

1

2 LOWER MANHATTAN DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

3 - - - - - x

4 PUBLIC MEETING

5

RE: DRAFT SCOPE
WORLD TRADE CENTER MEMORIAL
and REDEVELOPMENT PLAN
GENERIC ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT
STATEMENT

8

- - - - - x

9

10 Tribeca Performing Arts
Center
11 Chambers Street
12 New York, New York

13 July 23, 2003
14 6:10 p.m.

14

15

16

B E F O R E :

17

JOHN FEERICK, ESQ.,
The Hearing Officer

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.
521 FIFTH AVENUE - 17TH FLOOR
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10175
(212) 840-1167

25

1

2 A P P E A R A N C E S :

3

For the Lower Manhattan Development Corporation:

4

Kevin Rampe, President

5

Andrew Winters, Vice President/
Director of Planning, Design and
Development

6

7

Irene Chang, General Counsel

8

Jennifer Brown, Assistant Vice President
Community and Government Affairs

9

10 Marcus Ribeiro, Community Affairs Liaison

11 Chara Tappin, Community Affairs Liaison

12 John Leo, Community Affairs Liaison

13 Hugh Eastwood

14

15 For The Port Authority of New York and
New Jersey:

16

Bill Wong

17

18

For Carter Ledyard & Milburn LLP:

19

Stephen L. Kass

20

Samantha Klein

21

22

For AKRF:

23

Charles Fields

24

George K. Penesis

25

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2

P R O C E E D I N G S

3

4

PRESIDENT RAMPE: I think we're
ready to get started.

6

My name is Kevin Rampe. I'm the
President of the Lower Manhattan Development
Corporation.

9

And I will start by welcoming
everyone to our first public comment meeting
regarding the process for the World Trade
Center plan.

13

As we enter this critical phase in
the rebuilding process, I am pleased to see
so many individuals interested in
participating in the redevelopment of
Downtown's future.

18

Rebuilding the World Trade Center
site is going to be a tremendous undertaking
and will require the coordination of many
agencies and individuals. It will also
require collaboration from you, the business
owners, residents and employees of Lower
Manhattan.

25

It has been your participation

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 that has enabled the rebuilding process to
3 reach this point and your input will continue
4 to be one of the guiding forces that pushes
5 this process forward so I just want to thank
6 all of you for being here this evening.

7 Last month the LMDC released the
8 Draft Scope of the Generic Environmental
9 Impact Statement. This document was created
10 to serve as a guide for the environmental
11 review of potential environmental impacts
12 that could arise from the plan for the
13 16-acre World Trade Center site.

14 Today we invite you to make public
15 comments on the Draft Scope. Your comments
16 are part of the scoping process that
17 identifies the issues and alternatives to be
18 evaluated in the Generic Environmental Impact
19 Statement itself.

20 The GEIS will examine several
21 areas, including the construction of the
22 World Trade Center Memorial, the placement of
23 retail, commercial and facility spaces, the
24 changing street grid and other components of
25 the World Trade Center site master plan.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 The scoping process will be fluid
3 and changes will be made as we move along.

4 For example, since the Draft was
5 released, another alternative for analysis
6 that would expand the redevelopment site to
7 include one or more adjacent parcels has
8 already been added.

9 Today we are here to listen to
10 your comments and suggestions on the Draft
11 Scope.

12 Joining us in our listening
13 efforts is a member of the planning team at
14 the Port Authority of New York and New
15 Jersey, Bill Wong.

16 Going forward, I encourage
17 everyone to continue to participate by
18 visiting our Website, www.renewnyc.com, for
19 the latest news and mail in your written
20 comments to the LMDC. We will continue to
21 accept comments on the Draft Scope through
22 August 4th.

23 Thank you for attending the public
24 meeting again.

25 And to take us through today's

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 meeting is a distinguished member of the
3 legal community and former Dean of Fordham
4 Law School, John Feerick. I am pleased to
5 introduce him to you.

6 Thank you, Dean Feerick, for your
7 contribution.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
9 very much.

10 As you just said, I will be
11 serving as Hearing Officer for this evening's
12 public comment meeting.

13 This is the second of two sessions
14 today. The first began at 2 o'clock and ran
15 to I believe about 4:30 and the session
16 tonight is scheduled to run to, if necessary,
17 9 o'clock.

18 As Kevin mentioned, the purpose of
19 the meeting is to solicit public comments on
20 the Draft Scope of the Generic Environmental
21 Impact Statement for the World Trade Center
22 Memorial and Redevelopment Plan which was
23 released on June 20, 2003.

24 Copies of the Draft Scope are
25 available at the registration table at the

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 entrance to this theater and also on the
3 Lower Manhattan Development Corporation's
4 Website.

5 Shortly Andrew Winters, Vice
6 President, Director of Planning, Design and
7 Development for the Lower Manhattan
8 Development Corporation, will give you a
9 short presentation on the Draft Scope. His
10 presentation also was given earlier today at
11 the first session.

12 After Andrew is finished, we will
13 begin the public comment portion of this
14 meeting, which, as I mentioned, will last
15 until 9:00 p.m.

16 Anyone who wants to provide
17 comments at this meeting must register to do
18 so at the registration desk outside this
19 theater.

20 If we reach the maximum number of
21 speakers for this session, we will close
22 registration and I will notify you when
23 registration is closed.

24 And obviously we welcome as well
25 written statements from anyone who is here or

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 anyone not here who would like to submit a
3 written statement.

4 It's now my pleasure to introduce
5 to you Andrew Winters.

6 MR. WINTERS: Thank you.

7 Hi.

8 My name is Andrew Winters and I'm
9 Vice President and Director for Planning,
10 Design and Development at Lower Manhattan
11 Development Corporation.

12 Today at this public comment
13 meeting on the Draft Scope for the Generic
14 Environmental Impact Statement, also known as
15 the GEIS, for the World Trade Center Memorial
16 and Redevelopment Plan, I'm going to outline
17 briefly the two programs that form that plan.

18 The two programs for the World
19 Trade Center site that work together and
20 combined form the site plan are:

21 First, a memorial and cultural
22 program developed by LMDC that introduces new
23 uses to the site.

24 Second, a redevelopment program
25 created jointly by The Port Authority and the

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 LMDC that restores the uses on the site that
3 existed prior to September 11, 2001.

4 The World Trade Center Memorial
5 and Redevelopment Plan provides for the
6 construction of a memorial and memorial
7 related improvements, a museum and cultural
8 facilities, new open space areas, up to
9 10 million square feet of commercial office
10 space, up to one million square feet of
11 retail space, up to one million square feet
12 of conference center and hotel facilities and
13 related infrastructure improvements.

14 This slide shows the World Trade
15 Center site and the location of the Lower
16 Manhattan station and permanent PATH
17 terminal.

18 The construction of a permanent
19 PATH terminal and its related pedestrian
20 concourses which form the public
21 transportation infrastructure for the site
22 are the subject of a separate environmental
23 review process and they are not part of this
24 project.

25 This slide shows the new memorial

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 and cultural uses that will be introduced to
3 the site.

4 The LMDC is committed to building
5 an appropriate memorial to the victims of the
6 terrorist attacks of September 11th, 2001 and
7 February 26th, 1993.

8 To this end, we've designated a
9 4.7 acre area, shown here in the green hatch,
10 that forms the setting for the World Trade
11 Center Memorial competition which is
12 currently underway.

13 We expect that the memorial jury
14 will have identified the winning design for
15 that memorial by fall. The selected memorial
16 design will be described in more detail in
17 the GEIS.

18 Surrounding the memorial site on
19 two sides will be new buildings housing
20 cultural uses, shown here in light red, a new
21 type of site use that did not exist
22 previously at the World Trade Center, a third
23 site for cultural uses, including a possible
24 performing arts center, is located just north
25 of Fulton Street.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

The LMDC has extended an invitation to cultural organizations interested in locating a museum, a performing arts center and/or other cultural facilities at this site. Together, the memorial and these cultural uses form a new program for the site.

9

10

11

12

13

The overall plan also introduces a new street network and a number of public open spaces, shown here in green, that connect the site with the surrounding neighborhoods.

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

The proposed plan introduces Greenwich Street and Fulton Street for both vehicular and pedestrian use in locations that did not exist at the World Trade Center prior to September 11th, although both streets existed prior to the construction of the original World Trade Center in the 1960s.

21

22

23

24

25

Two new open spaces form a bow tie that connects Fulton Street through the site, the Wedge of Light Plaza that runs on the permanent PATH terminal and the Park of Heroes along Fulton Street which connects

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 cultural facilities and extends the public
3 space along Fulton Street west toward the
4 Winter Garden.

5 In addition, the Liberty Street
6 Park provides an at grade public open space
7 south of the memorial site.

8 As you will see in the next few
9 slides, the proposed plan also includes the
10 replacement of uses that existed at the site
11 prior to September 11th, 2001 based on a
12 program established by The Port Authority
13 that honors its obligation toward its
14 leaseholders.

15 Here we see on the northwest block
16 the 1776 Freedom Tower where the tallest
17 building on the site will be located.

18 Here we see on the northeast block
19 what would be a hotel and conference center,
20 as well as an office building with ground
21 floor retail.

22 Here on the southeast corner are
23 two office towers that will be separated by
24 Cortlandt Way, a pedestrian street, that
25 would extend the view cover of Cortlandt

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Street through to the memorial site and
3 beyond.

4 Cortlandt Way will have retail
5 stores on both sides and may be covered by a
6 glass canopy.

7 The LMDC and Port Authority are
8 working together with Studio Daniel Libeskind
9 and The Port Authority's lessees to develop
10 design guidelines consistent with the overall
11 master plan for the commercial, office and
12 retail structures whose development will be
13 staged over time.

14 These two programs together form
15 the World Trade Center Memorial and
16 Redevelopment Plan.

17 The plan that I just reviewed
18 forms the Proposed Action that will be
19 reviewed and analyzed in the GEIS, a draft of
20 which will be available for public
21 consideration in the fall.

