leaders, and others. Nearly 70 LMDC Advisory Council meetings have been held to solicit feedback on a variety of initiatives, including the rebuilding of the World Trade Center site and the creation of a permanent memorial. Additionally, special Advisory Councils and Committees such as the Memorial Mission Statement and Program Committees, the Memorial Center Advisory Committees, the 130 Liberty Street Advisory Committee, and the Section 106 Historic Resources Consulting Parties have been convened to provide guidance on specific projects and issues.

Public Meetings and Workshops

The LMDC has held numerous public meetings, including meetings in all five boroughs, Long Island, New Jersey, and Connecticut. Several meetings have been broadcast live on the LMDC website and archived for viewing after the meeting date. In addition to the large meetings, the LMDC, in conjunction with the City of New York, conducted workshops on overall funding priorities in each of lower Manhattan's neighborhoods and sponsored community workshops on specific projects such as the Chinatown Access and Circulation Study. Additional meetings have been conducted on a variety of specific topics, including the environmental review process, World Trade Center site planning, the creation of a permanent memorial, neighborhood funding priorities, and others. The following is a descriptive list, in chronological order starting with the most recent, of the LMDC's public hearings and workshops to date:

- Amended General Project Plan/Eminent Domain Procedure Law Public Hearing - January 2005
- 130 Liberty Street Public Information Session on the Draft Phase I Deconstruction Plan - January 2005
- 130 Liberty Street Public Information Session on the Initial Building Characterization - September 2004
- Chinatown Access and Circulation Workshop - June 2004
- Eminent Domain Procedure Law Public Hearing for 130 Liberty Street - June 2004
- Draft Generic Environmental Impact Statement/ Amended General Project Plan Public Hearing - February 2004
- Neighborhood Outreach Workshops Series - July-August 2003:
Financial District
City Hall/South Street Seaport
Battery Park City
Lower East Side
Chinatown
Tribeca/SoHo/Little Italy
Chinatown/Lower East Side II
- Generic Environmental Impact Statement Draft Scope Meetings - July 2003
- *Public Perspectives* lower Manhattan Public Forum with the World Trade Center Memorial Jury - May 2003
Broadcast live on the LMDC website
- *Plans in Progress* New Jersey Public Hearing - January 2003
- *Plans in Progress* lower Manhattan Public Hearing - January 14, 2003
Simulcast to locations in each of the five boroughs and Long Island and broadcast live on the LMDC website
- *Plans in Progress* lower Manhattan Public Hearing - January 13, 2003
Simulcast to locations in each of the five boroughs and Long Island and broadcast live on the LMDC website
- Connecticut Families Meeting - November 2002
- Phase I Planning New Jersey Public Meeting - September 2002
- Phase I Planning lower Manhattan Public Hearing September 2002
- Phase I Planning Queens Public Hearing - August 2002
- Phase I Planning New Jersey Families Meeting August 2002
- Phase I Planning Bronx Public Hearing - August 2002
- Phase I Planning Brooklyn Public Hearing - August 2002
- Phase I Planning Staten Island Public Hearing - August 2002
- Inaugural lower Manhattan Public Hearing - May 2002

Meetings of the LMDC Board of Directors are held monthly and are open to the public. The LMDC also regularly attends and presents its initiatives to Community Boards 1, 2 and 3, representing lower Manhattan south of Houston Street. In addition, the LMDC has participated in meetings and presentations with groups such as the Alliance for Downtown New York, Wall Street Rising, and others.

Outreach Campaigns

Several campaigns to solicit public dialogue were conducted as part of the World Trade Center site planning process, including *Plans in Progress* and *Public Perspectives*.

Plans in Progress was designed to solicit feedback on the nine designs for the World Trade Center site that emerged from the Innovative Design Study for the World Trade Center site. The campaign included large public meetings, an exhibit of the nine plans at the World Financial Center Winter Garden complete with a public comment brochure, and a mailing to thousands of victims' family members. A video showcasing the nine design proposals was also created and included in the exhibit, and was disseminated to every public library branch in New York City, along with the comment brochure. A formal comment period was held between December 16, 2002 and February 2, 2003 as part of this campaign.

Public Perspectives was designed to allow the World Trade Center site Memorial Jury to hear directly from family members and the public on their ideas, hopes, and aspirations for the memorial. The campaign included advisory council meetings, and a public meeting with the jury and a mailing to thousands of family members. A formal comment period was held between May 5th and June 15, 2003.

Public Exhibits

The LMDC has created several exhibits that gave the public an opportunity to learn more about the planning process and to submit comments. Exhibits were created to showcase designs for the World Trade Center site and the memorial, as well as to focus on the overall rebuilding process. The following is a list of LMDC-sponsored public exhibits:

- *From Recovery to Renewal* – Launched in 2003, this is an ongoing exhibit that highlights the rebuilding process from the beginning through the selection of the World Trade Center master plan and memorial design and ongoing planning developments.
- *World Trade Center Memorial Competition Virtual Exhibit* – In February 2004 the LMDC launched an on-line exhibit of all 5,201 entries.
- *World Trade Center Memorial Exhibit* – An exhibit showcasing Reflecting Absence, the winning memorial design, is currently traveling to locations throughout New York State, including the cities of Albany Syracuse, Watertown, Rochester, Buffalo, Binghamton and Hauppauge.
- *World Trade Center Memorial Competition Exhibit* – On November 19, 2003 the LMDC unveiled the exhibit showcasing the eight finalists chosen in the World Trade Center site Memorial Competition. The finalists were selected by the 13 member Memorial Jury and chosen from 5,201 design submissions. The eight memorial designs were on display at the World Financial Center Winter Garden through January 6, 2004.
- *Plans in Progress* – On December 18, 2002, as part of the comprehensive “Plans in Progress” campaign, the LMDC opened a public exhibit that displayed the nine design concepts, known as the Innovative Design Study for the World Trade Center site, at the World Financial Center Winter Garden. This exhibit ran through February 2, 2003 and was visited by over 100,000 people. Over 8,000 public comment cards were submitted to LMDC during the exhibit.
- *Ring of Remembrance* – On July 24, 2002, an exhibit displaying the six initial concept plans for the World Trade site opened at historic Federal Hall in lower Manhattan. Over 17,000 people visited the exhibit, which closed on August 30, 2002. Visitors were invited to submit comment cards and nearly 1,000 comment brochures were received by LMDC by the close of the exhibit.

