



LOWER MANHATTAN DEVELOPMENT CORPORATION

**Partial Action Plan No. 3
For
New York City Cultural and Community Development**

Overview

Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC) prepared the following Partial Action Plan with regards to the \$2 billion federal appropriation for the World Trade Center disaster recovery and rebuilding efforts administered by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD). LMDC received additional funding through a \$783 million grant from HUD for damaged properties and businesses (including the restoration of utility infrastructure), as well as economic revitalization related to the terrorist attacks at the World Trade Center (WTC). Partial Action Plan No. 3 originally detailed the proposed expenditure of \$24,047,048 of the \$2.78 billion to fund the activities outlined below. The 2005 amendment to the Partial Action Plan provided an additional \$570,000 for the renovation of the Columbus Park Pavilion and a 2010 amendment reduced the History and Heritage Downtown Marketing Initiative by \$51,381, to \$4,612,619. The total amount allocated for this Partial Action Plan with amendments is \$24,565,667 from the \$2 billion allocation for the following items:

Partial Action Plan Activities	Original Allocation	May 2010 Change	Amended Allocation
Columbus Park Pavilion Renovation	\$428,571		\$428,571
Columbus Park Pavilion Renovation (2005 amendment)	\$570,000		\$570,000
History and Heritage Downtown Marketing Initiative	\$4,664,000	(\$51,381)	\$4,612,619
Planning and Administration	\$18,954,477		\$18,954,477
Total	\$24,617,048		\$24,565,667

Any change greater than 5% in the funding committed to a certain activity, the addition or deletion of any activity, such as the projects detailed in this plan, or change in the designated beneficiaries of an activity constitutes a substantial amendment and such amendment will be available for public review and approval by HUD.

Versions of all LMDC action plans are viewable on the LMDC website at: http://www.renewnyc.com/FundingInitiatives/partialact_plans.asp

Partial Action Plan No. 3 initially proposed the allocation of up to \$24,047,048 of the full \$2.78 billion LMDC allocations for activities relating to the Renovation of the Columbus Park Pavilion, a marketing initiative for History and Heritage in Downtown New York City (Museums of Lower Manhattan), and for planning and administration. These projects were designed to enrich the cultural resources of Lower Manhattan as well as address community development needs, including the Chinatown-area residents' need for public space in the aftermath of September 11th.

The first amendment to Partial Action Plan No. 3 proposed the allocation of additional funds in the amount of \$570,000 for the renovation of the Columbus Park Pavilion, increasing the total allocation up to \$998,571. The total amount allocated for Partial Action Plan No. 3 with amendments thus increased to \$24,617,048. The next amendment to this action plan in May 2010 reduced the History and Heritage Downtown Marketing Initiative by \$51,381, to \$4,612,619. The reduction represented the reallocation of residual (unexpended) program funds to the World Trade Center Memorial and Memorial Museum activity in Partial Action Plan 8. The total amount allocated for Partial Action Plan No. 3 with amendments decreased to \$24,565,667. There have been no other changes and/or modifications to other activities outlined in the approved Partial Action Plan.

Any change greater than 5% in the funding committed to a certain activity, the addition or deletion of any activity, such as the projects detailed in this plan, or change in the designated beneficiaries of an activity constitutes a substantial amendment and such amendment will be available for public review and approval by HUD.

National Objective

The Lower Manhattan Development Corporation is a subsidiary of the New York State Urban Development Corporation d/b/a Empire State Development that was created in December 2001 to oversee the rebuilding and revitalization of Lower Manhattan. The activities contained in this Partial Action Plan have been designed to meet community and development needs resulting from the September 11th World Trade Center disaster. These activities had particular urgency because LMDC has determined that existing conditions pose a serious and immediate threat to the health or welfare of the City of New York and the individual residents of the City and other financial resources are not available to meet such needs. The geographic areas of focus of this and future partial action plans are located in Manhattan, south of Houston Street. The renovation of Columbus Park Pavilion met the national objective of benefiting low and moderate income persons and communities.