22 The Draft Scope GEIS is the
23 subject of today's meeting.

24 The standard practice in an
25 environmental review is to create baseline

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 conditions describing what we call existing
3 conditions and future conditions without the
4 Proposed Action.

5 Due to the unique historical
6 circumstances at the World Trade Center site,
7 as well as the complexity of the planning
8 context and the scale of the project, two
9 baseline conditions will be established and
10 used to measure the impacts of the Proposed
11 Action as shown here on this slide.

12 The current condition scenario
13 will create a baseline of conditions with the
14 site in its current condition in 2003.

15 The pre-September 11th scenario
16 will be a baseline that reflects conditions
17 at the site and in the surrounding areas as
18 they would have been absent the events of
19 September 11, 2001.

20 The impacts of the Proposed Action
21 will be compared to each of these baseline
22 conditions.

23 The Draft Scope contemplates that
24 the GEIS will contain, in addition to a
25 project description, analyses of a broad

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 array of potential environmental impacts,
3 including the following:

4 Project description; land use and
5 public policy; socioeconomic conditions;
6 community facilities and services; open space
7 areas and recreational facilities; shadows;
8 historic resources; urban design and visual
9 resources; neighborhood character; hazardous
10 materials; infrastructure, solid waste and
11 sanitation and energy; traffic and parking,
12 transit and pedestrians; air quality; noise;
13 coastal zone; flood plain; construction
14 impacts; environmental justice; mitigation;
15 and alternatives.

16 The GEIS will consider a broad
17 range of alternatives to the Proposed Action.
18 These alternatives will include the
19 following:

20 The no-action alternative: This
21 would leave the World Trade Center site in
22 approximately its present condition after
23 completion of the permanent World Trade
24 Center PATH terminal and interim
25 improvements.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 The restoration alternative:

3 Restore the World Trade Center site

4 substantially as it existed before

5 September 11th, 2001.

6 Rebuilding alternatives: These

7 would be drawn from the plans previously

8 considered by the LMDC during the final

9 stages of LMDC's Innovative Design Study and

10 would likely include an alternative plan

11 similar to the Towers of Culture proposal

12 considered during that study as well as a

13 memorial only alternative.

14 Distributed bulk alternative:

15 This would be similar to the Proposed Action

16 except that the office space to be located

17 along the east side of the World Trade Center

18 site would be distributed into four slimmer

19 buildings rather than three towers identified

20 in the Proposed Action.

21 Redistributed retail: This

22 alternative would consider the alternative

23 configurations for the retail uses to be

24 included as part of the Proposed Action.

25 Reduced impact or no impact

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 alternative: This alternative would vary
3 uses, density or other major components of
4 the Proposed Action in order to eliminate or
5 to reduce to a bare minimum any significant
6 adverse impacts of the Proposed Action.

7 Design alternatives: These would
8 vary major design components of the project
9 uses in order to reduce any visual, shadow,
10 wind or similar environmental impacts.

11 Enhanced green construction
12 alternative: This alternative would consider
13 the environmental benefits and costs of
14 feasible construction, waste disposal and
15 other project environmental management
16 practices not already incorporated into the
17 Proposed Action.

18 And finally, the expanded site
19 alternative: This is a new alternative that
20 would expand the project site to include one
21 or more adjacent areas that would permit
22 distribution of the bulk of the proposed
23 development and below grade transportation
24 and servicing infrastructure.

25 The last chapter of the GEIS will

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

be an executive summary.

We look forward to hearing your comments on the Draft Scope for Generic Environmental Impact Statement and on the World Trade Center Memorial and Redevelopment Plan.

After we complete our review of all documents on the Draft Scope that LMDC receives by 5:00 p.m. through August 4th, 2003, we will release the final scope of the GEIS for this plan.

Thank you.

At this time I'd like to turn the meeting back over to our Hearing Officer.

THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you very much.

I open the public comment portion of this meeting and would like to mention the framework that we worked out that seemed to go reasonably well this afternoon, and that is, I'm unaware of how many people would like to have comments and in order to provide a maximum opportunity for as many people as possible, we set out a framework that

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 basically suggested that each speaker have
3 three minutes for his or her remarks.

4 The slide would go up 30 seconds
5 were left and then when the words "thank you"
6 showed up on the screen, that would indicate
7 that the three minutes had run.

8 We also have a reporter here who
9 will be taking down all the comments given at
10 this session, as was the case this afternoon
11 as well.

12 And speakers that would like to
13 provide a written statement as well as their
14 oral presentation we would hope would leave
15 with the reporter a copy of the written
16 statement as well. It would be very helpful
17 certainly for the record of this meeting.

18 We worked out a system in terms of
19 the order of the speakers based on when
20 speakers had registered to speak, and I
21 pretty much this afternoon worked off cards
22 of those who had registered and pulled out
23 the names in the order which speakers are
24 registered.

25 And I would encourage anyone who

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 hasn't registered to give comments tonight
3 who would like to do so to take advantage of
4 the opportunity to register and we're hopeful
5 that anyone who wishes to have comments will
6 have the opportunity to make some comments
7 but that's subject to the volume.

8 Right now we have 19 individuals
9 who have signed the book indicating they
10 would like to have comments, so I'm going to
11 proceed with the first and I will read out
12 periodically three or four names so everyone
13 will have some idea of when their moment
14 would arise.

15 So I would also add that there is
16 a Website and information about how you can
17 access the Lower Manhattan Development
18 Corporation if you would wish to provide
19 written comments, whether or not you take
20 advantage of the opportunity to speak
21 tonight.

22 So the first four individuals who
23 have indicated they would like to speak are
24 Carl Galioto, I think I didn't do that right,
25 Joan Byron, Pat Dillon and Bill Hough.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 So why don't we start with Carl
3 and we'd ask each speaker to use one of the
4 two microphones and if you would identify
5 yourself and also your affiliation.

6 Thank you very much.

7 MR. CARL GALIOTO: Good evening.

8 My name is Carl Galioto and I'm a
9 partner at Skidmore, Owings & Merrill
10 Architects.

11 We have been advisor to
12 Silverstein Properties for the World Trade
13 Center site master plan and we are the
14 architects for the first tower, designing it
15 in collaboration with Daniel Libeskind.

16 SOM is enthused to be a partner in
17 this collaboration and is supportive of the
18 principles of the Libeskind plan and its key
19 objectives as being essential to future
20 development.

21 Those essential objectives are the
22 creation of a regional transportation center,
23 the restoration of commercial development,
24 the restoration of street patterns and urban
25 fabric, the creation of important public

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 spaces and the creation of cultural spaces
3 and facilities.

4 This project is important not only
5 for New York City but also for the nation and
6 the world due to its vast symbolic and
7 historic significance.

8 It was on September 20th, 1776, a
9 date that's strangely close to
10 September 11th, that the great New York fire
11 ravaged much of what was then New York,
12 including destroying the buildings that were
13 on the site of what is now the World Trade
14 Center site.

15 New York rebuilt from those ruins
16 to become the great commercial capital that
17 it is today and throughout its history New
18 York has demonstrated a resiliency to
19 catastrophe that has resulted in rebirth and
20 reinvention.

21 Now, in the early years of this
22 new century, this rebirth will be a symbol of
23 remembrance, healing, vitality and democracy.

24 For this project to be successful,
25 it must be a vibrant mix of uses that

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 recognizes commerce and culture are at the
3 heart of New York's character and that this
4 center at New York's historic core will also
5 be the hub of a public transportation network
6 reaching to every corner of the metropolitan
7 area.

8 This development will be a model
9 of urbanism that will create densities that
10 are consistent with the Downtown context and
11 commercial objectives while creating an
12 environment that supports urban activity
13 including street level interaction and
14 appropriately oriented and scaled public
15 spaces and view corridors.

16 Of great importance and concern
17 will be the safety of the building occupants.
18 As the architect for Silverstein Properties
19 at Seven World Trade Center, SOM and the rest
20 of the design team have incorporated numerous
21 safety enhancements within the building
22 design that far exceed existing building
23 codes.

24 Some of these enhancements are
25 likely to be incorporated into future

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 building codes.

3

4 We intend to provide similar
5 design enhancements and are developing the
6 design for the new tower.

7

8 We also successfully demonstrated
9 at Seven World Trade Center that commercial
10 office development can be environmentally
11 responsive and these philosophies remain
12 consistent as the tower design evolves.

13

14 This project, by virtue of its
15 density and connection to mass transit, will
16 clearly define the urban center as an
17 environmentally responsive solution to the
18 bane of sprawl and the consequent waste of
19 resources.

20

21 We are confident that this
22 historic collaboration, not only between two
23 architects but also between public and
24 private sector, among public agencies, and
25 most importantly, among we, the people of New
26 York City, will create the heart of our great
27 city.

28

29 Thank you.

30

31 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 very much.

3 Joan Byron.

4 MS. JOAN BYRON: My name is Joan
5 Byron. I'm also an architect, Architectural
6 Director at the Pratt Institute Center for
7 Community and Environmental Development.

8 And we've historically served a
9 little different clientele than Skidmore,
10 Owings & Merrill, though I think we aspire to
11 a lot of the same goals.

12 We provide planning, architectural
13 services to disenfranchised communities
14 throughout New York City and have done that
15 for almost 40 years institutionally.

16 We are also co-conveners and
17 co-founders of the Civic Alliance, and I know
18 you've heard from some of my colleagues at
19 the Civic Alliance this afternoon, and like
20 them, I stress that I'm speaking now for the
21 Pratt Center rather than for the Civic
22 Alliance and specifically would like to
23 address the issues of environmental justice
24 and sustainability that need to be examined
25 in the GEIS.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 The cost of doing business in
3 Manhattan conventionally right now includes
4 demanding thousands of megawatts of electric
5 power, exporting millions of tons of
6 residential and commercial trash, generating
7 millions of gallons of sewage, drawing truck
8 traffic from all over the city.

9 All the infrastructure, all the
10 facilities that make life possible Downtown
11 without exception are located someplace else.
12 Okay. They're in our region's poorest
13 communities, the spaces where people of color
14 and our new immigrants live because that's
15 where they can afford to live.