Partial Action Plans & Quarterly Reports

Each time the LMDC proposes to allocate CDBG funds, it drafts a Partial Action Plan and seeks public

comment. The LMDC disseminates thousands of copies of each plan, along with a one-page fact sheet, a comment form, and an instructional sheet on additional ways to comment, to hundreds of neighborhood community, civic, and residential organizations and stakeholders throughout lower Manhattan. The plans and supplemental documents are translated in three languages. In addition, LMDC posts ads in various citywide and lower Manhattan newspapers.

The LMDC is required to submit quarterly reports to HUD that list the amount of funds allocated and expended to date, performance measurements, and general updates on all activities that the LMDC has funded, including general administration and planning. These detailed reports provided the public with comprehensive information on the LMDC's funded initiatives, and are posted on the LMDC's website at www.renewnyc.com.

LMDC website and LowerManhattan.info

The LMDC continuously provides up-to-date information on its website at www.renewnyc.com and solicits public comment on an ongoing basis on topics including the World Trade Center site planning, memorial, neighborhood planning, funding initiatives, Partial Action Plans, environmental review, and others. The LMDC also supports LowerManhattan.info, a website that provides comprehensive information on the rebuilding efforts and stories about lower Manhattan businesses, organizations, and neighborhood events. LowerManhattan.info also provides a broad range of construction information on all downtown projects, benefiting lower Manhattan residents, workers, and visitors.

Activities Conducted by Other Organizations

Various civic organizations initiated extensive public involvement activities to complement those organized by the LMDC. These efforts helped create a better understanding of the public's aspirations and concerns during all phases of the renewal process and their results have been reviewed by LMDC in making decisions. These efforts include Listening to the City, Imagine New York, and Beyond 16 Acres among others.

B. Planning (on-site and off-site)

The magnitude of the destruction at the World Trade Center, and to the area's transportation and utilities infrastructure, posed incredible challenges for short-term and long-term response, recovery, clean up, and interim reconstruction efforts in lower Manhattan. The level of public dialogue and involvement in the recovery efforts has played a critical role in LMDC's planning efforts to date.

What The Public Said

In the months immediately following the attacks, public comment predominantly focused on the planning of the World Trade Center site and the memorial. As the planning and development efforts at the World Trade Center site progressed, public dialogue began to focus more broadly on lower Manhattan. The major themes identified by the public are:

- **Restore the Skyline and Preserve the Footprints of the Twin Towers** – These were recurring themes throughout the public dialogue surrounding the World Trade Center site planning process.
- **Program for the World Trade Center Site** – Early on in the planning process, there was far-ranging discussion about the program for the World Trade Center site, particularly in terms of the amount of commercial office space and other uses included in the initial six concept plans. Participants in the Listening to the City events expressed concerns about the site being overdeveloped while members of the LMDC Advisory Councils focused on the need to restore the retail that was destroyed with an emphasis on street-level retail that serves residential needs.

- **Respect Local Laws** – That the future development of the World Trade Center site should be consistent with local laws.
- **Balance Needs** – The desire to balance the immediate, short-term needs related to recovery and interim rebuilding efforts with a long-term vision for the World Trade Center site and lower Manhattan. Many public comments also sought to find a balance between local, citywide, and regional needs, as well as the needs of different communities within lower Manhattan. The latter continues to remain a topic of public comment.
- **Encourage Exemplary Planning and Design** – That planning and design for both on- and off-site projects should be exemplary and encouraged the use of design competitions. Recent comments indicate a general appreciation of the role the LMDC is playing in planning the long-term future of lower Manhattan.
- **Safety and Security** – That safety and security should be incorporated into new initiatives. The comments suggests that design and construction should meet or exceed New York City’s fire, building, and safety codes; an effective emergency management plan and adequate response staff should be in place to serve the safety needs of everyone; and appropriate design elements should be incorporated in new development or redeveloped areas. The public would also like to see improved security bollards and replacement of unattractive jersey barriers.
- **Equity** – Ensuring an equitable and fair recovery and renewal effort. Comments suggested that initiatives should be equitable in terms of income levels and geographically equitable as well.
- **Context and Connectivity** – Planning concepts that consider lower Manhattan as a whole, as well as plans that integrate the World Trade Center site with the surrounding community. (Also see Section F: Connectivity, Streetscapes, and the Pedestrian Experience.) Comments have also expressed the desire for new construction to fit into the context of lower Manhattan or the specific neighborhoods in which they are located.
- **Minimize Disruption** – The recovery and rebuilding process has and will continue to affect quality of life in lower Manhattan. Public comment has suggested and continues to suggest that planning efforts should seek to minimize disruptions to residents and workers in lower Manhattan as the rebuilding effort proceeds.

LMDC released two reports on the public dialogue regarding the World Trade Center site planning process: The Public Dialogue, Phase I and the Public Dialogue: Innovative Design Study. Both reports are available on the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com.

Progress to Date

LMDC, along with City and State agencies, elected and appointed officials, and civic organizations, has engaged in extensive planning efforts at the World Trade Center site and throughout lower Manhattan.

In February of 2003, *Memory Foundations* by Studio Daniel Libeskind was selected as the master plan for the World Trade Center site. The selection marked the culmination of the Innovative Design Study - a worldwide search for architects, planners, and artists to propose new ideas for the World Trade Center site. The search emphasized that designs should incorporate elements that were derived from public comment, including a respectful memorial setting that preserves the footprints of the Twin Towers; a bold new skyline; and a range of commercial space. The design was selected subsequent to the unprecedented *Plans in Progress* campaign, described above. The design leaves portions of the slurry wall exposed, while reserving a majestic

setting for the memorial and museum in the area known as the bathtub. The Freedom Tower creates a powerful new skyline for lower Manhattan, while the bustling activity reaffirms life in the aftermath of tragedy. The master plan also creates vital public spaces and will restore the original street grid that was replaced by the World Trade Center “super block.” The realization of the master plan continues to be at the core of LMDC’s mission, and the public continues to be involved in the process of re-imagining the 16-acre site to meet the goal of creating an urban area that will both honor the lives that were lost while reinvigorating lower Manhattan.