Public Comment to the Partial Action Plan

Partial Action Plan 3 allocated funds for two community development projects—History and Heritage Initiative and the Columbus Park Pavilion renovation. The Partial Action Plan was initially made available to the public for public comment from March 17, 2003 to March 31, 2003. HUD approved Partial Action Plan 3 on June 14, 2003. The responses to comments received during the comment period have been incorporated into this Partial Action Plan Submitted to HUD and are reviewed in **Section IV** below.

On September 8, 2005, the LMDC Board of Directors authorized amendments to Partial Action Plan 3 for additional funds for the Columbus Park Pavilion renovation. The amendments to Partial Action Plan 3 were made available to the public for comment from September 27, 2005 through October 26, 2005. Comments were accepted by posted mail and electronic mail. LMDC placed Invitations to Public Comment for Partial Action Plan 3 in English, Spanish, and Chinese daily newspapers and in weekly community newspapers serving Lower Manhattan. In addition, the text of the draft plan was made available on LMDC's website (www.renewnyc.com).

LMDC delivered and mailed copies of Partial Action Plan 3 with the proposed amendments in English, Spanish, and Chinese to more than 90 community, residential, civic and cultural organizations throughout Lower Manhattan, including Community Boards 1, 2, and 3, several tenants' associations and public libraries. In addition, LMDC sent electronic copies in three languages to 15 elected officials, LMDC's Advisory Council members, and over 140 Lower Manhattan civic, community and cultural organizations. LMDC received no comments on the 2005 proposed amendments to Partial Action Plan 3 during the comment period, which ran from September 27, 2005 through October 26, 2005.

In April 2010, the LMDC Board of Directors authorized amendments to Partial Action Plans 1, 3, 8, 9 and 10 in order to reallocate available funds that were no longer needed for completed or about to be completed projects to the World Trade Center Memorial and Cultural program in Partial Action Plan 8. These amendments were made available for public comment from March 23, 2010 to April 21, 2010 following the same distribution process stated above. No comments were received. It should be noted that the amendment to this action plan was a technical amendment not subject to public comment.

Public Participation to Date

Since its inception, LMDC has solicited and received an unprecedented amount of public comment from all over the world regarding the rebuilding of the WTC Site, the creation of a permanent memorial, and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. Several Advisory Councils representing a broad spectrum of groups affected by the WTC attacks – including victims' families, business owners, arts and cultural institutions, and downtown residents – have consulted with LMDC throughout the process on issues of concern to their respective constituencies.

LMDC conducts public meetings that provide an avenue for the public to express their thoughts and concerns about the rebuilding efforts and the revitalization of Lower Manhattan. Public meetings as well as meetings with the Advisory Councils have focused on the redevelopment of the WTC Site, the creation of a permanent memorial, and broader issues such as transportation, cultural and civic issues, and economic development in the aftermath of September 11th.

LMDC conducts additional outreach initiatives, such as mailings to city, state, and federal elected officials and civic and community organizations, participates in Community Board meetings, and meets regularly with community groups, civic organizations, and public officials to ensure that the opinions of those impacted are taken into account. In the summer of 2003, LMDC conducted a series of outreach workshops in the communities of Lower Manhattan. At the workshops, participating members of the community described priorities for their communities and proposed projects to address those priorities.

LMDC has also sponsored several public exhibits that provided visitors with information and the opportunity to submit written comments on the revitalization efforts. LMDC has received nearly 10,000 comments at the exhibits.

On April 13, 2005, the LMDC issued a Draft Funding Allocation Framework, which articulated draft priorities, objectives, and principles with respect to the allocation of the remaining CDBG funds. The LMDC accepted public comment on this draft Framework through May 1, 2005, and held a public forum on the draft Framework on April 27, 2005 in Lower Manhattan. On May 25, 2005, the LMDC released a revised Funding Allocation Framework, which serves as the basis for allocating remaining CDBG funds. The Funding Allocation Framework can be viewed at the LMDC website at www.renewnyc.com in the Funding Initiatives section.