16 The residents of those communities
17 today pay the environmental cost with keeping
18 New York a world city.

19 The reconstruction of the World
20 Trade Center is an opportunity to set an
21 example for the world in how that paradigm
22 can be reversed.

23 This map, which we will also
24 provide with our written comments, shows
25 where the facilities are located that keep

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Lower Manhattan and, of course, Midtown
3 Manhattan the vital places that they are in
4 our economy.

5 The buses that move people
6 Downtown are garaged in Harlem.

7 You flush a toilet Downtown, the
8 sewage goes either to the North River plant
9 in Harlem or to Newtown Creek in Greenpoint,
10 Brooklyn.

11 Every bit of food that's eaten
12 Downtown is trucked through the giant complex
13 at Hunt's Point in the South Bronx where it
14 shares the road system and the land with our
15 commercial trash.

16 The garbage that doesn't go to
17 Hunt's Point goes to Greenpoint,
18 Williamsburg, it goes to Sunset Park.

19 The electricity that's used
20 Downtown is generated at any number of sites
21 in the city, all of them in our outlying
22 low-income communities, including the six new
23 plants that were built, sited, designed and
24 built over a period of ten months in 2001 by
25 the New York Power Authority.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The net impact of building 11 million square feet on the World Trade Center site conventionally is going to be to add to the environmental burdens that those communities now bear.

So we would like to see the GEIS consider very carefully first under Task 11, infrastructure, solid waste, sanitation and energy, and Task 13, air quality, and certainly Task 18, environmental justice.

The study area cannot be confined to Manhattan below Chambers Street or Canal Street or Houston Street.

The study area must encompass the communities that house the facilities that make life possible here.

The baseline certainly cannot be the condition of the site the day before September 11th. We cannot afford to maintain the mentality that prevailed when the World Trade Center was conceived when concepts of sustainability and environmental justice had not yet entered the mainstream of planning and design and engineering.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 (Applause)

3 Thank you.

4 We can do better and we have to do
5 better.6 And finally, we want to see the
7 GEIS delineate clearly and give serious
8 consideration to real no impact and real
9 enhanced green alternatives.10 We need those not to be a
11 strongman as obviously some of the
12 alternatives on the list must be.13 We need them to be clearly spelled
14 out and we need them to be considered not
15 simply in terms of whether they are net
16 present value positive for the site.17 We need the reconstruction of this
18 site to symbolize, as my colleague just said,
19 a renewal of our city and a new way for New
20 York to maintain leadership as a world city.

21 The whole world is watching.

22 Thank you.

23 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
24 very much.

25 Will you be filing your statement

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 and the map with the reporter?

3 MS. JOAN BYRON: Yes.

4 THE HEARING OFFICER: That would
5 be great.

6 Thank you.

7 Pat Dillon.

8 MS. PAT DILLON: Yes, I'm Pat
9 Dillon and I represent Concerned Tenants of
10 Independence Plaza North.

11 The Governor, the LMDC and other
12 parties are in a really big hurry to start
13 construction of this project.

14 One of the things that must be
15 contained in the EIS for the Proposed Action
16 is an explanation of the need for rushing the
17 environmental review process.

18 First, the site of this planned
19 development is very problematic from an
20 environmental point of view.

21 Second, the surrounding area has
22 been greatly affected by the events of
23 September 11th and their aftermath.

24 And finally, the impacts of this
25 enormous project will be felt by residents,

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 workers and visitors for the foreseeable
3 future.

4 At least the usual three or so
5 years of environmental should be allowed for
6 environmental study, and if they're not going
7 to be, we should know the reasons why and
8 they should be included in the EIS.

9 The public also should be informed
10 of the contents of any relevant memos of
11 understanding. All such MOUs, including the
12 one between the LMDC and The Port Authority
13 that has been reportedly signed, must be
14 included in the EIS.

15 As to analysis format, page 8, the
16 Draft Scope proposes to use two scenarios for
17 establishing baseline conditions in the study
18 area. One, the WTC site as it presently
19 exists, and two, the site as it existed
20 before the 9/11 attack.

21 Using the second imaginary
22 scenario will only confuse and obfuscate the
23 real environmental and other impacts of the
24 Proposed Action. The second scenario should
25 be eliminated from the analysis.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 Hazmats, page 16, the Draft Scope
3 pays virtually no attention to hazardous
4 materials that may presently exist at the
5 World Trade Center site.

6 Task 10 consists of only one
7 sentence which says the EIS "will assess the
8 potential effects of exposure to any
9 hazardous materials found." The scope must
10 detail how hazardous materials are to be
11 identified.

12 In September 2002, a report was
13 prepared by the Contaminants of Potential
14 Concern Committee of the World Trade Center
15 Indoor Air Task Force Working Group.

16 The contributors to that report
17 were from the United States Environmental
18 Protection Agency, New York City Department
19 of Health, the Agency for Toxic Substances
20 and Disease Registries, New York State
21 Department of Health and OSHA and it was all
22 the usual official suspects.

23 Based on ambient air, indoor air
24 and indoor/outdoor bulk dust monitoring, data
25 collected after the destruction of the World

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Trade Center -- monitoring data collected
3 after the destruction of the World Trade
4 Center, the committee found the following
5 hazardous substances to exist at high enough
6 levels to be of potential concern: Lead,
7 PAHs, dioxin, asbestos, fibrous glass and
8 crystalline silica.

9 At the very least, comprehensive
10 testing of the World Trade Center site for
11 these substances must be included in the EIS.

12 If such testing has been done
13 since the end of the recovery and clean up of
14 the site, the report must be included in the
15 EIS.

16 Demolition and construction,
17 page 24, post 9/11 recovery and clean up of
18 the World Trade Center site was carried out
19 in a very careless and dangerous manner.

20 No discernible procedures to
21 protect workers and/or residents were
22 followed, no efforts to contain the smoke and
23 fumes of the fires and only haphazard
24 attempts to control the toxic dust blown into
25 our neighborhoods for over eight months from

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 the recovery and waste transfer operations.

3 Such regards for the health and
4 welfare of citizens cannot be allowed during
5 the upcoming 15 or so years of
6 reconstruction.

7 The scope must specify that the
8 Clean Air Act's NESFHAP's standards and
9 requirements be strictly followed during
10 demolition and construction in the entire
11 study area below Canal Street river to river.

12 Thank you.

13 (Applause)

14 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
15 very much.

16 For those who may have just come
17 in, I just want to say there's an opportunity
18 to give comments tonight. In order to do so,
19 it would be necessary to register outside at
20 the desk and I will call the names out in the
21 order in which individuals registered.

22 And in order to make possible the
23 maximum number of people to give comments
24 tonight, we're asking commenters to limit
25 their remarks to three minutes and the slide

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 is there to assist them in that effort.

3 And anyone that has a written
4 statement can file a written statement as
5 well as give the oral statement with the
6 reporter here.

7 The next four in the order in
8 which they registered is Bill Hough, Ron
9 Devito, George Haikalis and Andrew Oliff.

10 Bill.

11 MR. BILL HOUGH: Good evening.

12 My name is Bill Hough. I live in
13 Midtown Manhattan and I work at 59 Maiden
14 Lane, about three blocks east of the site in
15 question.

16 I'm a member of the group Team
17 Twin Towers, although I'm not the official
18 spokesman, you will hear from him later this
19 evening, so these remarks are strictly my own
20 comments.

21 Comment number one, this process
22 is fundamentally flawed simply because this
23 is not a proposed redevelopment, it's not an
24 academic exercise and, you know, redeveloping
25 a community.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 This is a site that was destroyed
3 by an act of war and essentially the regular
4 rules should not apply to this ponderous
5 analysis but nonetheless it's here.

6 The site on page 6, the so-called
7 Proposed Action, there's so many problems
8 with this plan that I only want to speak to
9 two of them right now due to time.

10 Number one, the Wedge of Light is
11 nothing of the kind. The Wedge of Light has
12 been documented to essentially that location
13 is going to be in shadow on September 11th in
14 the years going forward. That was a sleight
15 of hand trick by the architect to try to get
16 approval for his plan.

17 The other comment I would like to
18 make is that restoring the street grid is
19 absolutely unnecessary. Lower Manhattan has
20 a sufficient amount of vehicular congestion,
21 cars, trucks, what have you, that the last
22 thing we need is to build more streets to
23 encourage more of that motorized traffic down
24 here. If anything, we should be closing
25 streets to vehicles and encouraging

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 pedestrian uses and mass transit.

3 So moving forward then, the
4 analysis format on page 9, I disagree
5 completely with the previous speaker.

6 The current conditions scenario
7 again reflects an artificial situation that
8 never should have happened. The only way to
9 properly analyze this project is to use the
10 pre-September 11th scenario because anybody
11 who accepts the current scenario is ignoring
12 the act of war that brought it about. So
13 essentially the pre-September 11th scenario
14 is what should be looked at in the context of
15 rebuilding this site.

16 And then moving forward to the
17 alternatives on page 26, in item d,
18 subsection ii, the restoration alternative is
19 fundamentally flawed and apparently it's a
20 strongman that you intend to knock down in
21 your justification for the Libeskind plan.

22 In reality, what you say is
23 restore the WTC site substantially as it
24 existed before September 11th is what should
25 be done but it doesn't reflect any political

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 reality that the Governor has essentially
3 declared that the former footprints of the
4 former towers are going to be the site of the
5 memorial.

6 Therefore, the restoration
7 alternative needs to include the possibility
8 of restoring the World Trade Center with the
9 new towers essentially offset from the
10 footprints of the old towers if, in fact, it
11 is decided that the memorial would be on the
12 former footprints.

13 So unless the restoration
14 alternative is modified to reflect that, it's
15 essentially irrelevant. Essentially the
16 modified restoration alternative is what
17 should be built.