LMDC has also actively undertaken a number of off-site lower Manhattan planning studies aimed at creating a new and renewed community through short-term quality of life improvements, improving accessibility throughout the area, and revitalizing neighborhoods. Planning studies aimed at addressing these fundamental improvements are the direct result of the public’s input. Moreover, agencies such as the New York City Departments of City Planning and Transportation, and the New York State Department of Transportation have partnered with LMDC on these various studies. These ambitious planning efforts both at the World Trade Center site and in lower Manhattan are listed below:

World Trade Center Site Planning Studies and Related Activities:

- Innovative Design Study, leading to the selection of the *Memory Foundations*, the World Trade Center Master Redevelopment Plan;
- World Trade Center Memorial Competition, leading to the selection of *Reflecting Absence*;
- Invitation to Cultural Institutions, leading to the selection of four cultural organizations to locate on the World Trade Center site; and
- World Trade Center Generic Environmental Impact Statement for the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan.

Off-Site Planning Studies:

- **Brooklyn Bridge Anchorage Study**, which explored ways of connecting the areas north and south of the Brooklyn Bridge, improving the link between City Hall and the Civic Center to the East River waterfront, and increasing the efficiency and aesthetics of the Brooklyn Bridge anchorage;
- **Chinatown Access and Circulation study**, which explored several key areas for improvement in this neighborhood, including bus parking, pedestrian and vehicular traffic, and potential solutions to the Park Row issue;
- **Fulton Street Corridor Study**, which seeks to enhance this vital east-west corridor and create an arts and retail destination while improving open space;
- **Greenwich Street South Study**, which seeks to create better connections between neighborhoods south of Liberty Street, enhance open space, address bus parking issues, and promote additional housing and cultural development;
- **Open Space and Public Realm Enhancement Study**, which explored ways to improve the Financial District’s open spaces;
- **CREATE in Chinatown Feasibility Study**, exploring the creation of a major arts and cultural center in Chinatown;
- **East River Waterfront Study**, seeking to improve access to this vital waterfront and enhance its uses; and
- **LIRR/JFK Airport Access Study**, which seeks to create a seamless connection between lower Manhattan and the Long Island Railroad and to provide a one-seat ride to the region’s primary international airport.

Planning Efforts by Civic Organizations

Listed below is a selection of planning studies undertaken by civic organizations.

- Position Paper on Arts/Culture, R.Dot;
- Position Paper on Neighborhood Housing, lower Manhattan - A Mixed Income Community, R.Dot;
- Planning and Design Workshop for lower Manhattan, Civic Alliance;
- A Civic Assessment of the lower Manhattan Planning Process, Regional Plan Association report to the Civic Alliance; and
- Principles for the Rebuilding of lower Manhattan, and numerous studies on design and planning, New York New Visions.

C. WORLD TRADE CENTER MEMORIAL

The devastating attacks of September 11th at the World Trade Center, the Pentagon, and in Shanksville, Pennsylvania were felt throughout the world, resulting in a tremendous outpouring of emotion and spontaneous memorials. In the aftermath of the attacks, as the initial shock and mourning receded, public discussion began to focus on the creation of a fitting memorial dedicated to those who lost their lives on September 11th and in the 1993 bombing of the World Trade Center.

What the Public Said

In the months that immediately followed September 11th, public comment focused on two central themes: establishing a process for the creation of a memorial and the memorial's design. Much of this early comment resulted from public dialogue that occurred at the Listening to the City events, Imagine New York workshops, LMDC Advisory Committee meetings, and numerous public hearings sponsored by the LMDC. The dialogue focused primarily on the draft Memorial Mission Statement and Program, with the public emphasizing thoughts regarding the memorial as well as specific elements important for a fitting tribute, such as honoring each victim individually, creating a separate area for family members, interring the unidentified remains of the victims, and creating a "living memorial" with light, trees, water, etc. The LMDC issued two reports on the public dialogue during the initial phases of the memorial planning process; both are available on the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com.

Additional comments were presented during the jury selection process for the memorial, through public reactions to the design finalists and chosen memorial design. Public comment that was received during the *Public Perspectives* campaign was given directly to the World Trade Center Memorial Jury prior to their review of competition submissions. More recent public comments have focused on off-site memorials and remembrance.

- **Process** – That the memorial should be established through a broad and inclusive process that would incorporate a worldwide competition for its design. More recently, since the design for the memorial was selected, public comments express a desire to see the process move forward to construction.
- **Design** – That the memorial should create a peaceful oasis, integrated into the living, vital, and diverse city. Others saw the memorial as permanent and integrated into the entire World Trade Center site. Many expressed that the footprints of the World Trade Center should be considered hallowed ground, and that the slurry wall should be kept intact. Others suggested incorporating a memorial museum on site, creating a living memorial park, and connecting the memorial to the surrounding urban fabric.
- **Off-site Memorial and Remembrance** – The LMDC continues to receive comments and proposals for off-site memorials both within and outside of lower Manhattan and for other remembrance activities. For example, there were public comments that supported the return of the Tribute in Light, and the creation of off-site memorials at Fresh Kills and in other parts of the city and region.

Progress to Date

The centerpiece of the LMDC's mission has been the creation of a permanent memorial. The LMDC undertook a massive effort to both solicit and incorporate public dialogue throughout the complex process of identifying a memorial that will meet the needs of so many who were directly and indirectly affected by the terrorist attacks. To arrive at a point where a memorial competition could be launched, the LMDC first developed a Memorial Mission Statement and Program through the contributions of:

- Two separate volunteer committees made up of a diverse group of stakeholders including victims' families, survivors, and downtown residents;
- Thousands of public comments generated at public meetings such as "Listening to the City," and subsequent public meetings held in every borough, Long Island, Connecticut and New Jersey; and
- Comments received from around the world.

In 2004, as a result of the largest design competition in history, the LMDC announced the selection of *Reflecting Absence*, by Michael Arad, of Handel Architects, and Peter Walker, of Peter Walker and Partners, for the memorial design. Davis Brody Bond LLP, a firm nationally recognized for its high quality design and innovative architecture, joined the memorial design group as the associate architect and is working with Michael Arad and Peter Walker. The schematic design was released to the public in December 2004.

Reflecting Absence proposes a space that resonates with the feelings of loss and absence that were generated by the destruction of the World Trade Center and the taking of thousands of lives on September 11th and February 26, 1993. A critical part of the memorial is the Memorial Center, an interpretive museum that will tell the story of lives cut short and one of the greatest recovery efforts of our time. The LMDC formed a Memorial Center Advisory Committee composed of victims' family members, residents, survivors, first responders, historians, preservationists, and curators, to make recommendations for this interpretive center.