The LMDC website remains available for the public to provide feedback on a variety of topics related to the redevelopment of WTC Site, the revitalization of Lower Manhattan's neighborhoods, and LMDC Partial Action Plans. To date, LMDC has received thousands of comments through its website.

LMDC also gathers public input through its Funding Application Process. The Funding Application Process provides an opportunity for members of the public, through their funding proposals and subsequent meetings with LMDC staff, to articulate their perceptions of, and solutions to, the diverse needs of Lower Manhattan.

I. The Renovation of the Pavilion in Columbus Park

Project description

The City of New York Department of Parks and Recreation (Parks Department) requested \$428,571 for the renovation of Columbus Park's pavilion, a structure erected in 1897. The project included rehabilitation to address the decay of the building's infrastructure. The project expanded on recent renovation efforts by the Parks Department and proposed the creation of new community space in the lower level of the pavilion and the refurbishment of the upper loggia for recreational programming. In addition, the project eliminated barriers and promoted accessibility for people with disabilities.

The Parks Department was awarded a grant of \$1 million from the National Park Service's Urban Park and Recreation Recovery Program (UPARR) contingent upon the receipt of an additional \$428,571 to meet their estimated costs. Preliminary Parks Department cost projections for the project totaled \$1,428,571. The total cost has increased to \$3,504,644.24, due to an expanded scope that ensures historical accuracy and community priorities, in addition to increased construction costs.

Columbus Park is a heavily used neighborhood park bounded by Baxter, Bayard, Mulberry, and Worth Streets. Bayard and Mulberry Streets are characterized by low-rise residential buildings with small-scale ground floor retail. Baxter and Worth Streets are dominated by Chatham Towers, a high-rise middle-income apartment complex, and the large institutional buildings of the City's Civic Center. The park is the main place for outdoor recreation for adults and children in Chinatown. A wide variety of community-based organizations program recreational activity in the park, including volleyball, basketball, Asian table games, and tai chi. The pavilion was fenced off five years ago when decay of the building infrastructure created safety hazards.

Columbus Park predominantly serves low and moderate income households. The area immediately surrounding Columbus Park includes the zip codes 10002 and 10038. Per the U.S. Census Bureau, Census 2000, over 60% of the households in this area earn less than 80% of New York City's median income.

The Parks Department has made a significant commitment to the renovation of Columbus Park. According to UPARR guidelines municipalities may apply annually to receive funds for the improvement of one park per municipality. The Parks Department selected Columbus Park to receive the UPARR grant.

The Columbus Park pavilion project has received support from an extensive list of local civic institutions, including the Asian American Youth Center, Chinatown YMCA, Chinese American Planning Council, Coalition for Asian American Children and Families, Indochina Sino-American Community Center, New York Asian Women's Center, United East Athletic Association, and the American Institute of Architects. Plans for the rehabilitation of the park have received the support of varied elected officials, including: State Assembly Speaker Sheldon Silver, Council Member Alan Gerson, Congressman Jerrold Nadler, State Senator Thomas Duane, and Manhattan Borough President C. Virginia Fields.

Considerations for Funding

Scarcity of Recreation Space

The renovation of the pavilion at Columbus Park was deemed essential to maintain the overall quality of the park:

- The rehabilitation of the pavilion opened a structure that has been closed for five years, free up scarce outdoor space for other activities, and rehabilitate a community eyesore.

- There was a need for public space in Lower Manhattan to replace public space lost in the destruction of the World Trade Center complex.
- Community District 3, where the park is located, has a population of 164,407 as of the 2000 Census. This area had only .73 acres of parkland per 1,000 people compared with the average of 1.7 acres per 1,000 people for Manhattan overall and the minimum ratio of 1.5 acres per 1,000 people prescribed by the Environmental Quality Review.
- The only other Major Parks (defined by City Planning to be parks of 9 acres or more) on the east side of Lower Manhattan are City Hall Park and the East River Park. City Hall Park did not have community recreation space. The East River Park was difficult to access for residents in the Chinatown area.