18 The other problem with this
19 process is that there's been some discussion
20 about reducing the number of office square
21 feet on the site. That's bad because, again,
22 the previous speaker spoke about expanding
23 the study area, any reduction in the amount
24 of office space is just going to encourage
25 more suburban sprawl.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 It will force offices, companies
3 to leave Manhattan, probably to relocate in
4 suburban office parks that take away valuable
5 rural land and essentially would just cause
6 more suburban blight. So essentially you
7 need to look at these sort of unintended
8 consequences when you do your analysis.

9 So in closing I would like to say
10 that the restoration alternative in
11 paragraph d, subsection ii needs to be
12 modified to accurately take into account the
13 political ramifications, leaving the former
14 footprints bare but yet restoring the twin
15 towers on another portion of the World Trade
16 Center site.

17 Thank you for your time.

18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

19 Ron Devito.

20 MR. RON DEVITO: Good evening.

21 I'm Ron Devito, Vice President
22 Team Twin Towers.org.

23 Libeskind's plan fails
24 environmental review on many counts. First,
25 it calls for clustering a number of large

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 buildings on Church Street in flagrant
3 violation of the New York City zoning
4 resolution.

5 According to a study performed by
6 architect Eli Attia, implementation of
7 Libeskind's plan would result in the worst
8 light and air quality in all of Manhattan.

9 Second, few would quarrel with
10 opening the street grid through the WTC site
11 for pedestrian only traffic. The Pataki
12 mandate of the Libeskind plan, however, opens
13 the grid to vehicular traffic.

14 Cars, trucks and buses traveling
15 down the narrow streets in this densely
16 planned site would only add air and noise
17 pollution, as well as poses a possible
18 security risk to this high-profile property.

19 Recall that in 1993 the first
20 attack was with a truck bomb, a most common
21 terrorist weapon.

22 Third, the open pit, which is a
23 central element in Libeskind's plan, requires
24 Downtown residents, visitors and workers to
25 circumnavigate the WTC site to get to and

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 from their destinations.

3 For nearly two years the LMDC and
4 groups such as the Civic Alliance preached
5 and lectured to the public about the
6 necessity of restoring connectivity within
7 the WTC site.

8 The result, we go from a super
9 block that was mildly inconvenient to
10 traverse to a 30-foot deep hole that must be
11 circumnavigated.

12 Is that the best this process
13 could do, to go from mild inconvenience to
14 impossibility when it comes to crossing the
15 site from west to east?

16 The open pit would also be
17 constantly flooded from rain and snow.

18 In the last two weeks, the most
19 laughable piece of news hit the media.
20 Apparently the WTC site cannot hold
21 10 million square feet of space, more land is
22 needed, and now The Port Authority wants the
23 Deutsche Bank property.

24 Funny, the site managed to hold
25 10 million square feet until September 10th,

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 2001. Perhaps Libeskind's plan is just a tad
3 less space efficient, just a tad.

4 Silverstein, The Port Authority
5 and the LMDC can spend the next generation
6 mulling this one over. It's a very tough
7 problem when the only direction you know how
8 to build is out.

9 They're content to spend millions
10 of your tax dollars to research this problem.
11 If they walk into a gift shop, they will see
12 hundreds of postcards, calendars, trinkets
13 which show the obvious solution to this issue
14 and the environmental problems I mentioned.

15 The WTC site does not need
16 additional land to hold 10 million square
17 feet. It does not need a dense cluster of
18 four, five, six or more buildings to hold
19 that square footage.

20 The WTC site needs only two offset
21 110-story buildings constructed not to 1968
22 standards but to the standards of the new
23 millennium, two.

24 THE HEARING OFFICER: I want to
25 say thank you.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The number of people who want to speak has grown so I'm going to limit the speakers to three minutes but say if you have a written statement, please do file it with the reporter so that we have everything that you wanted to say on the record.

Our next speaker is George Haikalis.

MR. GEORGE HAIKALIS: My name is George Haikalis. I'm the President of the Institute for Rational Urban Mobility, and I'll try to read a few excerpts from the written statement I'll leave.

And also I have extra copies if others in the audience are interested.

The statement that I've prepared also includes comments we made at an earlier hearing a little over a year ago on transportation issues affecting Lower Manhattan and I'll highlight those that affect the World Trade Center site.

An important opportunity exists to greatly improve the region's transit system by linking the PATH line to the Lexington

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 No. 6 local as shown in the attached
3 illustration. Both lines were built in the
4 early 1900s with similar dimensions and
5 through-running of trains is feasible.

6 Before the construction of the
7 World Trade Center in 1962, several public
8 agencies seriously considered making a track
9 connection between these two lines as an
10 alternative to the plan that was selected.

11 Now with the destruction of the
12 Trade Center it is possible to reconsider
13 this possibility. There are advantages to
14 both passengers and transit agencies.

15 For New Jersey residents, travel
16 to Manhattan's East Side, Union Square, East
17 Village, SoHo, Chinatown and Civic Center
18 will be greatly eased by eliminating long
19 walks and multiple transfers.

20 Easing access will simulate travel
21 to these business centers.

22 Manhattan residents from these
23 districts will be able to more easily reach
24 the rebuilt World Trade Center and also the
25 growing job opportunities in Jersey City and

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 Hoboken.

3

4

The No. 6 local has a capacity to accommodate these additional passengers.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

One option is for the PATH to be merged into the much larger New York City Transit subway system. The Port Authority can contract for service on this through operation just as Connecticut now pays Metro-North for its share of New Haven Line service.

12

13

14

15

By eliminating its own separate rail unit, The Port Authority can enjoy substantial savings in operating, maintenance and administrative costs.

16

17

18

19

New York City Transit can greatly benefit from access to the modern repair shop recently built by PATH in Harrison, New Jersey.

20

21

22

23

24

25

Opportunities exist for substantial capital cost savings by building a much simpler station for through operation not unlike the recently rebuilt New York City Transit 1 and 9 subway station within the World Trade Center site.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 These savings may more than offset
3 the cost of making the track connections and
4 necessary change in the PATH system in New
5 Jersey.

6 With a simple through station, the
7 bulk of underground space at the World Trade
8 Center site can be used for other purposes.

9 The full footprints of the fallen
10 towers can be incorporated into the memorial
11 unencumbered with rail appurtenances as is
12 now the case with the temporary PATH station.

13 A variety of routings through the
14 site are possible and should be considered in
15 the scope of this planning effort.

16 There are quite a few other items
17 here. There's not time to bring them up
18 tonight, I'm sorry, but I hope that you will
19 carefully read them and I would welcome an
20 opportunity to discuss them with staff.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: You'll file
22 a statement with the reporter so we can be
23 sure that everything you have in that
24 statement is read.

25 MR. GEORGE HAIKALIS: Yes, and I

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 have a statement for those in the audience
3 that would like copies as well.

4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
5 very much.

6 We have Andrew Oliff and then
7 Brett Cuvin, Joe Garofalo, Rachel Snyder and
8 Diane Dreyfus.

9 Andrew.

10 MR. OLIFF: My name is Andrew
11 Oliff and I'm a member of the World Trade
12 Center Restoration Movement.

13 The Libeskind plan is a blueprint
14 for an environmental disaster. The single
15 worst idea is to let vehicular traffic go
16 through the site.

17 If you open up Greenwich and
18 Fulton streets in that way, you will provide
19 a way for cars, trucks and tandem trailers to
20 bypass traffic jams on West Street for a
21 Holland and Brooklyn Battery Tunnel shortcut.

22 You will condemn the site to
23 constant noise pollution, exhaust fumes and
24 risk of death from motor vehicle accidents.

25 Drivers, as you are well aware,

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 are more concerned with avoiding traffic jams
3 than respecting the sanctity of the site.

4 Car traffic in Prospect Park has
5 been discontinued. Why must it be
6 reintroduced to the World Trade Center site?

7 Another issue is the pit as a
8 memorial setting. The slurry wall has a
9 specific engineering function and should not
10 be seen as a mawkish symbol.

11 How long will the tiebacks hold?

12 How long will the exposed pit wall
13 survive the freezing/thawing cycles and
14 erosion resulting from the elements over many
15 decades?

16 Are you prepared to stake the
17 lives of future generations of visitors on
18 the assumed perpetual integrity of that pit?

19 As a final point, if occupiable
20 height as tall as in the original World Trade
21 Center is built, density is reduced with
22 preservation of the office space and open
23 space is increased.

24 For that reason I urge you to
25 consider the restoration alternative or

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 alternative site plans that were discussed in
3 December, such as Think's Sky Park or the
4 Foster plan.

5 Thank you.

6 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
7 very much.

8 Joe Garofalo.

9 MR. JOE GAROFALO: I'm obviously a
10 resident and I just want to follow-up our
11 last meeting when I addressed the memorial
12 committee, which I didn't really -- I didn't
13 really address the topic then so let me try
14 and tie this one in.

15 I last time -- I'm just an artist
16 and I had a dream that Bankers Trust
17 collapsed and, you know, a lot of dream
18 vigor.

19 And I had dream about the first --
20 you know, about the real thing and that's how
21 I got out of it and -- but I'm sticking by my
22 scenario, although now if they tear Bankers
23 Trust down, I'll leave you alone, I'll leave
24 the neighborhood alone.

25 But if I'm right about that, I

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 think there would be like three attacks and
3 so when I addressed the memorial committee I
4 thought that it would be appropriate to take
5 that into account in terms of well, now we
6 know the memorial situation in terms of the
7 memorial will be constructed either way and
8 that would, you know, that would be our goal.

9 But okay, the environmental,
10 environmental, let's see, two sanitary towers
11 were constructed or commissioned.

12 I do research. I already spent
13 about Sarajevo the last ten years.

14 Two sanitary towers were
15 commissioned in 1864. The greater sani -- I
16 used to work at the Greater Sanitary District
17 of metropolitan Chicago.

18 The Sanitary District of Chicago
19 Project is a tunnel which would -- which is
20 basically how they built the -- well, this is
21 my -- the cross tunnel deal in Europe, you
22 know, linking France and England in the event
23 of say like a third world war or something,
24 that all will become very, you know, you
25 know, important.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 And mo -- I do a bit of
3 archeology. That's -- well, in New York
4 that's the Parks Department, Environmental
5 Protection, DEP.