In addition to its efforts to create a permanent memorial, the LMDC has initiated and funded a number of projects, some of which were brought forth by victims' family groups and other organizations, to create interim memorials until the permanent memorial is completed. These initiatives include:

- The LMDC Family Room at 1 Liberty Plaza;
- The Interim Memorial at Battery Park;
- The Living Memorial;
- The Story Corps Story Booth Project;
- The Tribute Visitors' Center; and
- Tribute in Light.

These activities are described in more detail in Chapter 4, Overview of Projects.

D. MIXED-USE COMMUNITY

As attention turned from the World Trade Center site and the memorial, public dialogue increasingly began to focus on transforming lower Manhattan into a true mixed-use community. The public dialogue began to focus on lower Manhattan as a 24/7 community, with enhanced connectivity, open spaces, retail, and other amenities, which are covered in detail in other sections of this report. Distinct themes not covered by other sections of this report were also apparent in the public dialogue: housing for all income levels and civic amenities.

What the Public Said

- Housing– Prior to the September 11th attacks, approximately 150,000 residents lived below Houston Street and lower Manhattan was developing into a diverse residential community. Throughout the post-September 11th public process, the notion that affordable housing should be part of any plan for the redevelopment of lower Manhattan emerged. The public gave particular emphasis to the development of affordable housing in lower Manhattan and throughout New York City.
- Civic Amenities – The diversification and expansion of downtown’s residential population goes hand in hand with the strengthening of its civic amenities. The public suggested that investments should focus on civic amenities as well as on quality of life improvements.
- Examples of these types of amenities include medical facilities, libraries, post offices, and retail.
- Education also emerged as priority. The public recommended that, in addition to a neighborhood high school, an east side elementary school should be established along with an additional intermediate school within the next few years to accommodate neighborhood growth.

Progress to Date

Establishing lower Manhattan as a 24-hour, mixed-use community is seen as essential to encouraging vibrant residential neighborhoods, a healthy business environment, and promoting tourism. Many of the key elements related to creating a vibrant 24-hour community are included in other sections of this report (e.g. transportation, parks and open space, connectivity, arts and cultural uses, marketing, tourism, and economic development).

In December 2002, Mayor Michael R. Bloomberg released the City’s *Vision for lower Manhattan*, which set forth priorities for the revitalization efforts to develop lower Manhattan as a mixed-use community. The *Vision* focuses on three types of investments that the public sector should make: 1) connect lower Manhattan to the world; 2) build new neighborhoods; and 3) create public places that make lower Manhattan one of the most appealing places in the world. While the World Trade Center site planning and memorial processes were underway, this set a context for the discussion regarding broader revitalization issues in and around lower Manhattan neighborhoods.

The LMDC has funded a number of initiatives aimed at improving the quality of life for residents, workers, and visitors to lower Manhattan. In April of 2003, Governor Pataki announced a number of these short-term quality-of-life initiatives. These short-term initiatives and other activities, launched at various times since the LMDC’s inception, are listed below:

- LMDC allocation of \$50 million to New York City for Affordable Housing;
- \$226 million in grants to lower Manhattan residents through the Residential Grant Program assisting 65,000 households;
- Revitalization and creation of 15 Neighborhood Parks and Open Spaces located in each neighborhood of lower Manhattan, improving or creating 124 acres of park space;
- Supporting the return of the lower Manhattan Greenmarket;
- Columbus Park Pavilion restoration;
- Hudson River Park Improvements, including tennis courts and ball fields;
- East River Waterfront study;
- Greenwich Street South study;
- Fulton Street Corridor study;
- Pace University Green Roof project; and
- The Millennium High School, the first open-admission high school for lower Manhattan students.

Activities Conducted by Other Organizations

In February of this year Mayor Bloomberg announced the creation of a new elementary/middle school to serve students in lower Manhattan through a new innovative public-private partnership. The \$65 million, five-story school will cover approximately 100,000 square feet and create 600 seats for students in the neighborhood. The school will be part of a 1 million square foot, mixed-use building that will include ground floor retail space, market-rate rental apartments, and residential condominium units.

The City and State of New York have also engaged in numerous activities related to housing in lower Manhattan:

- **Mitchell Lama Buy-Outs**—The Housing Preservation Department has worked to maintain the affordability of Mitchell-Lama rental housing developments in lower Manhattan, when the building owner opted out of the program, including Independence Plaza North and Lands End I. HPD now administers special Section 8 rental subsidies to income eligible tenants at these developments.
- **Land Disposition**— The City of New York is selling vacant land to build mixed-use developments at sites in lower Manhattan, including Site 5B and 5C in Tribeca, the NYU Parking Lot, Avalon Chrystie Place Project, and Norfolk Apartments II.
- **Tax Abatements**— The City of New York has issued 421A tax-exempt bonds for 54 projects in lower Manhattan. 18 of these projects have been completed with 818 rent-stabilized units, and an addition of 36 projects are under construction, and will create an additional 2,189 units of rent-stabilized units. In addition, the City of New York has issued tax abatements for 14 commercial buildings in lower Manhattan, allowing their conversion to residential use. This will result in the creation of 1,257 new units of affordable housing.
- **Liberty Bonds**—The City Housing Development Corporation has issued over \$475 million in Liberty Bonds on four projects in lower Manhattan to create 1,934 units of housing. Additionally, the State Housing Finance Agency has issued over \$786 million in Liberty Bonds for eight projects in lower Manhattan to create 2,287 units of housing.

E. TRANSPORTATION, NEIGHBORHOOD ACCESS AND CIRCULATION

Lower Manhattan's transit and transportation infrastructure was severely damaged as a result of the September 11th attacks, requiring interim measures to return service as soon as possible and creating the opportunity for a rethinking of the transportation network, the first improvements in lower Manhattan transportation infrastructure in more than a half century.

What the Public Said

Public comment related to transportation stated that simply rebuilding the transit lines damaged on September 11th was not sufficient for maintaining lower Manhattan's role in the region and in the global economy. Comments have also expressed a need for increased transportation options, access to the region, and improved connectivity and pedestrian access.