Community Development Impact

The renovation of Columbus Park played a key role in the revitalization of Chinatown.

- The park serves as an important entrance point to Chinatown linking the civic center with the retail and residential areas.
- The park is located across the street from the main community building, which houses the only museum in Chinatown as well as one of the largest senior centers.
- The park is located one block away from Mott Street, the main restaurant district in Chinatown.
- The Parks Department estimated that the rehabilitation of the pavilion, the restoration of existing facilities for public use, and the establishment of new sheltered and indoor space allowed for an increase in park usage of 36,000 users, better serving the growing population of this neighborhood.

Insufficient funding

The renovation received support from public officials and the UPARR program. However, projected renovation expenses exceeded the funding they can provide. Constraints on the City's budget limited the ability of the Parks Department to otherwise obtain the matching funds required by the UPARR guidelines.

Amendment to the Renovation of the Columbus Park Pavilion

LMDC proposed to allocate up to an additional \$570,000 for the renovation of the Columbus Park Pavilion.

Since the approval of Partial Action Plan 3, the conceptual cost estimate prepared by the City Department of Parks and Recreation increased as a result of (1) additional site investigation, which resulted in higher than expected costs for renovating the Pavilion in a comprehensive manner that reinstates its historic features; and (2) contract bids that were above the original cost estimate.

Federal and other resources

The approved Partial Action Plan allocated \$428,571 for the renovation of the Columbus Park Pavilion. LMDC proposed to allocate up to an additional \$570,000, increasing the total allocation to \$998,571. LMDC funding served as a portion of the total project budget of \$3,504,644.24. The remainder of the project funding was provided by a Federal Urban Park and Recreation Recovery Grant (UPARR), and New York City capital funds allocated by the Manhattan Borough President and the New York City Council.

Total estimated cost

The total estimated cost for this activity as outlined in the amended Partial Action Plan was up \$3,504,644.24. LMDC proposed to allocate up to \$998,571 for this activity.

II. History and Heritage in Downtown NYC

Project Description

History and Heritage in Downtown NYC (HHD) was a joint initiative of museums whose mission is history and heritage and are located in Lower Manhattan including, but not limited to: the Eldridge Street Project, Inc.; Fraunces Tavern Museum; Museum of Chinese in the Americas; Museum of Financial History; Museum of Jewish Heritage- A Living Memorial to the Holocaust; Smithsonian National Museum of the American Indian; New York City Police Museum; South Street Seaport Museum; the Skyscraper Museum; and the Statue of Liberty National Monument and Ellis Island. The project involved a marketing initiative that promoted downtown as a cultural destination. This project was coordinated with a broader marketing initiative for Lower Manhattan.

The objective for this initiative was to revitalize the member institutions and, in turn, the Lower Manhattan area by making the public aware that this neighborhood continues to be a destination with a unique cultural identity – one of rich historic significance with multiple venues where visitors can celebrate and learn about New York’s heritage and history.

This initiative included, but was not limited to, the following components:

1. An advertising campaign that focused on the New York metropolitan area and surrounding suburbs in New Jersey, Connecticut, Long Island, and Westchester County. This campaign attracted the “day trippers,” who are currently more motivated to visit this area because their close proximity allows them to visit by car or train. The HHD initiative reached these constituents through print, transit, and radio advertising.
2. A brochure that highlighted the institutions and that was be distributed throughout New York City and in other tourist venues in the northeast. This brochure provided general operating information and a map of the area noting where the institutions are located.
3. A twice-yearly calendar and bi-monthly event reminder postcards that were sent to the consolidated mailing lists of all institutions. These communications pieces established a new effort for audience development. Return visitors are key to the continued success of the institutions involved. Joint event calendars and reminder postcards notified constituents of the wide offering of programs in the area and motivated visitors to plan frequent trips.
4. A web site that supported both the advertising campaign and the joint communications pieces. A single source for resources and information about the institutions reinforced the advertising campaign message and the joint nature of this initiative and was the most cost-effective way for the public to learn more about the museums. Findings showed that most visitors plan their itineraries prior to arrival and many of these visitors use the Internet to research their travel.
5. A poster that visually underscored the identity and message of this initiative and was be distributed to local restaurants and retail stores as well as being available in each institution’s shop. This poster highlighted the rich diversity of Downtown institutions.