6 Mo, modern, mo is a term for
7 modern glass, that would be mo DEP, which is
8 a modern glass bottle, 1970s I think, and
9 it's a modern wrapper, so that's I guess what
10 we would be meeting on.

11 In terms of environmental, my
12 scenario of Bankers Trust and environmental
13 aspects of say with that would be well,
14 slightly green, looking at asbestos in the
15 second tab.

16 That's basically about all I
17 wanted to say. I'm sticking by my scenario
18 and thank you very much.

19 I just wanted to follow-up my last
20 speech.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
22 very much.

23 And I see that I shuffled the
24 cards for once so, Brett Cavin, I apologize
25 for not having you before the previous

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 speaker as I promised you.

3 MR. BRETT CUVIN: Good evening.

4 My name is Brett Cuvin and I am
5 also part of Team Twin Towers.

6 In view of the plan developed by
7 Daniel Libeskind for the World Trade Center
8 site, it is important to note that there are
9 obvious sticking points of this particular
10 plan that render moot the environmental
11 compliance of the stated goals.

12 Let's describe how that is to
13 come. For starters, the way that Greenwich
14 Street is run through the site by no total
15 fault of Mr. Libeskind, however, as mandated
16 by the LMDC will bring increased pollution in
17 the form of additional traffic exhaust,
18 allowing vehicles to operate where open space
19 used to be. This naturally will produce
20 louder decibels of sound, diminishing the
21 effect of the memorial, just to use as a
22 beginning point.

23 Secondly, leaving the memorial
24 area as an open pit will undoubtedly bring
25 about its own destruction. How, one might

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 ask. The answer lies within two factors,
3 one, the weather, and two, heat trapping
4 issues that will summarily arise.

5 The weather, to top off the list
6 of impending problems, is the biggest
7 dilemma. Not only can rain make it virtually
8 impossible to reflect in the solemnity of the
9 designated memorial, snow with its attendant
10 problems will magnify that situation every
11 winter.

12 Coupled with this initial problem
13 will be the fact that if the slurry walls as
14 designated by Mr. Libeskind are left open to
15 the elements, rapid structural deterioration
16 will set in, setting the stage for possible
17 collapse of the entire site area.

18 I will not even touch on the
19 attendant problems that will obviously cause.

20 As I brushed upon earlier, heat
21 being trapped in such a confined area can
22 cause considerable health issues for those
23 visiting the memorial, not to mention the
24 fact that the previously mentioned vehicular
25 exhaust stemming from a reopened Greenwich

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Street can possibly travel in a downward
3 pattern into the memorial area, encouraging
4 the onset of respiratory diseases for those
5 potential employees and visitors of the World
6 Trade Center Memorial, many of which will be
7 children.

8 Finally, placing 10 million square
9 feet in a multitude of extremely short office
10 buildings will cause unnecessary
11 overcrowding, and adding the former Deutsche
12 Bank building to the World Trade Center site
13 eliminates that particular parcel from being
14 an independent tax-paying member of our
15 financial struggling city.

16 Utilizing a dual of extremely tall
17 office buildings better than what's currently
18 proposed will allow this important area to
19 function in a productive fashion, encourage
20 the design and subsequent placement for the
21 appropriate world class 9/11 Memorial,
22 preferably at street level, in addition to
23 maximizing the potential of the ever
24 increasing and economically, not to mention
25 politically, viable population of Lower

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Manhattan to participate in our city's
3 overall revitalization.

4 Thank you.

5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
6 very much.

7 Rachel Snyder.

8 MS. RACHEL SNYDER: Good evening.

9 My name is Rachel Snyder. I'm a
10 member of Team Twin Towers. I also work in
11 the World Financial Center.

12 There are a number of issues in
13 this plan that concern me that the least of
14 which is the street grid. I feel as a member
15 of this community that allowing vehicular
16 traffic through the World Trade Center site
17 would be an enormous mistake.

18 First of all, a large number of us
19 who live or work in the area don't even drive
20 there on a regular basis so this is not
21 something that would benefit the entire
22 community. In fact, it would cause traffic
23 headaches for those of us who need to walk
24 through it every day to get to work.

25 Perhaps the plaza that existed at

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 the old World Trade Center wasn't perfect but
3 it was something that everyone could use and
4 did not cause pollution and traffic problems.

5 Some of the worst air quality in
6 Manhattan would result from this plan. As
7 someone who works right across the street and
8 has to walk right past the site twice a day,
9 I am not thrilled by this prospect.

10 Furthermore, I am not comfortable
11 with the idea of placing a cluster of shorter
12 buildings so close to the streets.

13 As architect Eli Attia has
14 demonstrated, smaller buildings are easier to
15 destroy than larger buildings and this will
16 always be a high-profile area.

17 It seems silly to me that on the
18 one hand we hear we can't build taller
19 buildings because it would be a target and
20 then we hear that we should build shorter
21 buildings clustered together near the street
22 grid, near a restored street grid because it
23 would be a terrorist target.

24 This would be -- perhaps we could
25 look at this on a less harsh light if this

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 was a plan that most of us liked but it
3 isn't. It is despised by a large number of
4 us.

5 In fact, many more of us would
6 prefer just the regular restoration of the
7 old towers on the site, and it seems to me
8 that the old site provided less environmental
9 problems than this would.

10 So you are asking us to accept
11 something that we don't like as much as what
12 was there before and would cause more
13 problems than the old one did.

14 An open plaza where that was
15 available only to the pedestrians was not
16 something that would cause more pollution
17 like this would and it was something that we
18 could all use, not just those who drive in
19 Lower Manhattan.

20 Thank you.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

22 I have a slightly revised order of
23 speakers because there are several members
24 here who did speak at the session this
25 afternoon and will have an opportunity as I

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 see it right now to speak again tonight.

3 But I would like to provide at
4 this point an opportunity to those who have
5 not spoken at all today to speak at this
6 point and then if time is remaining, as I
7 believe it is right now, those who wish to
8 speak again tonight certainly we be provided
9 an opportunity.

10 The next speaker will be Alice
11 LaBrie and Richard Kennedy and then Allison
12 Tupper.

13 Alice.

14 MS. ALICE LaBRIE: Sir, I'm Alice
15 LaBrie.

16 Is it L-a-B --

17 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes, you're
18 next and thank you.

19 Would you identify your
20 affiliation.

21 MS. ALICE LaBRIE: I'm Alice
22 LaBrie and I'm here in my capacity as a
23 taxpayer and a citizen and a voter.

24 First of all, I would like to just
25 remind everyone not to lose sight of the fact

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 that we draw a tax revenue from this site and
3 we are desperate to have that restored, and
4 as we all know, tax revenue pays for our
5 infrastructure and our social services and to
6 also remind that it is a site that we hope
7 will restore jobs.

8 And secondly, I'd like to express
9 as a citizen, a taxpayer how grateful I am to
10 Larry Silverstein and how much faith I have
11 in SOM.

12 For those of you who may not
13 remember, developers built America and
14 without developers we wouldn't have an
15 America. They take extreme risks to bring us
16 tax revenue.

17 And also SOM, I'm totally relieved
18 that someone with experience is now in
19 charge.

20 Thank you.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
22 very much.

23 Richard Kennedy.

24 MR. RICHARD KENNEDY: Good
25 evening.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 My name is Richard Kennedy. I'm
3 the Vice Chairman of Community Board 1, which
4 is the one who services Lower Manhattan.

5 Madeline Wills, the Chairperson,
6 couldn't be here tonight so what I'd like to
7 do is provide some comments from the
8 Community Board on the proposed World Trade
9 Center EIS.

10 Some of them will be submitted in
11 testimony because some of them are a little
12 long.

13 The first thing we wanted to talk
14 about is access across the site. We believe
15 it is important to look at how many visitors
16 and shoppers will be attracted by the 600 to
17 one million square feet of retail, the
18 memorial, the 10 million square feet of
19 office space, the newly renovated Fulton
20 Street, the new housing conversion of some of
21 the existing stock, which has really
22 blossomed, and many things that are in
23 process and planned for the area and many of
24 the things around it.

25 The question really is will Fulton

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Street, Vesey Street and Liberty Street be
3 enough to begin with for pedestrian streets
4 to go across or do we need another pedestrian
5 street across the east-west corridor.

6 We also believe we need to look at
7 the impact on Battery Park City, look at the
8 parking, not just for the buses but parking
9 at the site and also to the east.

10 These are critical issues for the
11 World Trade Center site and for all of Lower
12 Manhattan.

13 Another is some alternatives for
14 waste removal and for goods delivery. We'd
15 like you to look into rail and other
16 alternatives in terms of removing and
17 delivering these things.

18 Some of the alternatives other
19 than trucking may work and this, too, will be
20 dramatically impacted because of the same
21 issues of the enormous amount of retail, the
22 traffic, the office and we believe that if
23 there's an alternative just solely to the
24 trucking it would be terrific.

25 We're also asking the announcement

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 today that you consider that the -- be
3 careful on spending the funds for the parking
4 garage because part of that is really
5 dedicated to the site.

6 In addition to that, we have 16
7 comments which I will submit so as not to
8 take you through too much, but it goes
9 they're meaningful, I think they're helpful
10 and they go through everything from security
11 measures to consideration about the Church
12 Street Post Office and go through many things
13 considering mitigating measures in the
14 foreseeable future.

15 Thank you.

16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
17 very much.

18 And you'll file that with the
19 reporter, that statement?

20 MR. RICHARD KENNEDY: Yes, I will.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
22 very much.

23 The next group of speakers in the
24 order in which they'll have the opportunity,
25 Allison Tupper, Colleen Delaney, Michael Cook

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 and Coco Gordon.

3

Allison.

4

MS. ALLISON TUPPER: Hello.

5

I'm Allison Tupper.

6

7 Thank you for the opportunity to
8 speak on the Draft Scope plans to rebuild the
9 Lower Manhattan development area.

10

11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Would you
12 indicate your affiliation, please.