- **Access to the Region** – Integration of downtown's subway and PATH connections into the region's transportation network; a one-seat ride from downtown to JFK and Newark airports; a network of ferry and water taxi stations, including a trans-Hudson ferry service to the east side of lower Manhattan and to JFK; and a commuter and tourist bus storage facility. The LIRR/JFK rail link has received considerable public comment. Letters from business leaders to Congress have identified the rail link as their top transportation priority. While many stakeholders in lower Manhattan fully support the project, some organizations and individuals have expressed serious reservations about using CDBG funds for this project.

- **Increased Options** – The creation of an expanded and improved Fulton Street-Broadway transportation complex, a major station and transportation hub, and support for the building of the Second Avenue subway. The Alliance for Downtown New York, representing businesses throughout the area south of Chambers Street, has stated that the Fulton Street-Broadway transportation complex is a high priority. There has also been recent interest in bus services including suggestions for a Grand Street bus, a lower Manhattan loop bus, and shuttle buses.
- **Improved Connectivity and Pedestrian Access** – Improved or suppressed West Street, improved access and connectivity among neighborhoods, better street management and vehicular, pedestrian, and bicycle circulation. (Also see Section F Connectivity, Streetscapes, and the Pedestrian Experience.) Residents in Chinatown have expressed a strong desire to see Park Row reopened to traffic.

Progress to Date

Transit and transportation reconstruction and improvement planning have largely been the responsibility of the Port Authority, the MTA, and the City and State DOT. The LMDC continues to partner in these efforts, and has spearheaded or funded studies to realize major projects such as West Street, a direct link to the Long Island Rail Road and JFK Airport, and others. The LMDC led the effort to secure \$4.55 billion in transportation funds for lower Manhattan, which secured funding for a number of projects listed below that, once completed, will be the first major enhancements to the area's transportation infrastructure in over 50 years. Studies and activities related to transportation initiatives are listed below and explained in more detail in Chapter 4.

Studies by LMDC and Partner Agencies

- LIRR/JFK Airport Access Study;
- Greenwich Street South Study;
- Chinatown Access and Circulation Study; and
- Brooklyn Bridge Anchorage Study.

Activities by Other Agencies and Organizations

- Restoration of existing services, including the 1/9 and N/R subway lines (MTA);
- Repaired and restored PATH Tunnel under Hudson River (PANYNJ);
- Reopened temporary World Trade Center PATH station (PANYNJ);
- World Trade Center permanent PATH station, with new connections to subway lines in the new Fulton Street Transit Center (PANYNJ);
- Fulton Street Transit Center (MTA);
- South Ferry Station Redesign, renovate and straighten the curved and obsolete South Ferry Station with new connections to N and R subway stations (MTA);
- Launch of 'Enduring Freedom' High-Speed Ferry Service between lower Manhattan and parts of Queens (PANYNJ);
- Lower Manhattan Ferry Service to Yonkers-La Guardia Airport (PANYNJ);
- West Street Planning (State DOT); and
- Lower Manhattan Ferry Service to JFK Airport (PANYNJ).

F. CONNECTIVITY, STREETSCAPES, AND THE PEDESTRIAN EXPERIENCE

When the World Trade Center was originally developed the existing street grid was eliminated creating a super block that limited pedestrian and vehicular access through the site and into surrounding communities. Combined with lower Manhattan's historical pattern of relatively narrow streets and sidewalks, the World Trade Center super block exacerbated traffic congestion and diminished pedestrian mobility.

What The Public Said

The public was keenly aware of the lack of connectivity and east-west access created by the original World Trade Center layout and discussed those issues in a number of ways that include:

- Improving pedestrian circulation and connectivity on the World Trade Center site, the immediate surrounding areas, and throughout lower Manhattan;
- Improving access to lower Manhattan's waterfront; and
- Enhancing lower Manhattan's streetscape and pedestrian experience.

Progress to Date

The LMDC has made a concerted effort to improve the pedestrian experience in lower Manhattan and enhance connections between neighborhoods through a number of projects and studies. Listed below are the activities undertaken or supported by the LMDC to improve connectivity and the pedestrian experience in lower Manhattan.

- New York Stock Exchange Area Improvements, which re-imagines this area through a series of aesthetic improvements that provide a necessary balance between security needs and the surrounding community of workers and residents;
- West Street Pedestrian Connections, including the construction of a pedestrian bridge at Vesey Street, and improvements to the Liberty Street bridge;
- Downtown Alliance Streetscape, which enhances this critical corridor in lower Manhattan by implementing a number of streetscape improvements;
- Chinatown Access and Circulation Study;
- Brooklyn Bridge Anchorage Study; and
- Greenwich Street South Study.

These activities are described in more detail in Chapter 4.

G. PARKS, PUBLIC SPACES, AND THE WATERFRONT

For much of its history, lower Manhattan's residential neighborhoods have not received the same level of investment in parks and public spaces relative to other New York City communities. In addition, as a result of its historic development pattern, lower Manhattan has very few open spaces available for public use. As more individuals and families move into the area, the need for public space improvements has become more pressing. Passive and active open spaces are key components of any vibrant community.

What The Public Said

Public comments focused on parks improvements, more recreational facilities, improved access, and design.

- **Parks Improvements** – Improved parks and public spaces throughout lower Manhattan. Public comments specifically identified a number of parks and open space improvements, including the completion of the lower Manhattan section of the Hudson River Park, the improvement of the East River waterfront, and the redevelopment of Battery Park and Castle Clinton.
- **More Recreational Facilities** – Support for both indoor and outdoor recreational space for residents and workers in lower Manhattan, prompting many to encourage the creation of a community recreation center.
- **Improve access and linkages** – Increased access to open space, with a particular emphasis on increasing accessibility to the waterfront. There have also been comments promoting linkages between open spaces.
- **Design** – The need for public spaces to be designed for beauty and safety.

Progress to Date

In April 2003 Governor George E. Pataki laid out an aggressive plan to transform lower Manhattan into a true mixed-use, 24 hour vibrant community. Elements of the plan included immediate quality-of-life initiatives, including a commitment to improving lower Manhattan's existing open spaces.