6. A research and evaluation component to assess the impact and value of various parts of the initiative.
7. Finally, the museums developed joint program days. On such days, each of the institutions offered programming that, combined, will provide a full day of activity. By joining together, HHD encouraged visitors to venture Downtown for these unique activities.

B. Funding Requirements and Duration of Project

The institutions launched their nine months campaigns in 2003 which had long range effects that have been sustained into successive years. The original \$4,664,000 allocation for this program was reduced by \$51,381 in May 2010 to \$4,612,619. The reduction represented the reallocation of residual (unexpended) program funds to the World Trade Center Memorial and Memorial Museum activity in Partial Action Plan 8.

This program was eligible for HUD funding to be used to aid the travel and tourism industry in New York City as allowed and required by the Defense Appropriations Act of 2002, Public Law 107-117.

HHD selected a member organization or a third party to administer this initiative.

III. Planning and Administration

LMDC engages in broad planning and administration activities relating to the recovery, remembrance, and rebuilding efforts in Lower Manhattan, defined by the LMDC's bylaws and charter, as the entire area of Manhattan south of Houston Street.

LMDC's planning activities began with the site planning for the WTC Site and the areas immediately surrounding the site. The agency's off-site planning activities include the other neighborhoods in Lower Manhattan that have been affected by September 11th and its aftermath. Specifically, LMDC's off-site planning activities include analyses of Lower Manhattan's transportation, traffic, housing and related amenities, open space, and economic development capacity, needs, and potential. Based on the results of these analyses, LMDC continued to develop and propose concept plans for areas and projects in Lower Manhattan.

LMDC's administrative activities include, and will continue to include, extensive public information and coordination activities relating to its LMDC planning work. As part of its coordination activities, LMDC serves as a facilitator of outreach and discussions between affected communities as well as the public at large and government agencies and officials. LMDC's public information work will continue to include large-scale public meetings and hearings; periodic printed newsletters and reports; an up-to-date, comprehensive, and interactive web site (www.renewnyc.com); extensive electronic communications; and other public outreach and participation efforts. In addition, LMDC continues to maintain its network of community contacts through its advisory councils. Additionally, legal, audit, and investigation activities are performed on an ongoing basis in relation to programs funded by the LMDC CDBG allocation.

HUD has authorized the use of up to 5% of the total CDBG allocation to LMDC for costs associated with planning and administration activities, including costs for overhead, personnel, and consultants. Partial Action Plan 10 proposed the allocation of \$18,954,477 for planning and administration activities.

IV. Responses to Public Comments

An Amended Partial Action Plan 3 was released on September 27, 2005, and public comment was solicited for additional funds for the Columbus Park Pavilion renovation. No comments were received on the proposed amendment during the comment period, which ran from September 27, 2005 through October 26, 2005

The following section details the comments and responses to the initial Partial Action Plan, following its release for public comment from March 17, 2003 through March 31, 2003.

Expressions of Support

1 Commenter expressed support for the Proposed Partial Action Plan

10 commenters expressed support for the History and Heritage initiative. Among these comments, support was expressed for the raising of public awareness of the rich array of museums in lower Manhattan as a means of increasing tourism to the area.

No response needed.