13

14 MS. ALLISON TUPPER: I'm speaking
15 as a private citizen.

16

THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

17

18 MS. ALLISON TUPPER: According to
19 the Draft Scope, almost twice the pre-9/11
20 retail space is planned and comparable office
21 space.

22

23 I applaud the plans for the open
24 space but, of course, the higher the
25 buildings, the darker is all the space at
ground level and it can get pretty dreary
with a minimum of plant life and shadow most
of the summer and all of the winter.

26

27 I urge you to keep the building
28 height as low as possible for the sake of

29

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 ground level space and to minimize the
3 effluent going into the river.

4 I like buildings that relate to
5 the street, that one doesn't have to cross a
6 big plaza to get to.

7 You plan a Generic Environmental
8 Impact Statement. I doubt if that's
9 sufficient given the many different kinds of
10 impact. Certainly any construction near the
11 water needs its own EIS, taking into account
12 the impact on the river, the shipping,
13 fisheries, endangered species, as well as
14 land use.

15 We should all be alarmed at the
16 Coordinated Construction Act Bill that goes
17 along with this plan. It cites building in
18 the rivers for a long list of purposes that
19 belong on the land.

20 We do not need to enlarge the land
21 area. We worked long and hard to clean up
22 and protect the Hudson River and our citizens
23 are enjoying it in boats and along the shore.

24 Several marine species have
25 regained their habitat and population numbers

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 and others are beginning to come back.

3 These water have an impact beyond
4 our shores throughout the city and well into
5 the water, impact on natural life and for
6 shipping.

7 We must protect both the Hudson
8 and the East rivers for marine and plant life
9 and for water-related human use.

10 We do not need platforms,
11 landfill, dredging or building on or in the
12 East River or the Hudson River, and we
13 certainly must not permit any streamlined
14 permission processes.

15 All land use and shore use must be
16 thoroughly scrutinized for its impact on air,
17 water and society.

18 Thank you.

19 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
20 very much.

21 Colleen Delaney.

22 MS. COLLEEN DELANEY: Good
23 evening.

24 Thank you for being here, and the
25 people in the audience, we're all here to

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 talk about the Generic Environmental Impact
3 Statement.

4 THE HEARING OFFICER: Can you --

5 MS. COLLEEN DELANEY: My name is
6 Colleen Delaney. I'm a New York City
7 resident and I live and work in Manhattan.

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Happy to
9 have you here.

10 MS. COLLEEN DELANEY: Thank you,
11 sir, and I thank you for all your fine work
12 at Fordham Law School.

13 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
14 very much.

15 MS. COLLEEN DELANEY: Being a law
16 graduate myself, I had difficulty, first of
17 all, understanding why this is generic as
18 opposed to an Environmental Impact Statement
19 so I spent hours doing research, which I'm
20 sure many of us here who don't have the
21 benefit of Lexis-Nexis might have some
22 difficulty in understanding this process
23 tonight.

24 So I'd like to quickly talk about
25 the process itself to hopefully bring up some

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 questions I have.

3 The National Environmental Policy
4 Act of 1969 is a Federal act, requires an EIS
5 for all, quote, major federal actions
6 significantly affecting the quality of the
7 human environment.

8 Now, in the Federal act it seems
9 as if public participation is crucial in
10 order for it to be, you know, a process the
11 public can trust, and I appreciate the LMDC
12 holding this open hearing because a Generic
13 Environmental Impact Statement process is
14 different than a regular process and it
15 doesn't require this open hearing. So I want
16 to congratulate the LMDC for its transparency
17 and would hope it would continue.

18 It's important that you allow the
19 public to comment not just, you know,
20 three-minute sound bytes but over the process
21 by which this generic statement becomes more
22 detailed, as things evolve.

23 And, you know, it's important to
24 have safeguards in this environmental review
25 process that protects it from parties or

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 people that have conflicts of interest or
3 ulterior motives.

4 And the most distinctive
5 difference between a Generic Environmental
6 Impact Statement and a regular Environmental
7 Impact Statement Draft is that this
8 particular situation requires and almost
9 demands updates along the process as more
10 details become available and I would hope
11 that the public is going to be continually
12 involved in that process.

13 So, you know, some of the
14 questions that I came up with have to do with
15 issues that people have already mentioned
16 about density and proportion of the site,
17 about environmental impact tests.

18 You know, where are these studies
19 and surveys and how are they going to be done
20 and by whom?

21 New York City zoning issues, you
22 know, is The Port Authority going to be
23 subject to the New York City Building and
24 Fire Safety Codes? That certainly impacts
25 the environment.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 I'm almost done.

3 You know, fuel storage, where are
4 the experts in environmental impact studies
5 in the LMDC?6 So in closing, sir, I would just
7 like to say that I want to thank the LMDC for
8 its continual leadership on these issues and
9 I'd like to close with this statement:10 Environmental law is about both
11 protecting the public health and preserving
12 the natural environment. Industrial
13 accidents and other disasters are major
14 threats to the public health and deserve much
15 more attention after 9/11 than they received
16 in the past.17 I ask the LMDC to use its power
18 wisely and err on the side of transparency
19 and public collaboration in how our city gets
20 build.

21 Thank you.

22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
23 very much.24 And if you have a statement that
25 you wish to file with the reporter, we'd be

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 happy to receive that.

3 Michele Cook is it?

4 MR. MICHAEL COOK: Hello.

5 My name is Michael Cook and I'm
6 basically here representing myself as a
7 resident of Downtown. In fact, resident
8 really closest to the World Trade Center,
9 closest to Ground Zero.

10 One of the things that occurs to
11 me is that we've been -- now we're looking at
12 a Generic Environmental Impact Statement but
13 nothing has been done prior to this time in
14 terms of Environmental Impact Statements on
15 the work that's already proceeded and this
16 has been a big problem for everyone who lives
17 anywhere near Ground Zero because it's an
18 environmental nightmare for us.

19 There seems to be no recourse and
20 no one to address our concerns to really in
21 the large picture.

22 The Department of Environmental
23 Protection, the EPA, it's all really being
24 undertaken as part of this process but not
25 really considered under the scope of this.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 And similarly, the idea that the
3 Deutsche Bank may be taken down or
4 redeveloped or somehow considered in this
5 process has a tremendous impact on the people
6 who live nearby, including myself.

7

8 So under the consideration of your
9 geographical scope, it seems imperative that
10 that lot and that process of whatever is done
11 with the Deutsche Bank must be considered in
12 part of the process.

12

13 And I think that a lot of the -- a
14 lot of very good points have been made
15 tonight about the access through the site and
16 what it will -- what impact it will have to
17 allow vehicular traffic through the site,
18 particularly Greenwich Street because it's a
19 narrow street.

19

20 It could be a nice wide promenade
21 or something, it could be a great pedestrian
22 space, but to allow traffic through it north
23 and south I think it's going to be an
24 environmental disaster really.

24

25 And finally, just the concept of
26 having somewhere to store all of the tour

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 buses and hopefully a lot of the commuter
3 buses as well that are coming into this area
4 constantly that have no where to go at this
5 time but are just idling on the streets and
6 that, again, affects us adversely every day,
7 all day long.

8 And when the memorial is built and
9 more tourists arrive, it's going to be
10 imperative to have somewhere underground or
11 somewhere nearby the site that can contain
12 those buses and keep them from idling on
13 streets.

14 Thank you.

15 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
16 very much.

17 I would just say again to the
18 audience that anyone that hasn't had an
19 opportunity to speak today and would like to
20 have some comments tonight, if you register
21 outside you will be on the program to speak
22 tonight.

23 Our next speaker is Coco Gordon.

24 MS. COCO GORDON: I'm Coco Gordon.
25 I've been participating this last year with

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 the Life Cycles Scorecard Green Committee
3 working with the Civic Alliance and I've been
4 advocating an ever rising, new, infinite
5 bottom line that pushes sustainability to the
6 creation of surplus and which would be at the
7 base of all operations that it would do at
8 the World Trade Center site and Lower
9 Manhattan.

10 And this sharing of surplus would
11 create great, real, social, environmental and
12 economical wealth which is a prime objective
13 of permaculture.

14 Today I speak from my concerns
15 personally as a permaculture certified
16 resident of Ground Zero and as an ecological
17 artist working with my group TIKYSK, Things I
18 Know You Should Know, and many other
19 bioregions of the world today.

20 I have a few messages and I'll be
21 sending all the items I will be matching to
22 many of the areas in your scoping document
23 separately. It's not from today's words.

24 One: Vision, underlie all the
25 work that you will do, that you will

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 conceive, design, build, operate, maintain to
3 be the best possible measuring to
4 sustainability guidelines, everything that's
5 done, the bottom, the base.

6 I know it's been very important to
7 you and I thank you for that but I still feel
8 it needs to be at the base of everything,
9 it's our future.

10 All I could see when I was injured
11 9/11 was the flash make New York City a model
12 sustainable city.

13 So one, transform every building,
14 everything built from skyscrapers to sky
15 filters.

16 You will cycle your water, your
17 energy, your local renewable energy, your
18 wastes, eliminate it from going down drains
19 out into the problematic areas that you know.

20 Two: Invent neighborly, friendly
21 composting projects, including source to sink
22 restaurant projects and street calming and
23 street management and social things,
24 something like City Repair does in Portland.
25 They have a wonderful program.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 I've also worked with a lot of the
3 transportation advocates and one of my pets
4 is keep those buses that are parked and
5 idling out of the center and put them in the
6 perimeters in some way and have them feed in.

7

8 And another pet was the one-seat
9 ride from the airports, to the airports and
10 from the airports. We know ways it could be
11 done better.

12

13 Last is just honor our island
14 ecology please.

15

16 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
17 very much, appreciate you being here.

18

19 And if your written statement is
20 in a form that you would like to have it
21 submitted to the reporter, we would ask you
22 to do that but that's up to you.

23

24 MS. COCO GORDON: Can I send this
25 one in?

26

27 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes.

28

29 MS. COCO GORDON: All right.
30 Thank you.
31 THE HEARING OFFICER: There's a
32 fax sheet outside that we provide information

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 on how to get it to the Development
3 Corporation.