The City's *Vision for Lower Manhattan* also identified open space as a top priority. LMDC has demonstrated its commitment to improving lower Manhattan's public spaces by allocating over \$30 million and improving approximately 124.2 acres of park land. Such improvements have included, but are not limited to, new ball fields, vast open spaces, enhanced lighting and seating, a running track, tennis courts, new drainage systems, rehabilitation of indoor recreational spaces, and much more. Nearly all of the lower Manhattan population lives within a half-mile of at least one of the parks that have benefited from this investment. The LMDC has also funded several studies that seek to enhance public spaces in lower Manhattan. Specific initiatives and studies are listed below:

- Neighborhood Parks and Open Spaces (15 parks and open spaces throughout lower Manhattan);
- Columbus Park Pavilion restoration project;
- Hudson River Park;
- Fulton Street Corridor study;
- Open Space and Public Realm Enhancement study;
- Greenwich Street South study; and
- East River Waterfront study (City of New York).

These activities are described in more detail in Chapter 4.

H. INFRASTRUCTURE AND UTILITIES

The September 11th attacks on the World Trade Center caused widespread damage to lower Manhattan's energy and telecommunications infrastructure, resulting in extensive disruptions of service to businesses and residential communities throughout lower Manhattan. The damage included the destruction of a major Con Edison substation at 7 World Trade Center as well as Verizon's central office facilities at 140 West Street. Both facilities provided telecommunications and utility service for most of lower Manhattan.

In the immediate aftermath of the attacks, energy and telecommunications firms responded rapidly to provide emergency and temporary services, and these firms have worked to restore permanent and improved service to all customers located within lower Manhattan. The costs to deliver emergency and temporary services and to rebuild damaged infrastructure for permanent service delivery have been considerable and have been borne by the affected utility service providers.

What the Public Said

Since the response was so swift, and the need for and responsibility for restoring utilities so clear, there has been limited public comment on utilities. Transportation infrastructure did garner substantial public dialogue and is addressed in the Transportation section of this chapter. A primary issue that has surfaced through public comment is the importance of state-of-the-art telecommunications in lower Manhattan.

Progress to Date

Key to lower Manhattan's recovery and continued growth as a 21st century business district is the development of telecommunications and utilities infrastructure, complete with the necessary redundancy capabilities to ensure its stability and vitality. To ensure this objective, Congress, in 2002, authorized the use of up to \$750 million in additional CDBG funds for utility restoration and infrastructure improvements. The

LMDC's Board of Directors subsequently approved a plan that prioritized the use of these funds (1) to protect businesses and residential customers from bearing the cost of infrastructure rebuilding as a result of September 11th; and (2) to enhance the revitalization and redevelopment of lower Manhattan as a world-class commercial and residential community by encouraging investment in energy and telecommunications infrastructure. The plan prioritized the use of funds according to the following four categories:

- Reimbursement for costs related to providing temporary and emergency energy and telecommunications services in lower Manhattan after the September 11th attack that were not recovered from insurance or other sources.
- Reimbursement for costs related to permanent restoration of lower Manhattan's energy and telecommunications infrastructure, and for critically important improvements to that infrastructure.
- Payment for "interference" work—the relocation of utilities required not for the companies' own purposes, but by public infrastructure improvements and other lower Manhattan redevelopment projects
- Funding for the installation of new "carrier-neutral" conduits connecting telecommunications companies' fiber optic trunk lines to lower Manhattan's side streets, for installation of redundant fiber optic connections to critical public and private-sector facilities in lower Manhattan, and for other improvements mandated by new federal or state regulations.

ESDC is administering this program, with monitoring and oversight by the LMDC. To date, the redevelopment parties involved with these efforts continue to make progress toward the full realization of this dynamic plan.

In addition to the tremendous strides made in implementing the Utilities Repair and Infrastructure Rebuilding program, May 2004 marked the opening of the rebuilt Con Edison substations at 7 World Trade Center that provide critical electricity to lower Manhattan. These substations were destroyed on September 11. Prior to the reconstruction, LMDC—through an unparalleled level of cooperation between the City Planning Department, the Port Authority, Con Edison, and Silverstein Properties—led the effort with ESDC to acquire by condemnation that portion of Vesey Street that allowed for the redesign and rebuilding of 7 World Trade Center in a way that permits the reintroduction of a Greenwich Street through the entire World Trade Center site.

Activities by Other Agencies and Organizations

The New York City Department of Transportation, in cooperation with other New York City agencies, has engaged in numerous completed and ongoing street reconstruction projects throughout lower Manhattan, including the Wall Street Water Main project, Downtown Street Engineered Resurfacing projects, Washington/Cedar Area Reconstruction projects, Old Slip Park and Street Reconstruction project, Barclay Street Reconstruction project, and more.

I. ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

The attacks of September 11th, posed a major challenge to lower Manhattan's continued viability as a major business center. In the aftermath of the attacks, more than 65,000 jobs were lost and more than 13 million square feet of office space was destroyed, with millions more damaged. Hundreds of companies that occupied buildings in the area were forced to relocate while many suffered disruptions in their business activities. Additionally, major elements of lower Manhattan's energy, telecommunications, and transit infrastructure had been destroyed or severely damaged. As a result of the damage, some companies left lower Manhattan while many considered doing so upon the expiration of their leases.

What the Public Said

Economic recovery and growth has been a key issue in the public comment because of its impact on people of all incomes, in all industries and sectors, and in all parts of the region. Public comment related to revitalizing lower Manhattan's economy has focused on re-establishing lower Manhattan as a leader in the global economy; diversifying its economy; making it a hub of linked regional businesses; creating jobs; retaining and attracting small businesses; and marketing the area and its neighborhoods.