Request for Funding

2 commenters requested allocation of funds for the creation of or renovation of existing museums. Specifically the New York State Conference of N.A.A.C.P. Branches requested funding for the completion of The New York African Burial Ground and Museum. The Asian American Community Consultation Association requested funds to expand the existing Museum of the Chinese in the Americas in Chinatown.

These requests are outside the scope of the current plan. History and Heritage in Downtown NYC is a marketing initiative designed to promote downtown as a cultural destination. Funds allocated for this initiative are principally for expenditures relating to the advertising and promotion of downtown Cultural institutions and are not for capital costs or operating costs.

Renovation of Pavilion in Columbus Park

2 commenters voiced concerns that Columbus Park is in decay and that it be renovated and made available for community purposes.

One of the goals of the LMDC plan is to supplement a grant conditionally awarded to the City of New York Department of Parks and Recreation for the express purpose of renovating Columbus Park's existing pavilion. The Parks Department estimates that the rehabilitation of Columbus Park's pavilion will allow for an increase in current park usage of 36,000 people.

Other Comments

1 commenter voiced the need for a Youth/Community Center in the Chinatown area.

4 Organizations: Labor Community Advocacy Network; Rebuild with a Spotlight on the Poor Coalition; Pratt Institute Center for Community and Environmental Development; and Liberty Bond Housing Coalition expressed concern that the allocation of funds from the Community

Development Block Grant would be better utilized for job creation in New York, establishing affordable housing, and addressing human services needs such as eviction prevention.

LMDC has been considering the allocation of funds for a variety of areas. The importance of creating programs and a formal process by which to allocate these funds - which have been designated to revitalize Lower Manhattan for years to come - is a priority for the LMDC. As these programs are developed, LMDC will involve the public and civic organizations in the process of identifying needs in the various Lower Manhattan neighborhoods.

The rehabilitation of Columbus Park's pavilion and History and Heritage in Downtown NYC are part of an on-going effort to support businesses and cultural institutions as well as improve the quality of life in Lower Manhattan. The rehabilitation of Columbus Park's Pavilion, in addition to creating much needed recreational community space for low and moderate income households in the area, will help Chinatown area businesses by serving as an important entrance point to Chinatown linking the civic center with the retail and residential areas and increasing foot traffic in an area located one block from the main restaurant district in Chinatown.

The objective of History and Heritage in Downtown NYC is to increase tourism and consumer spending, which in turn should lead to the creation of more jobs in Lower Manhattan.

Additionally, two previously approved Partial Action Plans prepared by LMDC allocate \$360 million in funds for programs specifically designed to retain existing jobs, stimulate job growth, and provide employment training for businesses in Lower Manhattan.

1 Organization, Rebuild with a Spotlight on the Poor Coalition, voiced concern on the allocation of funds from the Community Development Block Grant for LMDC Planning and Administration. Specifically they voiced concern on LMDC outreach to various community groups within Lower Manhattan.

LMDC engages in broad planning and administrative activities relating to the recovery, remembrance, and rebuilding efforts in Lower Manhattan. HUD has authorized the use of up to 5% of the total grant to the LMDC for costs associated with these planning and administrative activities. LMDC activities include and will continue to include extensive public information and coordination activities relating to all LMDC planning work.

LMDC is committed to fulfilling its mission through an inclusive, open, and transparent process that takes into account the opinions of those affected by the September 11, 2001 tragedy and the other constituencies that have an interest in the future of Lower Manhattan. The Principles and Revised Blueprint for the Future of Lower Manhattan, an initial draft of which was revised based on public input, states that LMDC's first Principle is to "make decisions based on an inclusive and open public process."

Several Advisory Councils representing a broad spectrum of groups affected by the World Trade Center attacks – including victims' families, business owners, and downtown residents - regularly consult with the LMDC on issues of concern to their respective constituencies. The LMDC also conducts public hearings, participates in Community Board meetings, and meets frequently with community groups, civic organizations, and public officials to ensure that the opinions of those who were affected by the attacks are taken into account.