4 And I would just say all comments
5 on the Draft Scope must be received by
6 5:00 p.m. on August 4, 2003.

7 Our next speaker, I hope I'm
8 pronouncing you name correctly, Maria Grieco,
9 and I'm sure you'll straighten me out on
10 that, and then Joel Kupferman and then Mark
11 Ameruso.

12 Maria.

13 MS. MARIA GRIECO: Yes, good
14 evening.

15 It's Maria Grieco and I'm a
16 citizen who's been involved with several
17 citizen organizations, with the Imagine New
18 York workshops and with the Listening to the
19 City online discussions.

20 I've also been interviewed and
21 quoted in The Times and been interviewed by
22 New York 1.

23 And I first wanted to start out by
24 saying that I echo the sentiments of three
25 previous speakers I heard.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

The one who referred to the Wedge of Light in Libeskind's design, which we know is not really what it was made out to be in the original presentation, so it kind of amuses me and irritates me to see it being listed even in these designs in the Wedge of Light Plaza and yet it's been shown hey, this is not going to work.

And the other were the two speakers who spoke about the slurry wall and, you know, there are serious problems with leaving the slurry wall exposed or even partially exposed.

This issue should be thoroughly researched and if there's any or the slightest possibility that the slurry wall would fail, then, you know, without a structure there, then the slurry wall must not be left exposed. That to me would seem to be a key environmental impact if something would go wrong there.

But the other thing I wanted to comment on was after hearing recent news reports and after reading The New York Times

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 this week, I do have to ask the question with
3 all this talk about citizen involvement and
4 listening to the people and a lot of us spoke
5 about this in the online discussions, if we
6 were being heard, I now question is Larry
7 Silverstein listening to us, to the people,
8 is he really listening.

9 In fact, I would like to know
10 where he is at any of these open forums
11 because if you read The New York Times this
12 week, you would have read that it seems that
13 he's the one making the decisions.

14 He's put his architect in charge.
15 Even Libeskind's design is getting altered
16 radically, you know, if you go by some of
17 these news reports.

18 And as I said, in that article
19 this week it really raised the question that
20 more than Governor Pataki, more than Mayor
21 Bloomberg, more than anybody else, it seems
22 that Larry Silverstein is making the
23 decisions and I really wonder if he's hearing
24 it.

25 You know, maybe LMDC is hearing

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 us, maybe our elected officials are hearing
3 us, but who is the real decision maker and is
4 that person or those persons, maybe I should
5 say that person, Silverstein, if he's the
6 real decision maker, I didn't think that this
7 is what this was going to be about, I didn't
8 think that this was going to be the road that
9 we're going to travel and that's my question
10 and let's hope we get an answer.

11 Thank you.

12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

13 Joel Kupferman.

14 MR. JOEL KUPFERMAN: Good
15 afternoon.

16 I'm Joel Kupferman. I'm the
17 Executive Director of the New York
18 Environmental Law and Justice Project and
19 Environment Counsel to the Uniformed
20 Firefighters Association, the firefighters
21 union.

22 This appears to me -- I didn't
23 spend much time looking at this document yet
24 but it just seems to me a hard look has not
25 taken place and I urge that you do take a

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 hard look.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

And there are certain concerns that stuck out, and I will comment in detail in a written statement, but under agency actions and approvals you have no mention of the EPA as one of the agencies that should be involved for whatever their help could be worth.

And that's a problem that a lot of these residents and workers Downtown have a problem going into this hearing is that EPA let us down in knowing what was at the site and how people were affected and I think it's very important for you to look at that.

Federal Emergency Management Agency, you just list possible funding approval and possible flood mandates, you leave out fire safety considerations.

We learned some lessons from the World Trade Center demise and yet there's very little detail in your report given to fire safety considerations.

You go on to hazardous materials, you just have two, three sentences here and

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 we should take a much harder look at what you
3 plan to use in future construction.

4 There's been no study of impact of
5 firefighting services in the face of closing
6 fire houses and the decimation of New York
7 City's fire forces.

8 There's no change considered in
9 the building code. We learned from the World
10 Trade Center that it was the dielectric
11 fluids that burned for many, many weeks that
12 caused many, many people to get sick and yet
13 there's been very little consideration given
14 to changing building codes or actually using
15 better materials than was required by law.

16 And then you also just give lip
17 service to air quality. You're just saying
18 that the stationary sources aren't going to
19 cause any problems because of steam. This is
20 not right.

21 And also you're basing your
22 studies or your standards on background
23 levels for the study area, but the problem is
24 is that New York's background levels have
25 been too high.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 EPA, DEC and DEP has let us down
3 by lack of enforcement, letting these levels
4 to be too high for people to breath and yet
5 you're willing to let these background levels
6 be below standards.

7 And also --

8 THE HEARING OFFICER: Your
9 statement is -- you'll be able to submit that
10 statement that you have?

11 MR. JOEL KUPFERMAN: Yes.

12 THE HEARING OFFICER: Okay. I'll
13 call it unless you wanted to just wrap up
14 with a sentence or two.

15 MR. JOEL KUPFERMAN: I just want
16 to wrap up.

17 What I'm basically saying is that
18 we've learned so much from what happened in
19 the last two and a half years and you're just
20 basically reducing it to a paragraph, saying
21 there's not going to be any more impact,
22 okay, and we've suffered too much.

23 As a matter of fact, one fact I
24 learned on the way here when I was going
25 through the security guards here, I told the

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 security guards my role with the fire
3 department and they began to complain that
4 they still had rashes from dealing with the
5 substances that they had to deal with in
6 cleaning up this building and no one is
7 hearing their plight, no one is hearing their
8 story.

9 And so part of the problem that
10 you have here is that you just say you're
11 going to look at the environmental justice,
12 you know, situation. You should look at all
13 the workers that have been hurt.

14 And also when they did the clean
15 up down here, there was no regulations in
16 terms of increased security or enforcement of
17 working laws. So I really want you to look
18 into, you know, the standards that you use
19 for rebuilding this place.

20 Thank you.

21 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
22 very much, appreciate your being here and
23 sharing that point of view.

24 Mark Ameruso.

25 MR. MARK AMERUSO: Hi.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 My name is Mark Ameruso, Tribeca
3 resident. I'm also a member of Community
4 Board 1.

5 And just quickly, I wasn't going
6 to bring it up but what Joel said about
7 environmental hazards, I was a first
8 responder at the site. I worked on the site
9 from the first day through three and a half
10 days and now have asthma because of it. So
11 the EPA was less than forthright about what
12 was going on there and what was in the
13 materials.

14 And with that being said, I'll
15 skip down to another point. I think you
16 should have air monitors north, east, south,
17 west of the site monitoring the air during
18 the entire construction of the project.

19 And you should have a Website and
20 on the Website it could say what you're
21 monitoring for, the type of equipment you're
22 using and the procedures that you're using
23 because as we discovered dealing with the EPA
24 and all these scientists, they're better than
25 lawyers with changing facts or interpreting

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 the same facts differently.

3 So we need specifically the type
4 of equipment and the procedure to know
5 exactly what we're dealing with.

6 Also, I think, I don't know if
7 this is true or not but I think most sulphur
8 fuels for equipment and for vehicles is not a
9 requirement. I think it's on a voluntary
10 basis. That should be made as a requirement.

11 Access through the site is very
12 important. Despite what some of the victims
13 families have said, it's an intangible thing
14 that connects the neighborhood, it's not just
15 something to cut time off our computer. It's
16 much more intangible and psychological to the
17 people that live in the community.

18 Security, funds exist for
19 security. If not, where are they going to
20 come from?

21 And hopefully, if they're not
22 there, we don't want to have quick fixes,
23 closing streets and putting on barriers just
24 because these security procedures are not
25 properly thought out.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 You have a section here on page 15
3 that says neighborhood character. I think
4 you should use neighborhood in the plural and
5 change that phrasing to surrounding
6 neighborhoods because it is all really one
7 community, not just one neighborhood,
8 surrounding neighborhoods.

9 And you talk about historic
10 resources and you have boundaries to keep in
11 context with historic resources. You don't
12 include in these boundaries for study just
13 north of the site, which is Tribeca, which is
14 a historic district, so you should include
15 that in your study boundaries.

16 As well as people have mentioned
17 about buses idling. That needs to be taken
18 care of. They should not be outside. We've
19 discussed at the Community Board having a bus
20 garage underground.

21 Another thing that I don't know if
22 it's been talked about is this is going to be
23 the tallest building in the world apparently
24 and there will be all sorts of radio towers
25 and microwave issues emitting from there.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 If you were ever at the original
3 World Trade Center and walked by there, you
4 were on a cell phone, things got
5 disconnected, your television, your cable
6 system would get shorted out or get ghosts on
7 your TV. So these microwaves and all these
8 other type of things emanating from radio
9 waves need to be considered also.

10 And I'll just sum up really
11 quickly that the site should not be exempt
12 from environmental or New York City Building
13 Codes just because it's a Port Authority
14 site. They need to adhere to these things
15 because we'll just go through the same thing
16 again.

17 We have to learn the lessons from
18 the first time. They built the building
19 without the codes and it fell down in an
20 hour.

21 So thank you for your time.

22 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
23 very much.

24 Diane Dreyfus.

25 Let me ask is there anyone who's

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 registered who hasn't spoken at all today?

3 I mean I think I've worked through
4 all the cards I have. There are several who
5 spoke earlier today that would like to speak
6 tonight and I'm prepared to recognize them at
7 this point unless there's -- I think I've
8 gone through all the cards unless I missed
9 something of those who registered to speak.

10 And if there's anybody who hasn't
11 spoken at all today who would like to do so,
12 I would encourage you to register, but in the
13 meantime I'm going to move to the names of
14 those who spoke earlier today who also
15 registered to speak tonight.