- **Leader in the Global Economy** – Many comments expressed that the rebuilding effort should re-establish lower Manhattan as a powerful engine of the city, region, and nation making it a leader in the global economy. Comments also supported maintaining lower Manhattan's core financial businesses and industries.
- **Diversified Economy** – Public comments have conveyed that efforts should be made to diversify lower Manhattan's economy to reduce dependence on the financial industry, promote industries with growth potential, and increase the availability of a range of employment opportunities. In addition, public comment suggests that tourism, retail, and cultural activities will help strengthen the city's overall economy and contribute to a vibrant quality of life downtown.
- **Regional Hub** – The process of revitalizing lower Manhattan should also be an opportunity for the creation of new "central business districts" bringing economic growth to other parts of the city and region. Taking advantage of the business community's desire for a safer, multi-centered development pattern after September 11th, this decentralization process would link lower Manhattan to local economies throughout the region.
- **Jobs** – Public comment discussed employment and the need to invest in human capital, which is perceived by some as the core of competitive advantage. Recommendations include job creation and job training programs that will help New Yorkers of all professions – white collar, blue collar, and service industry – weather economic downturns, stimulate the economy, and help build a more diverse and stronger long-term economic base for the future. Recent public comment has continued to emphasize job creation.
- **Small Businesses** – Public dialogue has continually focused on the retention, stabilization, and attraction of small- and medium-sized businesses that support and are an integral part of the residential and business community. Recommendations included assisting those affected by September 11th, strengthening minority/women business enterprises, as well as using local New York-based businesses in the rebuilding process.
- **Marketing Lower Manhattan** – Numerous comments suggested that lower Manhattan, its neighborhoods, businesses, restaurants, museums, and other cultural institutions and events should be marketed through guides, maps, directories, information centers, and kiosks to increase economic activity and tourism. (Also see Section J: History, Culture, Tourism, and the Arts and Section B: Planning.)

Progress to Date

The master plan for the World Trade Center site will restore 10 million square feet of critical commercial space that was destroyed on September 11th. It is estimated that the construction itself of the World Trade Center site will generate \$14-\$15.4 billion in total economic output in New York City between 2003 and 2015 and create an average of 7,760 to 8,530 full-time equivalent jobs each year for 13 years. (1) In 2015, the year reconstruction is expected to be completed, the total impact on the City's economy from operations at the World Trade Center site and off-site visitor spending will include a \$15.7 billion increase in

annual economic output and approximately 77,000 full-time equivalent jobs.(1) Since September 11th, additional measures have been undertaken by the State and the City to both retain and attract major corporations and small businesses throughout lower Manhattan, and these efforts, in conjunction with the major infrastructure and transportation initiatives, further the goal of revitalizing the neighborhood as a premier 21st Century central business district.

In the months following the attacks, ESDC funded and administered several business recovery programs that aided in the stabilization of lower Manhattan's economy and assist in the continuing recovery, growth, and revitalization of the business environment:

- The Business Recovery Grant Program, which assisted 14,000 firms employing 138,000 employees;
- The Disproportionate Loss of Workforce Grant, which assisted 10 firms employing 6,500 employees;
- The Employment Training Assistance Program, which assisted 11 firms employing 333 employees;
- The Job Creation and Retention Program which assisted 74 firms employing 83,000 employees; and
- The Small Business Attraction and Retention Grant, which assisted 1,700 firms employing 26,000 employees.
- Lower Manhattan Business Recovery Grant program, administered by the New York City Economic Development Corporation immediately following September 11th, which assisted more than 1,600 non-retail firms.

These business assistance initiatives have had, and will continue to have, a profound impact on lower Manhattan's redevelopment. Including ESDC and LMDC funding sources, these programs assisted 16,046 firms employing more than 254,000 employees in lower Manhattan. These efforts have resulted in \$1.6 billion in economic output city-wide, and the creation of more than 10,000 jobs.(2)

Events and Programs of LMDC

In addition to programs aimed at assisting businesses in recovering from the immediate affects of September 11th, the LMDC has also conducted or sponsored events and programs for small businesses, minority/women-owned businesses, and prospective workers, as well as marketing and tourism programs to disseminate information to lower Manhattan residents, businesses, and workers and to attract visitors.

- Opportunity Downtown: Minority and Women-Owned Business Enterprise Conference, introducing MWBE firms to the overall rebuilding efforts and major agencies that are involved and was attended by more than 700 participants from more than 40 organizations;
- Opportunity Downtown: Women Working, aimed at introducing women to opportunities in the construction industry, was attended by more than 700 women;
- Opportunity Downtown: Business to Business Event, bringing together 140 small businesses and 18 large corporations in lower Manhattan to identify mutually beneficial procurement opportunities; and
- XI Annual Competitive Edge Conference for Minority and Women Business Owners, an annual MWBE event that was sponsored in part by LMDC.

Marketing and Tourism Initiatives

The LMDC initiated or supported a number of marketing and tourism related initiatives. These initiatives, some of which also seek to highlight and support the myriad of cultural organizations and activities in lower Manhattan and are referenced again in the next section, are listed below, and are described in more detail in Chapter 4:

- Museums of Lower Manhattan Campaign;
- Explore Chinatown Campaign;
- River to River Festival 2002 and 2004;
- Splendor of Florence Festival 2004;
- Tribeca Film Festival 2004 and 2005; and
- 3 Farms Music Festival 2004.

J. HISTORY, CULTURE, TOURISM, AND THE ARTS

Lower Manhattan, as the original settlement in Manhattan, has a long and rich history exemplified by the street patterns of the original 17th century Dutch settlement, its Revolutionary War Historic District, its waterfront with Liberty Island and Ellis Island, its historic churches and parks, and neighborhoods such as Chinatown and Little Italy. These amenities have always attracted tourists and visitors.

Lower Manhattan is also home to many cultural institutions and museums. Its history, culture, and location make lower Manhattan an attractive tourist destination as well as a residential community.

Following the destruction of the World Trade Center, large areas of lower Manhattan were closed and inaccessible for many months adversely affecting its economy and the viability of its cultural institutions.

WHAT THE PUBLIC SAID

Public comment focused on three primary themes: the restoration and enhancement of attractions in lower Manhattan; using arts and culture as a catalyst for economic growth; and enhancing and supporting local cultural and civic amenities and activities.

- **Restoration and Enhancement of Attractions in lower Manhattan** – The need to provide informational centers to make visitors aware of the area’s cultural offerings. Further development of outdoor performance spaces and the development of waterfront cultural venues were also suggested. Many members of the public supported a new Freedom Park or Freedom Museum at the World Trade Center site. There was also public support for introducing cultural and arts facilities as an integral part of any rebuilding efforts at the World Trade Center site. There was also the desire to integrate cultural spaces within new development. v
- **A Catalyst for Economic Growth** – The presence of cultural and historic resources was viewed as a catalyst for economic growth. Comments by some civic organizations also suggested that the LMDC work with private businesses and arts organizations to develop incentives to promote a variety of arts activities. More recently, support for arts, cultural, and civic activities as a key to lower Manhattan’s growth has increased with the publication of “Campuses and Corridors” which listed numerous organizations and activities that should be supported.
- **Local Cultural Amenities and Activities** – The LMDC Neighborhood Outreach Workshops showed that all the neighborhoods supported more arts and cultural activities including a greater number of festivals and more free activities; support for local artists and arts organizations; and projects that would reinforce neighborhood identity and cultural diversity. In particular, Chinatown residents and repre-

representatives urged support for cultural and community centers and cultural districts, and were concerned that projects be culturally sensitive. Chinatown participants were interested in supporting tourism through the creation of new attractions, tourist guides, marketing campaigns, and the creation of an information kiosk.