16 Diane Dreyfus.

17 A VOICE: Not here.

18 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

19 Jenna Orkin.

20 MS. JENNA ORKIN: Hi.

21 I'm Jenna Orkin with 9/11
22 Environmental Action, Concerned Stuyvesant
23 Community, those are two organizations.

24 And I'd like to elaborate on what
25 I said before. When we urge the use of

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 environmentally friendly building materials,
3 we are also considering how they might burn
4 if there's a future fire, God forbid another
5 terrorist attack.

6 We also urge that the Draft Scope
7 disclose information about 9/11 recovery
8 funds and alternative uses which might do
9 more for the recovery of Lower Manhattan and
10 the rest of the city.

11 We urge that not only the
12 protection of residents be considered but
13 also worker protection.

14 And I question the use of the term
15 "Generic Environmental Impact Statement." It
16 seems to be a contradiction in terms. How
17 can you talk about the impact of the thing
18 when you do not know what the thing is going
19 to be or what it will entail?

20 Finally, the EIS should disclose
21 all the places where diesel fuel will be
22 stored, the amount of diesel fuel which is
23 likely to be used in construction equipment
24 and buses, assuming either state of the art
25 and/or retrofitted equipment on one hand and

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 old equipment that produces higher emissions
3 on the other hand.

4 It should also take into account
5 alternatives for minimizing harmful diesel
6 emissions and the risks to human health from
7 diesel emissions.

8 So the Environmental Impact
9 Statement should disclose that diesel has
10 40 toxic air contaminants ranging in
11 alphabetical order from acid aldehyde to
12 xylene isomers, that it has toluene, lead,
13 cadmium and mercury which lead to birth
14 defects, benzene which leads to disorders of
15 the blood and blood forming tissues, dioxins
16 which are toxin to the immune and
17 reproductive systems, and that the
18 synergistic effect of these chemicals on
19 hormones may be 1600 times their original
20 effect.

21 It contains formaldehyde which
22 causes asthma, sulphur dioxide which causes
23 permanent pulmonary impairment and the EPA
24 says diesel exhaust is highly likely to be
25 carcinogenic.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2

The South Coast Air Quality

3

Management District says that diesel accounts

4

for 71 percent of total cancer risk

5

associated with air pollution.

6

Finally, among the

7

non-carcinogenic effects of diesel is

8

mortality.

9

Thank you.

10

THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

11

Caroline Martin.

12

MS. CAROLINE MARTIN: Caroline

13

Martin, Family Association of Tribeca East.

14

I wanted to say something

15

different this evening. I was at the

16

afternoon meeting, which was pretty poorly

17

attended and ended early due to lack of

18

speakers, and I was the only resident who

19

spoke this afternoon.

20

This evening we've had 18 new

21

speakers and I think that given the legal

22

requirements under NEPA for public outreach,

23

the Draft EIS should contain a detailed

24

account of the public outreach that has been

25

done to comment on the Draft Generic

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 Environmental Impact Study and it should
3 explain exactly what's been done in outreach
4 comment for the Draft which has obviously
5 been inadequate in scope.

6 Thank you.

7 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you.

8 Alexander Butziger.

9 MR. ALEXANDER BUTZIGER: Good
10 evening.

11 This afternoon I had the honor to
12 speak here and I pointed out why we should
13 consider the restoration alternative and
14 resident the Libeskind plan.

15 Well, let me tell you something
16 that you already know. New York is the
17 greatest place in the world. New York
18 deserves the greatest, the highest and the
19 best of everything, particularly the tallest
20 building in the world.

21 There are a few other things.
22 Skyscrapers represent the greatest and the
23 glory of man. New York is the skyscraper
24 capital of the world. Of all cities, New
25 York has the largest number of skyscrapers.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 It would be wrong for the
3 skyscraper capital, for this greatest city
4 and the most freest and greatest country not
5 to have the tallest skyscraper too.

6 Daniel Libeskind's shards and
7 needle scheme is inadequate in any way, shape
8 and form. The so-called "Freedom Tower" is

9 not the world's tallest building but a pole
10 atop an ordinary 70-story office building.

11 One might as well put an 1800-foot
12 mast atop a one-story adobe house and call it
13 the world's tallest building.

14 Calling this mockery Freedom Tower
15 is a terrible irony. Freedom is a sacred
16 word and it should not come to denote a fake
17 building of false fronts.

18 The only redeeming features of
19 Mr. Libeskind's tower is the restaurant and
20 observation deck above the 110th floor level.
21 They would not have been the massive floors
22 that should go there but they would at least
23 have restored the human presence in the sky,
24 the opportunity for any one of us to return
25 where elevators go no more.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 Thanks to Larry Silverstein's not
3 being comfortable with having people up
4 there, the restaurant and observation deck
5 may be moved down to the 70th floor.

6 Mr. Silverstein did not lease just
7 any 10 million square feet of office space.
8 He leased 110-story twin towers beloved the
9 world over.

10 It is questionable if his lease
11 gives him any legal right, and he certainly
12 doesn't have any moral right, to replace the
13 glory of mankind with a midrise office park.

14 Rebuilding the World Trade Center
15 is not about a skyline element. It is not
16 about a pole on an office building. It is
17 about engineering achievement.

18 When the twin towers were
19 completed, they were the greatest engineering
20 marvel in the history of man. A couple of
21 taller buildings have gone up in the meantime
22 but none of these developments managed to
23 truly trump the twin towers. None of them
24 reached 110 real floors, let alone two times
25 over.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 The new World Trade Center must
3 recapture the spirit of the twin towers. It
4 needs to be the greatest engineering marvel
5 of the 21st century. At the very least, it
6 needs to consist of two towers of 110
7 one-acre plus each.

8

 You say you cannot find any
9 developer willing to build that tall, but
10 have you really been looking for one or do
11 you just take it for granted because
12 Mr. Silverstein is unwilling to rebuild the
13 twins?

14

 And is Mr. Silverstein's
15 unwillingness motivated by business sense or
16 by his not being comfortable with having
17 people up there?

18

 Let's assume the worst case
19 scenario, that not enough private capital can
20 be found to rebuild tall enough.

21

 Why should tax money be available
22 for improving transit infrastructure, for
23 cultural amenities but not for rebuilding the
24 world's greatest landmarks?

25

 THE HEARING OFFICER: Are you just

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 about there? Time has run.

3 MR. ALEXANDER BUTZIGER: Okay, I
4 can hand in --

5 THE HEARING OFFICER: Yes, I want
6 to encourage you to do that unless you did so
7 earlier today.

8 MR. ALEXANDER BUTZIGER: Yes,
9 okay.

10 Thank you.

11 THE HEARING OFFICER: Thank you
12 very much.

13 Jonathan Hakala.

14 MR. JONATHAN HAKALA: I'm Jonathan
15 Hakala, official spokesperson of Team Twin
16 Towers.

17 Earlier this afternoon I testified
18 about Libeskind's environmental nightmare,
19 but this evening I would very much like to
20 focus instead on this process.

21 One of the previous speakers
22 pointed out that most of the chairs in this
23 auditorium are empty and they were just as
24 empty this afternoon, and many of us who are
25 filling the few chairs that are filled were

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 here twice.

3 And I recognize a lot of you from
4 previous hearings and I like you and I think
5 it's great that you're here time and again,
6 that we're all serious stakeholders in this
7 process, but it really calls into question
8 how good a job the Lower Manhattan
9 Development Corporation has done engaging the
10 public in this process.

11 This is the single most important
12 architectural project in the world.

13 Where's the media?

14 Why aren't these seats filled to
15 overflowing?

16 Was that community outreach really
17 every bit as good as it could possibly have
18 been, and if it was, does that beg possibly
19 an even more serious question, that people
20 have given up on the LMDC, that people have
21 given up on this process, that there are --
22 because there are a lot of people out there
23 who talk to us and say gee, gee, John, we
24 know that this Libeskind nightmare is deeply
25 unpopular with the broader public but we also

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 have the sense that one man has decided to
3 impose this on what is essentially an
4 occupied city.

5 And I try to tell these people no,
6 you got to show up, you got to demonstrate to
7 individuals that through the political
8 process that we do care, that we really want
9 to take -- have some real say in our future,
10 but there are a lot of people who clearly
11 remain to be convinced that that's a
12 worthwhile thing to do.

13 They look at the Libeskind plan
14 from last December and they say gee, the
15 70-foot pit that some of the family members
16 really found resonated with them, that's
17 gone.

18 The Garden Tower, the 1776-foot
19 tower that was supposed to have deserts and
20 arctic tundra and everything in between,
21 that's gone.

22 The Wedge of Light, Andrew Winters
23 up there said we knew all along it didn't
24 work. That doesn't exactly inspire a lot of
25 confidence in the process.

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1

2 I described the Park of Heroes
3 earlier today. I can go on and on.

4 We got a big problem here. People
5 all over the world for decades to come are
6 going to judge New York and New York's
7 officials by what we do here.

8 Please tell the powers that be
9 that this is not a sufficient turnout for
10 environmental review process, they need to
11 start over, they need to engage the public
12 and really make sure that these seats are
13 filled to overflowing, that the media is
14 here, that the world's most important
15 architectural project engages the public.

16 I rented space on the 77th floor
17 of One World Trade Center. Mr. Silverstein
18 needs the public to rent those towers, needs
19 workers to want to work in them. You cannot
20 make this successful without engaging the
21 public.

22 Thank you.

23 THE HEARING OFFICER: I would like
24 to add that aside from receiving your oral
25 comments provided at this session and the

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

1
2 earlier session, the Lower Manhattan
3 Development Corporation is also accepting
4 public comments on the Draft Scope by regular
5 mail or through its Website at
6 www.renewnyc.com.

7 Information on how to submit
8 comments is provided on the fax sheet that's
9 available at the registration table outside
10 this theater.

11 All comments on the Draft Scope
12 must be received by 5:00 p.m. on August 4,
13 2003.

14 Not having any other requests for
15 public comment at this session, I declare
16 this meeting closed.

17 I appreciate very much those who
18 came and those who spoke tonight.

19 Good night to all.

20 (Time Noted: 7:55 p.m.)

21

22

23

24

25

ROY ALLEN & ASSOCIATES, INC.

(212) 840-1167