Progress to Date

Efforts have been undertaken in lower Manhattan with the objective of supporting history, culture, and the arts in order to enhance the residential environment, promote tourism, and stimulate the economy. These activities focus on the World Trade Center site and off-site initiatives as well.

In June 2003, the LMDC invited cultural institutions to submit proposals to become part of the facilities and programs on the future World Trade Center site. The LMDC engaged in public outreach to measure public priorities. By the close of the Invitation to Cultural Institutions (ICI) process in September 2003, 113 institutions had submitted responses. A panel convened by the LMDC, composed of representatives from the New York State Council on the Arts and the New York City Department of Cultural Affairs, evaluated the responses to gauge the types of organizations the cultural community in New York and beyond proposed as vital and appropriate components for future development at the World Trade Center site. In 2004, the LMDC announced the selection of four institutions that will occupy the two cultural buildings—a Performing Arts Center and a Museum Complex.

The Performing Arts Center will provide a new facility to house the Joyce International Dance Center and the Signature Theatre Company. The Museum Complex will house the International Freedom Center, created expressly for the World Trade Center site, and the Drawing Center, the only fine arts institution in the country focused solely on the exhibition of drawings.

The LMDC has also engaged in cultural events and tourism activities with the objective of spurring economic activity downtown and vitality in lower Manhattan. More information on these events and activities can be found in Chapter 4.

- Museums of Lower Manhattan Campaign, highlighting 15 cultural institutions throughout lower Manhattan;
- Lower Manhattan Communications Outreach Campaign, which informs residents, workers, and business owners about the rebuilding efforts;
- Lower Manhattan Information Program (LowerManhattan.info), which provides one central source of information on lower Manhattan, including the revitalization efforts, neighborhood events and activities, etc.;
- Explore Chinatown Campaign, a marketing and tourism campaign aimed at highlighting this unique neighborhood to regional, domestic, and international visitors;
- River to River Festival 2002 and 2004, providing arts and cultural events from May through September at locations throughout lower Manhattan, drawing thousands of visitors each year;
- Splendor of Florence Festival 2004, highlighting works of art from Florence and other activities throughout lower Manhattan;
- Tribeca Film Festival 2004 and 2005, created in the aftermath of September 11th to help the neighborhood recovery, it attracts international attention and thousands of visitors each year; and
- 3 Farms Festival 2004, a popular music festival on the Lower East Side, providing local entertainment and activities.

K. ENVIRONMENT AND SUSTAINABILITY

Environmental issues have been a focus of public comment from the start of the recovery and rebuilding effort. The public also recognized the unique opportunity to incorporate sustainable design on a large scale in the rebuilding of the World Trade Center site and the lower Manhattan community thereby improving environmental quality.

What The Public Said

The public expressed a the clear desire that commercial or residential development in lower Manhattan – whether new building, renovations, or demolition – should be environmentally sensitive, incorporate sustainable design, and be energy and resource efficient. The goal of these efforts should be to ensure environmental quality and safeguard human health.

A Model for Sustainable Development

The public recommended that development on the World Trade Center site, in particular, and lower Manhattan, in general, should be a model for sustainable development and green building and seek to be resource efficient.

Environmental Quality

Comments expressed concern for environmental health issues and suggested that projects in lower Manhattan should improve, not degrade, the health of residents and workers. These comments relate not only to the actual projects, but also to construction efforts needed to realize the projects.

Progress to Date

Environmental Review Processes

- The Final General Environmental Impact Statement (FGEIS) was the culmination of the planning process for the World Trade Center site. A comprehensive environmental review of the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan was developed, DGEIS and FGEIS public hearings were conducted, and written and oral public comment was collected throughout the process. It served as the basis for the General Project Plan.
- The FGEIS has proposed to mitigate air pollution and other cumulative impacts of the multiple lower Manhattan recovery projects that will be developed simultaneously through a set of Environmental Performance Commitments (EPC) by the LMDC, the Port Authority, MTA, and NYS DOT.
- A draft supplement EIS was also prepared for the Route 9A/West Street project, complete with three alternatives. (NYS DOT)
- A Draft EIS for the Permanent World Trade Center PATH Terminal with two legitimate options, one with and one without the Liberty Plaza connection, was prepared. (PANYNJ)

World Trade Center Sustainable Guidelines

The LMDC, working with green design experts, developed World Trade Center Sustainable Design Guidelines. These guidelines seek to encourage developers to achieve the standard Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) certification, and possibly LEED Silver rating (the U.S. Green Building Council's rating system for green buildings). While guidelines of this type have traditionally focused on a specific project or development type, the World Trade Center site, as it exists today, allows its building parties to go beyond the traditional approaches to environmental design, and capture the scale of urban density, the extent of mix-use development and the nature of uniquely integrated infrastructure. In fact, the rebuilding parties are able to create new standards that are an expansion of the traditional model for green guidelines. The purpose of the sustainable design guidelines is both to establish a new level of environmental quality for an urban center model and to identify the pathways to higher performance over time, and potentially establish a leadership model of urban sustainability.

Pace University Green Roof Project

The the Green Roof Project is the result of extensive cooperation between Pace University, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency Region 2, New York City Department of Environmental Protection (DEP), and the New York City Department of Design and Construction (DDC); it will be the largest green roof in the Northeastern United States. The 35,000 square foot green roof will demonstrate New York City's commitment to innovative and sustainable growth.

1 Economic Impact of Redeveloping the World Trade Center Site: New York City, New York State, and the New York-New Jersey area, a report prepared by Applesseed for the LMDC, released on October 30, 2003.

2 The Lower Manhattan Development Corporation's HUD-Funded Projects and Programs: Leading Economic Revitalization in lower Manhattan, a report prepared by Applesseed in association with the Louis Berger Group, Inc. November, 2004.